Subject Matter Expert Review
TAACCCT Grant – Round 2
Findings & Report

Program: Nurse Assistant Training

Program Courses: HLH 130 Nurse Assistant Training

Faculty Developer(s)/Instructional Designer(s): Faculty and Staff of Delaware Technical
Community College

Subject Matter Expert: Nancy Beth Massaro M.Sc., RN

Subject Matter Expert Credentials: See Resume

Date of Review: August 1, 2016

Synopsis of Findings:

The Evaluator for TAACCCT reviewed 16 documents which lay foundation to the Delaware Technical Community College HLH130 Nursing Assistant Program. Through review of the pedagogy of this program, the Evaluator was able to assess and comment upon: Program Course Overview and Objectives; Relevance of Coursework in relationship to Program Graduate Competencies and Core Course Professional Objectives which directly relate to industry and employer standards; Resources and Instructional Materials that track learning objectives and outcomes; and, lastly, Assessment Strategies that help measure learning effectively took place and the ability to track student progress.

The Nursing Assistant Training Course Student Handbook, Nursing Assistant Welcome Letter and HLH130 Syllabus are three core documents which outline grading parameters, policies and procedures necessary to be admitted, dismissed and/or graduate from program DTCC HLH 130. Internal forms used to track progress, and evaluate both students and instructors were provided by DTCC HLH 130 and were individually reviewed. Recommendations are made for each form to consistently meet the criteria set forth by TAACCCT. The Evaluator executed a cross comparison of the three (3) largest documents from DTCC HLH130 Program and provided a chart in which it is easy to note how these three (3) documents complement each other, allow the student to identify academic competency and outline and track progress in the classroom, lab and clinical experience. The Evaluator made simple recommendations when taken into consideration by DTCC will help to enhance consistency of internal assessment and evaluation tools that will track students' progress.

When outside vendors review the materials DTCC has provided for general public review, please be aware that the way the forms are named and saved do not match the title of the form. This can be confusing. However, the Evaluator made every attempt to call the form by its entire name as it appears on the top of the original document and not by the "saved" name. It is **recommended** that the "title of the form" and the" saved name of the document" coincide in the future.

<center>**Review of Documents**</center>

I.   The Delaware Technical Community College HLH130 Nursing Assistant Training Course Student Handbook clearly delineates the requirements which need to be achieved prior to and during the classroom and clinical experience. Policy and procedures for entering the program and then successfully completing the program are succinctly outlined. The potential student candidate has a clear vision of expectations and is versed on legal standards to become admitted into the program, code of conduct and professional role one must take in order to achieve completion of the course and then how to qualify for certification.

Three recommendations to consider adding to **The Delaware Technical Community College HLH130 Nursing Assistant Training Course Student Handbook** are:

1. verbiage about the necessary steps the potential student candidate would need to take to apply for the State Certified Nursing Assistant examination,

2. language about the procedure in which to continue certification requirements once certification is accomplished (i.e.: how many hours one must continue to work in order to stay compliant and keep certification and how and where one can access materials in order for completion of Continuing Education Units in a timely manner and as per State regulations), and

3. Information that certification allows for reciprocity in Maryland affording the student expanded career opportunities in nearby vicinities and other healthcare agencies.

II.   Nursing Assistant Welcome Letter: Compliments the DTCC HLH130 Nursing Assistant Course Student Handbook as it serves to add a humanistic touch to welcoming students to the program while delicately reinforcing policy and procedures.
Recommendation for change to the Nursing Assistant Welcome Letter: Add the workbook required to match the materials needed in the Student Handbook.

III.   DTCC HLH 130 Course Syllabus:
Concisely directs students to other documents to find specific policies and information needed to be academically successful.
Recommendations to add or change the DTCC HLH 130 Course Syllabus:
1. **Prerequisites Section**: consider adding CPR with AED and/or First Aid training and language which suggests this can be a prerequisite or obtained via another vendor source.
2. **Course Description Section**- add verbiage educating the candidate that successfully completion of the HLH 130 program allows for broadened employment opportunities in both Delaware and Maryland. If DTCC HLH130 is required before entering into core course curriculum for a nursing degree, please add language to the document stating such criteria.
3. **Addition materials:** Add timepiece, uniform, stethoscope, CPR to match the Nursing Assistant Handbook which comprehensively outlines materials needed in class, lab and clinical.
4. **Method of Instruction:** language needs to be added to this section to adequately and accurately describe the methods of

teaching used throughout the coursework such as: didactic lecture, video, lab, clinical practice and independent reading, homework, game playing, group work and presentations.

5. **Measurable Performance Objectives- Section 3.3.2**: Suggestion- not a recommendation- add diseases and disorders commonly associated with the aging process to better evaluate whether or not learning took place about those medical issues commonly associated with residents living in nursing homes.

6. **Measurable Performance Objectives Overall Recommendation:**

A. Missing the opportunity to highlight how the student develops competency in basic direct skills which enhance ADL's and rehabilitation.
B. Language should be added about how the HLH 130 program adheres to but does not limit the dissemination of information and training of skills as outlined in State and Federal regulations and standard practices within local nursing home facilities.

7. **Evaluation Criteria and Process:** It is strongly recommended that the DTCC HLH 130 Program committee review and make changes to this document as well as others that outline similar criteria when is come to evaluation and process when a student fails and wishes to reenter the program by:

A. Identifying how many tests/quizzes are offered and which evaluation tools are used to evaluate curriculum objectives learned.
B. Updating Pass/Fail Criteria- criteria needs to be identified within this document and throughout supporting materials that assess and track progress.
C. Outlining Retesting Criteria- how often can one retake a test? And what materials are used to retest? (I.e.: is the same test as the first offered or another method or format of the test used?)
D. Offering information about Failing and/or Readmission to the program- Language needs to be clear as to how the student can apply and reenter the program should s/he fail the first time or multiple times thereafter.

IV.   Systems Assignment HLH130:
"The System Assignment" suggests that students are researching and then presenting a body system assigned to them by their instructor and then offering outlined information to peers via small group presentations. Nowhere in the documentations called Nursing Assistant Welcome Letter, in the HLH 130 Nursing Assistant Syllabus and/or the Nursing Assistant Training Course Student Handbook does it elude to students' responsibilities that small group work will occur and each student is responsible for a group presentation. This teaching method needs to be clearly stated in each of those documents noted.

Recommendations to the System Assignment HLH130:

1. Develop two Evaluation tools to track learning took place: one for the student research team and, the second for the students receiving the information.

2. Design a Grading Rubric to identify whether the group (or each individual in the group) passed or failed this assignment.

3. The group presenting should be encouraged to submit a note taking guide for peers to follow along and gain fuller understanding about the topic being taught.

4. Identify which multi-media forms of technology are required for this presentation to be successful and meet criteria.

5. If a prerequisite computer course is required for this assignment, make note in the Syllabus as well as Student Handbook so students can accomplish this part of the curriculum successfully.

Overall, the Evaluator feels this method of learning via presenting in small groups is a great way for students to actively partake in the learning process.

V.   First Day Assignment: is used in conjunction with the Student Handbook to evaluate whether or not the document was read and understood.

Recommendation for First Day Assignment form: title the page to match how the document is saved.

VI., VII. And VIII.   Cross Comparison of the Three (3) major documents: Nursing Assistant Training Course- Table 1 Lab Activities, Skills Practice Scenarios and Nurse Assistant Training- Lab/Clinical Skills Checklist.

Please note that recommendations are made throughout the comparison of these three documents and in the form of a chart. Recommendations are noted within the column where it deemed most appropriate and pertinent.

Skills Noted	Document Reviewed: Nursing Assistant Training Course – Table 1 Lab Activities	Document Reviewed: Skills Practice Scenarios	Document Reviewed: Nurse Assistant Training- LAB/CLINICAL SKILLS CHECKLIST
Overall Comparison of Three Internal Evaluation Forms Created and Used by DTCC HLH 130 Program and Recommendations for each form.	**Two recommendations are noted:** 1. Add directions as to who and how this form should be used. 2. Bedside cabinet- stock with items that are required by Prometric (State of DE Contracted provider) in order to allow the student to become accustomed to the items necessary when testing.	This beautifully written tool comprehensively tracks most skills that the nursing assistant will see in a real world setting and those skills that need to be implemented with residents in a long term setting. The tool proves to be a great way for the student to gain practice before heading into the clinical setting while the instructor assesses students' baseline knowledge, problem solving skills and sequencing for time management of task. **Recommendations:** 1. Directions are needed as to who and how this form will be used. 2. The Nursing Assistant Training Course – Table 1 Lab Activities form alludes to using this document to continue practice in the lab. Please cross reference the title of this form into the Nursing Assistant Training Course – Table 1 Lab Activities document to reflect where and how the student should find these scenarios. 3. Create a method to evaluate student progress which notes scoring methods. 4. Identify how the student will relearn or modify thinking if misperception of scenario proves to implement unsafe handling and/or care offered to a resident? 5. Delineate whether this format of practice and evaluation is a peer to peer review or assessed by an instructor.	Very comprehensive tracking tool used to identify progress in clinical. The Evaluator had to assume the form follows students into the clinical setting once competency is achieved in the lab. **Recommendations:** 1. Directions needed as to how to properly use this tracking tool. 2. Identify what the "asterisk mark" means. The Evaluator made the assumption the asterisk means only those things that are not mandated by the State Dept of LTC. 3. Note in directions why some areas are blackened. 4. Finishing Up chart located on the first page of this document- add handwashing prior to leaving room and when entering another room. 5. Post Mortem Care – referred to as 26.1. Not clear as to what this denotes. Make necessary adjustments.
Transfer to WC	X	X	Not assessed on this form.
Positioning	X	XX	X
Ambulate w Gait Belt	X	XX	Just ambulation noted. Perhaps encourage gait belt use in checklist.
Ambulate with Walker	Not addressed in Lab. No walker noted in supplies.	Never practiced in scenario. Perhaps change one scenario that depicts Ambulate w Gait	See note above. Perhaps consider adding: Ambulate with cane, and up/down

		(noted twice) to this skill.	stairs.
Handwashing	X	Appropriately assessed for both resident and for Nurse Assistant.	Both using water and an alcohol based product are addressed.
PPE	X	X	Effectively noted under Infection Control and Isolation Procedures.
Stretchers	X	X	Recommended to add to the Transfer section.
Slides	X	X	Identified in Transfer section.
Restraints	X	Usage not assessed in scenarios.	No mention on form.
Hot and Cold App	Not addressed in Lab. No supplies noted.	X	No mention on form.
TEDS app	Not addressed in Main Lab Activity column of form. Supplies are noted in appropriate column.	X	No mention on form.
Dressing	Not addressed in lab. Nor are supplies noted.	XX	No mention on form.
VS	X	X	X
Pulse Ox	X	Never assessed in scenarios.	Not noted as a skill to check. Perhaps add for consistency to VS section.
Height	X	X	X
Weight	X	X	X
Bathing (comp/part)	X/X	Scenario 3 states the student will help with face, neck and hands. Scenario 8 notes that student gains practice with partial bathing. Recommended that Scenario 3 allows the student experience to perform a partial or full bath.	X
Perineal Care	Missing as a lab skill.	Scenario 5 states the resident can do her own perineal care. Recommended that the student gains experience by offering this care in this scenario.	Need reminder for front to back cleansing on this form in Bed Bath Section.
Backrubs	Missing as a lab skill unless incorporated into bathing demo and return demo. Perhaps denote more clearly.	X (Reviewed in Scenario 8)	Offer reminder to assess in the sections titled: Bath/Shower and Bed bath.
Nail Care	X	X	X
Foot Care	X	X	X
Oral Care – Dentures, too	X/X	XX	XX
Shaving	Missing in lab with supplies needed.	Missing as a scenario practice.	Adequately noted on this form.
Feeding	X	XXX	See note for I and O
Cath Care	X	X	X
I and O	Supplies noted but in Main Lab column. Add I and O into column titled Main Lab Activity.	Catheter care noted. Perhaps add for feeding and bedpan use.	Need to add line to assess in the following sections: Bedpans and Urinals, Feeding, Ostomy Care
Bedpans/Urinals	X/X	X/X	See note for I and O.
Bedmaking- occupied and unoccupied	X/X	X/X	X/X
Lifts	X	No practice allocated.	X
Cane and Stairs	Neither skill is noted that it is taught. Supplies need to be included in appropriate column.	No practice allocated for student to become proficient or assessed in these two skills.	Not noted on checklist.
ROM- upper and lower	Neither skill is noted that it is	Scenario 2 allows for practice	Area for instructor to assess

extremities	taught. Supplies need to be included in appropriate column.	with ROM to upper extremities while Scenario 3 allows for practice of ROM to lower extremities.	whether or not this was done adequately. However, adding another line which clearly denotes upper and then lower ROM would allow for more accurate assessment.
Eyeglasses and Hearing aid care	Neither skill is noted that is is taught. Supplies need to be included in appropriate column,	No practice allocated for student to become proficient or assessed in these two skills.	XX
Ostomy Care	Skill not noted along with supplies needed to execute skill set.	X	See note for I and 0

IX. **Abbreviation and Meaning Assignment**: Evaluator assumed this is an evaluation tool to assess whether or not the student was able to learn and memorize basic abbreviations most commonly seen in charts and used when documenting as part of the Nursing Assistant daily roles and responsibilities.

Recommendations for this quiz and others that the Evaluator may not have reviewed:
1. Directions needed as to how this form is used, when it is used and which learning module it complements.
2. Add information that identifies how to grade this assessment and what a passing score is.
2. Test small chunks of similar information. Evaluations that only use matching may not lend themselves to true understanding. Students can use strategies of elimination to uncover the correct answer. Perhaps add scenarios and/or other methods of evaluation such as true/false, fill in the blanks, and/or deciphering a "patient order" utilizing common abbreviations.

X. Nursing Assistant Training Course - Vital Signs Worksheet: Really comprehensive practice tool that allows students to gain confidence in taking vitals on 10 different persons while allowing for independent thinking and analysis to occur.

Recommendations for Nursing Assistant Training Course- Vital Sign Worksheet-
1. Add verbiage as to whether or not this is a tracking tool or graded as an assignment.
2. Verbiage needed to denote whether or not this skill is practiced on live persons or Sims models.

XI. Nursing Assistant Training Course Chapter Review Exercise- Concise tool used to track that student who missed one lecture. Offers chance to make up work and keep abreast of what was missed in live lecture.

Recommendation for Nursing Assistant Course Chapter Review Exercise: add language in the directions section that reinforces this form can only be used once since the DTCC Syllabus outlines students cannot miss more than one lecture.

XII. Nursing Assistant Training Course Chart Review Exercise: geared toward a nursing student and not a nursing assistant.

Recommendations for the Nursing Assistant Training Course Chart Review Exercise form:

1. Directions as to how the form is to be used and whether or not it is evaluative in nature.

2. Add area where students can explain or track progress in those skills they learned in class, practiced lab and were able to

implement in the clinical setting.

XIII. Daily Evaluation of Nursing Assistant- Clinical Experience: Evaluator had a difficult time deciphering when and how this form might be implemented.

Recommendations for the Daily Evaluation of Nursing Assistant- Clinical Experience Form:
1. Directions need to be added as to the intent of and use of this form.
2. Add clear directions as to who would use this form: the student or the clinical instructor. Directions would clearly guide either party in the correct use of the form.
3. Add additional boxes since DTCC HLH130 program clearly states there are more than 4 times lab or clinical occurs.
4. In the Self Evaluation of Strengths and Areas for Growth section of this form please identify who would check to see if growth occurred, add what standards to measure growth are used, and explain what occurs when a student does not meet criteria or mature in his/her role as a nursing assistant. It is strongly recommended that clear indicators to determine whether or not goals were met and/or exceeded be added.

XIV. Jeopardy Game: Evaluator is left to assume that perhaps this is another teaching tool to help create an atmosphere within the class that helps to insure teamwork and camaraderie is achieved by working together to gain points and win the game while

reviewing key information necessary to pass a body systems test. Or, perhaps it is used as an independent activity to review for a more in-depth assessment or quiz.

Recommendations for Jeopardy Game:
1. Include this teaching strategy into the various Student Handbooks, Welcome Letter and other documents that require DTCC to note variety of methods incorporated to help the learning process be heightened.
2. Add directions and possible ways as to how the game can be used to enhance the learning process on the opening Power Point slide along with directions as to how teams will be chosen.

XV.   Nurse Assistant Training- Instructor Evaluation: A very thorough and comprehensive form identifying strengths and/or weaknesses an instructor may have as identified by individual students the instructor mentors.

Recommendations for the Nurse Assistant Training- Instructor Evaluation:

1. Add directions as to who uses this form and when it should be completed.

2. Follow up- add language that explains what occurs to an instructor when a negative evaluation is received or consistently submitted from multiple students.

3. Comment section should guide the student in making suggestions which the instructor can incorporate in order to make the necessary professional changes in order to improve.

XVI.   Certification of Completion (from DTCC NA Program HLH130)- Meets DE State Criteria that a certificate be issued once successful completion of coursework is finished.
Recommended to add: code associated with DTCC HLH130 that is issued from the State Dept of LTC.

<div align="center">

Conclusion:
</div>

Upon review of the DTCC HLH 130 Nursing Assistant Program, it is the opinion of the Evaluator that this Program meets standards to offer and sustain a viable Certified Nursing Assistant Program which adequately prepares the student candidate through classroom, laboratory and clinical practice and uses a variety of teaching methods in order to ready the student to sit both the written and practical test for the State of Delaware, pass and earn certification.

A common theme resonates throughout the review of most of the documents and finds weakness in some evaluative tools that allow for measureable tracking of curriculum learned in the classroom as well as some minor weaknesses in those tools used in lab and clinical.

- For instance, a form that evaluates the student using the same criteria as that evaluation tool used for the instructor should be developed and should include areas of skills development, learning of materials and clinical competency.

- In addition, an evaluation tool for students to evaluate the DTCC HLH 130 Program needs to be developed and include assessment about strengths, weaknesses and where and how changes can be made based on their overview of the program once the course is completed.

- Other recommendations are made throughout the "Synopsis of Findings" narrative above and clearly identify components which could be added to enhance forms already developed or add information to help strengthen content and make them more user-friendly.

One future recommendation is consider developing and providing printed materials and forms in Spanish for any ESL student who enrolls in the DTCC HLH 130 Program. This would afford the Latino/Hispanic community an opportunity to engage in a high caliper learning experience and afford this group a competitive opportunity to enter the work force as an entry level healthcare provider rather than enrolling in other schools/agencies in the nearby vicinity.

The DTCC HLH 130 Program effectively provides the groundwork necessary for learning the role and responsibility of a nursing assistant. DTCC HLH 130 Program provides a rigorous, thorough and comprehensive curriculum incorporating hands on learning in both the lab and clinical setting that mimics real world experiences.

1. PROGRAM AND COURSE OVERVIEW AND OBJECTIVES	The overall design and purpose of the program and each course is made clear to the student. Core Course Performance Objectives (CCPO's) build upon knowledge and

Specific Review Standard	Accomplished	Satisfactory	Not satisfactory
skills through the sequence of the program and align to the Program Graduate Competencies (PGC's).			
1.1 The program graduate competencies are clearly stated.	X	X	
1.2 The goals and purpose of each course are clearly stated.	X	X	
1.3 Prerequisites and/or any required competencies are clearly stated.	X	X	
1.4 Learning objectives for each course describe outcomes that are measurable.		X	
1.5 Learning objectives are appropriately designed for the level of each of the courses.	X	X	
1.6 Instruction, activities, and assignments in courses scaffold from course to course, and throughout the program.		X	

Comments:

1.4: While learning objectives are outlined in the document titled: HLH 130 Syllabus and Pass/Fail criteria and grading criteria is noted, a **strong recommendation** is made to clearly identify what Pass/Fail means and add this to the documents that are used internally to track skill performance. For instance, if a student meets less than 7 of the 10 criteria on a skill performance sheet- s/he would fail. Or, if the student did not accurately or safely provide care in the lab during execution of the scenarios, then a failing grade would be administered. Nowhere on any of the tracking forms is it clearly noted what Pass and what Fail means. Criteria as to how to move a student into remediation should both classroom and lab performance be substandard is not noted. Therefore, it is **strongly recommended** that changes be made to any supporting documents offered prior to admission as well as to those documents used internally for assessment purposes by adding clearly written guidelines and instructions so those persons facilitating the assessment process and students alike are aware of expectations of learning and progress.

1.6: Activities such as lab activities and scenarios embraced scaffolding efficiently. However, since a timeframe for classroom instruction of text and workbook materials was not offered, it was difficult to assess when certain modules/theory were offered versus when the demonstration of skill and then hands-on practice occurred. It is **recommended** that a timeline of readings, lecture content, homework and skill set be offered for students and staff to understand fully how the coursework will begin, build upon previous lessons and finish in a timely fashion.

2. RELEVANCY	Program Graduate Competencies (PGC's) and Core Course Performance Objectives (CCPO's) are relevant to students, industry, and employers.

Specific Review Standard	Accomplished	Satisfactory	Not satisfactory
2.1 Program Graduate Competencies (PGC's) represent industry's expectation of the overarching knowledge, skills, and abilities an associate-degree level student should have.	X	X	
2.2 Program competencies (PGC's) and core course competencies (CCPO's) are relevant to **industry and employers.**	X	X	
2.3 Instruction, activities, and assignments in individual courses are relevant and engaging to **students**.	X	X	

Comments:
It is the Evaluator's opinion that the DTCC HLH 130 Program effectively provides the groundwork necessary for learning the role and responsibility of a nursing assistant. DTCC HLH 130 Program provides a rigorous, thorough and comprehensive curriculum incorporating hands on learning in both the lab and clinical setting that mimics real world experiences.

3. RESOURCES AND MATERIALS	Instructional materials being delivered achieve stated course objectives and learning outcomes *(note: not all program/course materials are deliverable under CC BY licensing)*.

Specific Review Standard	Accomplished	Satisfactory	Not satisfactory
3.1 The instructional materials contribute to the achievement of the stated course learning objectives.	X	X	
3.2 The purpose of instructional materials is clearly explained.		X	
3.3 The instructional materials present a variety of perspectives and approaches on the course content.	X	X	
3.4 The instructional materials are appropriately designed for the level of the course.	X	X	

Comments:

Please refer to the comments in the Overall Findings section as the Evaluator has done an extensive review of each instructional material DTCC offered. Comments and recommendations were previously made which can help enhance instructional materials for tracking purposes of academic success.

4. ASSESSMENT AND MEASUREMENT	Assessment strategies use established ways to measure effective learning, evaluate student progress by reference to

Specific Review Standard	Accomplished	Satisfactory	Not satisfactory
stated learning objectives, and are designed to be integral to the learning process.			
4.1 The course evaluation criteria/course grading policy is stated clearly on each syllabus.	X	X	
4.2 Course-level assessments (those that can be delivered) measure the stated learning objectives and are consistent with course activities and resources.	X	X	
4.3 Specific and descriptive criteria are provided for the evaluation of students' work and participation and are tied to the course grading policy.		X	
4.4 The assessment instruments (that can be delivered) are sequenced, varied, and appropriate to the content being assessed.	X	X	

Comments:

No written tests were offered the Evaluator to review making assessment of evaluation tools used to figure out whether lecture content was learned effectively very difficult.

4.3: A variety of lab checklists and tracking forms were reviewed by the Evaluator. Please refer to the Overall Finding Section where cross comparisons were made by the Evaluator and recommendations made in reference to 4.3.

4.4: Please refer to the Program and Course Overview and Objectives section to review recommendations made in reference to 4.4.

Overall, a variety of resources have been developed and are utilized to create a diverse learning experience through the DTCC HLH 130 program including but not limited to didactic lecture, video, readings, independent and group research and presenting, practice in the lab, scenario practice and clinical experience.