McREL
INTERNATIONAL

Making A Difference

Nunez Community College's Trade Adjustment Assistance Community College and Career Training (TAACCCT) Final Evaluation Report

September 30, 2016

Kevin Knoster, M.A.
Karen Bumgardner, PMP, M.A.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Appendices

LIST OF TABLES

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The U.S. Department of Labor (DOL) awarded the Elaine P. Nunez Community College (hereafter referred to as Nunez) a $2.8 million Round 2 Trade Adjustment Assistance Community College and Career Training (TAACCCT) grant in September 2012. The aim of this grant was to provide targeted training and workforce development to assist economically dislocated workers in the aftermath of Hurricane Katrina in August 2005 and the Deepwater Horizon oil spill of April 2010. The grant would also support partnerships between Nunez and local employers to develop programs providing pathways to high-wage, high-skill jobs aligned with industry needs (DOL, 2011).

The Nunez TAACCCT project permitted the college to restructure their business administration program by implementing new courses for the general business administration program, as well as by creating an Associate of Applied Science (A.A.S.) for Small Business Entrepreneurship (ENTR) and Hotel, Restaurant, and Tourism Administration (HRT) programs to meet employment needs in Louisiana. Additionally, the grant funded the development of an Entrepreneurship Center, which served as a resource for both students enrolled at Nunez and small business owners within the surrounding community. Grant funds were also used to establish the Pelican Bay Café, which serves as an on-campus eatery and learning laboratory for students enrolled in the culinary, business and hospitality administration programs. The multi-level goal of the Nunez TAACCCT grant was to redesign an existing A.A.S. for Business Administration and develop two new A.A.S. degrees under Business Administration - one emphasizing Entrepreneurship/Small Business Management and the other with an emphasis on Hotel, Restaurant and Tourism. Evaluation questions, as shown below, were developed by examining the DOL grant solicitation, the Nunez TAACCCT technical proposal, and the DOL evaluation requirements.

Implementation Evaluation Questions
F1. How was the particular curriculum selected, used, or created?
F2. How were programs and program design improved or expanded using grant funds?
F3. What program delivery methods were offered?
F4. What was the program administrative structure?
F5. What support services and other services were offered?
F6. Did the grantee conduct an in-depth assessment of participants' abilities, skills, and interests to select participants into the grant program?
F7. What assessment tools and processes were used?
F8. Who conducted the assessment?
F9. Were the assessment results useful in determining the appropriate program and course sequence for participants?
F10. Was career guidance provided and, if so, through what methods?
F11. What contributions did each of the partners make in terms of (1) program design; (2) curriculum development; (3) recruitment; (4) training; (5) placement; (6) program management; (7) leveraging of resources; and commitment to program sustainability?
F12. What factors contributed to partners' involvement or lack of involvement in the program?
F13. What contributions from partners were most critical to the success of the grant program?
F14. What contributions from partners had less impact?

Outcome Evaluation Questions
S1. Total unique participants served
S2. Total number of participants completing a TAACCCT-funded program of study
S3. Total number of participants still retained in their program of study or other TAACCCT-funded program
S4. Total number of participants completing credit hours
S5. Total number of participants earning credentials
S6. Total number of participants enrolled in further education after TAACCCT-funded program of study completion
S7. Total number of participants employed after TAACCCT-funded program of study completion
S8. Total number of participants retained in employment after program of study completion
S9. Total number of participants employed at enrollment who received a wage increase post-enrollment

Note: F=formative, S=Summative

Evaluators employed a mixed-method design to gather qualitative and quantitative data from multiple sources. Six data collection methods were utilized by McREL evaluators to understand and assess both program implementation and program outcomes. Specifically, these data sources included student entrance and exit surveys, a partner survey, student interviews, staff interviews, and extant data (i.e., student education records). All data collection tools were developed in collaboration with Nunez project staff.

Data collection activities were utilized both formatively (i.e., to fine-tune project activities in real time) and summatively (i.e., to determine project outcomes after-the-fact). Analyses of quantitative data involved the calculation of descriptive statistics such as frequencies, percentages, and measures of central tendency and dispersion (e.g., means and standard deviations). Qualitative data were analyzed by question and by theme. Data were segmented into passages through coding. Themes were then identified and summarized by salient and prevalent issues to provide contextual and process detail only (i.e., quantitative data was omitted). Additionally, other extant data were collected from project staff to aid in providing contextual information on student outcomes.

Key Implementation Evaluation Findings

- The programs of study encompassed in the Nunez TAACCCT project were selected and developed to support and revitalize the local economy of St. Bernard Parish in the aftermath of Hurricane Katrina in 2005 and the Deepwater Horizon oil spill in 2010. Curriculum was created utilizing input provided by local community and industry partners, such as the Louisiana Restaurant Association, the Louisiana Hotel and Lodging Association, the greater New Orleans Small Business Development Center, and Gulf Coast Bank and Trust. **(F1)**
- An on-campus Entrepreneurship Center was developed and staffed to support students enrolled in TAACCCT-funded programs of study, as well as members of the local community. An on-campus, student-operated café (the Pelican Café) was also constructed using grant funds and served as an experiential opportunity for students in TAACCCT-funded programs. **(F2)**

- Despite the Nunez TAACCCT project's goal to offer all courses in the Department of Business Administration online, the program utilized a predominantly traditional delivery method wherein the majority of instruction took place on-campus and in-person. **(F3)**
- The Nunez TAACCCT application stated that the grant was to be overseen by the Chair of the Department of Business Administration, and a Director was to be hired through the grant to oversee the Entrepreneurship Center. The Director was to have been supported by two additional support staff hired under grant funds; however, this programmatic administrative structure did not come to fruition. **(F4)**
- Program staff and participants demonstrated pervasive and consistent confusion regarding the organizational hierarchy or structure of the Nunez TAACCCT project, communicating a lack of clarity and frustration with the project's administrative structure. For the most part, staff and students exhibited an inability to confidently and/or accurately identify the responsibilities of specific grant positions, nor identify the individuals staffed in those positions. **(F4)**
- Informal advising, workshops, tutoring, presentations, and general materials and resources were provided to grant participants through the Entrepreneurship Center. No formal counseling or career guidance was provided specific to the Nunez TAACCCT grant; however, Nunez did offer counseling and guidance to students. **(F5 & F10)**
- An assessment tool (COMPASS® placement test) was used upon enrollment at Nunez Community College, regardless of major, to determine course placement. The Wonderlic Entrepreneurial Quotient assessment was also employed for students in the Business Administration and Entrepreneurial programs. (**F6 & F7)**
- As part of the admissions process, students take *The Placement Test* that assist staff in evaluating and placing students in the appropriate courses. Data indicate that the assessments were useful in ensuring alignment between students' abilities, skills, and interests and their programs of study. **(F8 & F9)**
- Nunez project staff believed that TAACCCT project partners provided invaluable supports to program design and curriculum development through serving on advisory boards, though high turnover amongst project personnel during the first two years of the project presented an early barrier to partners' participation. Partners also supported the Nunez TAACCCT project through leveraging resources and served as advocates for the Nunez TAACCCT project throughout the state of Louisiana, actively engaging in recruitment of participants and additional partners. **(F11 & F12)**
- Project staff believed the most critical support that partners provided (and can continue to provide) was hiring program graduates, expressing confidence that, in doing so, partners will play an integral role in supporting the Nunez TAACCCT project long after the expiration of DOL funds. **(F11, F12, F13, & F14)**

Key Outcome Evaluation Findings[1]

- A total of 72 unique participants were served in some capacity by the Nunez TAACCCT project. **(S1)**
- A total of 52 participants completed a program of study falling beneath the umbrella of the Nunez TAACCCT project. **(S2)**
- Four total participants are currently retained in their program of study or in an alternative TAACCCT-funded program of study. **(S3)**
- Seven total participants completed all credit hours attempted. **(S4)**
- A total of 56 participants earned one or more credential(s) during their enrollment in TAACCCT-funded program courses. **(S5)**
- Seven total participants enrolled in further education after completing their TAACCCT-funded program(s) of study. **(S6)**
- A total of 19 participants were employed following their participation in the Nunez TAACCCT project. **(S7)**
- Sufficient data were not available to determine the total number of participants retained in employment following the completion of their TAACCCT-funded programs of study or the total number of participants employed at enrollment who received a wage increase post-enrollment. **(S8 & S9)**

Conclusions

- Findings suggest that Nunez Community College's industry partners have provided valuable supports across the span of the grant through their recurring participation in advisory boards and leveraging of resources and expertise. Strong relationships with local industry partners served as a means to readily solicit support from partners.
- The Nunez TAACCCT project resulted in the implementation of a student-operated café on Nunez campus – fulfilling a need communicated by students and staff alike. In doing so, the Nunez TAACCCT project was made immediately relevant to students attending Nunez Community College, regardless of whether or not they were specifically enrolled in TAACCCT-affiliated programs of study. The student-operated café was also a model of a unique approach to ensuring program sustainability, with funds generated from its revenue being reinvested back into TAACCCT-funded programs of study.
- Throughout the entirety of the project, project personnel and participants alike demonstrated a pervasive inability to confidently and/or accurately describe the status of key grant components, grant processes and procedures, and the structure of the grant as a whole. Many project staff appeared particularly confused by the Nunez TAACCCT project's administrative structure and organizational hierarchy, repeatedly demonstrating uncertainty regarding which individuals filled which roles and what the responsibilities of said roles

---

[1]Outcome item data presented in this report represent only those Nunez TAACCCT students who gave permission for their data to be obtained and shared.

entail. As a result, these same staff communicated a sense of overall frustration with the Nunez TAACCCT project, facilitating feelings of stress, anxiety, and animosity.

- The sense of confusion that appears to have characterized the Nunez TAACCCT project throughout much of its implementation was not isolated to staff. Students, too, demonstrated routine uncertainty regarding specific supports that they were supposed to receive from project staff and were unable to provide accurate descriptions of the Nunez TAACCCT project. Up until January 2016, other external stakeholders (i.e., evaluators, some partners and some reporting entities) were often not informed about critical project components; however, in January 2016, communication tremendously improved when evaluators were provided a new point of contact.

- In DOL's solicitation, grantees were strongly encouraged to have evaluations that would utilize a random-assignment experimental design or, at a minimum, the most rigorous design suited for that project. In Nunez's application, a quasi-experimental design was proposed, but Nunez program staff were encouraged to work with their evaluator to finalize design elements. All evaluator attempts to collaborate with Nunez staff in obtaining a comparison site were to no avail.

- Evaluators identified a comparison site, Mississippi Gulf Coast Community College (MGCCC), and developed talking points for Nunez program staff to use in discussions with MGCCC; however, for unknown reasons, Nunez program staff were ultimately unsuccessful in completing this task. With a lack of comparison data, evaluators were unable to differentiate treatment and control students as initially intended.

- The Nunez TAACCCT project was consistently prone to a high degree of staff turnover, with many different individuals filling key grant positions and then vacating them following a short period of time. Inconsistency among personnel appears to have exacerbated the already prevalent problems caused by communicative barriers, inhibiting staff investment and introducing a series of recurring personnel changes making it difficult to fully streamline any organizational processes. However, since January 2016, the communication between the evaluation team and Nunez program staff tremendously improved.

- Initially, TAACCCT grantees were to collect wage and employment data by entering into collaborative relationships with local workforce investment boards. For a period of time, evaluators were under the impression that Nunez TAACCCT program staff were attempting to collect these data; however, after not receiving wage and employment data for two years, McREL evaluators attempted to establish a data sharing agreement with, first, the local workforce office and then, second, with the Louisiana Workforce Commission, a state-level agency. Following countless attempts to talk with workforce staff, evaluators were told that no workforce agency in Louisiana could share wage and employment data due to an agreement with DOL.

INTRODUCTION

The U.S. Department of Labor (DOL) awarded the Elaine P. Nunez Community College (hereafter referred to as Nunez) a $2.8 million Round 2 Trade Adjustment Assistance Community College and Career Training (TAACCCT) grant in September 2012. The aim of this grant was to provide targeted training and workforce development to assist economically dislocated workers and would also support partnerships between Nunez and local employers to develop programs providing pathways to high-wage, high-skill jobs aligned with industry needs (DOL, 2011).

The Nunez TAACCCT project permitted the community college to restructure their business administration program by implementing new courses for the general business administration program as well as by creating an Associate of Applied Science (A.A.S.) for Small Business Entrepreneurship (ENTR) and Hotel, Restaurant, and Tourism Administration (HRT) programs to meet employment needs in Louisiana. Additionally, the grant funded the development of an Entrepreneurship Center that served as a resource for students at Nunez Community College and small businesses within the area. Grant funds were also used to establish the Pelican Bay Café—a café that serves as an on-campus eatery and learning laboratory for students in the culinary, business and hospitality administration program.

Nunez chose to target the area of business administration due to the devastation to the region from Hurricane Katrina in August 2005 and the Deepwater Horizon Oil Spill that began in April 2010, in the Gulf of Mexico on the BP-operated Macondo Prospect. The hurricane and the flooding that followed was deemed to be the greatest natural disaster to hit the United States. Specifically, St. Bernard Parish, where Nunez is located, was decimated—flood water in many areas did not recede for weeks. Nunez suffered damage to the first floor of every building with the seven feet of flood water they received. The oil spill in the Gulf of Mexico—where 4.9 million barrels or 210 million gallons—has been described as the worst environmental disaster in the United States.

Historically, New Orleans and the entire coastal region have been a magnet for small businesses, those of which are family-owned, and focused on tourism. These businesses tended to be the ones most affected by Hurricane Katrina and the BP oil spill because they had the least financial resources. The smaller the business, the higher the failure rate (Dolfman, Wasser and Bergman, 2007). In a 2006 article (Congleton), the estimated damages from just

Hurricane Katrina were in excess of $200 billion, making this hurricane one of the most economically costly hurricanes to ever strike the United States.

The multi-level goal of the Nunez TAACCCT grant was to redesign an existing A.A.S. for Business Administration and develop two new A.A.S. degrees under Business Administration - one emphasizing Entrepreneurship/Small Business Management and the other with an emphasis on Hotel, Restaurant and Tourism. To meet project goals, Nunez project staff proposed several activities. Table 1 presents the five overarching DOL priorities and the strategies and activities necessary to implement the overarching priorities.

Table 1. Nunez TAACCCT Project Planned Priorities, Strategies and Activities

Priority 1: Evidenced-Based Design	
Strategy 1.1: Creation of student cohorts based on program choice and need for developmental education	Activity 1.1: Assessments, soft skills coaching, mentoring during semesters and at key registration periods
Strategy 1.2: Creation on Entrepreneurship Center	Activity 1.2: Alteration of facilities, implementation of workshops and intensive services
Strategy 1.3: Creation of learning labs for Hotel, Restaurant and Tourism degree	Activity 1.3: Alteration of facilities; procurement of equipment and supplies
Priority 2: Stacked and Latticed Credentials	
Strategy 2.1: Creation of degrees and certificates for Business Administration; Small Business/Entrepreneurship Center; and Hotel, Restaurant and Tourism	Activity 2.1: Approval of curriculum, implementation of new degrees and curriculum, marketing of new degrees
Strategy 2.2: Implementation and administration of external certifications for Hotel, Restaurant and Tourism	Activity 2.2: Implementation of certification training into degree program, establishing college as provider of certifications, training instructors, administering credentials
Priority 3: Online and Technology-Enabled Learning	
Strategy 3.1: All business course offerings offered in online format	Activity 3.1 Rewriting of courses to allow for online format, update semester schedule to reflect change, marketing courses
Strategy 3.2: Provide online simulations for all TAACCCT-funded programs	Activity 3.2: Procurement of licenses, update syllabi to reflect usage of simulations in instruction
Priority 4: Transferability and Articulation	
Strategy 4.1: Louisiana transfer degree offered with an emphasis on Business Administration	Activity 4.1: Determination of business courses to be offered, implementation into degree offerings of the college
Strategy 4.2: Established articulation agreements with four year colleges/universities	Activity 4.2: Utilize already established agreements, complete agreements that have been discussed, open discussions with colleges outside of service area

Priority 5: Strategic Alignment	
Strategy 5.1: Creation and implementation of job shadowing and internship opportunities	Activity 5.1: Creation of expectations at each location, creation of evaluation methods to measure success, observations of students within internship settings
Strategy 5.2: Providing intensive services	Activity 5.2: Hold workshops, hold lectures of industry partners and other strategic organizations, evaluate curriculum

Nunez staff repeatedly shared that implementation of the TAACCCT grant is unique from the TAACCCT grants awarded to other institutions due to the small size and capacity of Nunez Community College, as well as the unique culture of the surrounding St. Bernard Parish community. Specifically, Nunez is a relatively small community college compared to similar local institutions (e.g., Delgado Community College) – enrolling 2,269 total students in Fall 2015. The majority of these students (67%) are enrolled only Part-Time (i.e., completing less than 12 credit hours per week) and are female (62%). A significant number of students are under the age of 22 (49%), and most students identify themselves as either White (41%) or Black (34%) in ethnicity. These demographic statistics remain relatively consistent when exploring the characteristics of Nunez TAACCCT grant participants specifically – 75% of whom were female and 82% of whom identified themselves as either Black (47%) or White (35%) ethnically (see Appendix F, Table F.1).

The next section of this report describes the Nunez TAACCCT program evaluation that was designed by McREL International. This is followed by a description of the evaluation findings, conclusions, and lessons learned. Detailed summary information from all data collection activities can be found in the appendices.

EVALUATION DESIGN

Throughout the implementation of the Nunez TAACCCT project, five data collection activities were employed by McREL evaluators to respond to the implementation evaluation questions (see Table 2) for the Nunez TAACCCT project. The evaluation design includes a mixed-method approach of collecting and analyzing qualitative and quantitative data from several stakeholder groups (e.g., students, staff, and industry partners) on their perceptions, experiences, and involvement in the Nunez TAACCCT project. The descriptive analyses of implementation strategies and activities document the structural and procedural aspects of program implementation and are intended to describe the Nunez TAACCCT project as of the grant conclusion, as well as who has done what, where, when, and how.

The ongoing formative assessment focused on the operational strengths and weaknesses of the Nunez TAACCCT project upon implementation. Formative data were collected from Nunez TAACCCT staff, partner organizations, and students. The following table summarizes the formative evaluation questions examined through data collection activities.

Table 2. Implementation Evaluation Questions

Implementation Evaluation Questions
Q1. How was the particular curriculum selected, used, or created?
Q2. How were programs and program design improved or expanded using grant funds?
Q3. What program delivery methods were offered?
Q4. What was the program administrative structure?
Q5. What support services and other services were offered?
Q6. Did the grantee conduct an in-depth assessment of participants' abilities, skills, and interests to select participants into the grant program?
Q7. What assessment tools and processes were used?
Q8. Who conducted the assessment?
Q9. Were the assessment results useful in determining the appropriate program and course sequence for participants?
Q10. Was career guidance provided and, if so, through what methods?
Q11. What contributions did each of the partners make in terms of (1) program design; (2) curriculum development; (3) recruitment; (4) training; (5) placement; (6) program management; (7) leveraging of resources; and commitment to program sustainability?
Q12. What factors contributed to partners' involvement or lack of involvement in the program?
Q13. What contributions from partners were most critical to the success of the grant program?
Q14. What contributions from partners had less impact?

With regard to the evaluation of the Nunez TAACCT project's outcomes, evaluators examined the extent to which the Nunez TAACCCT had an impact on target participants' outcomes, as defined by DOL and Nunez Community College Technical Proposal (see Table 3). Summative data were collected from student educational records that was provided by Nunez TAACCCT staff to determine the extent to which anticipated outcomes were achieved. No wage and employment data could be collected (please refer to *Data Limitations* in the *Data Collection Methods* section below). The following table summarizes the outcome items and targets of the Nunez TAACCCT project. Note that Year 4 targets were established for graduate follow-up data only.

Table 3. Outcome Items and Targets

	Outcome	Year 1 Target	Year 2 Target	Year 3 Target	Year 4 Target	Overall
1	Total unique participants served	90	140	170	NA	400
2	Total number of participants completing a TAACCCT-funded program of study	20	30	50	NA	100
3	Total number of participants still retained in their program of study or other TAACCCT-funded program of study	76	119	144	NA	339
4	Total number of participants completing credit hours	90	140	170	NA	400
5	Total number of participants earning credentials	50	100	150	NA	300
6	Total number of participants enrolled in further education after TAACCCT-funded program of study completion	10	30	35	40	115
7	Total number of participants employed after TAACCCT-funded program of study completion	10	20	30	40	100
8	Total number of participants retained in employment after program of study completion	0	8	16	25	49
9	Total number of participants employed at enrollment who received a wage increase post-enrollment	12	25	40	56	133

DATA COLLECTION METHODS

Student Entrance Survey

In November 2014, a paper-based student entrance survey was administered to participants enrolled in classes relevant to TAACCCT-funded programs of study. The survey gathered primarily quantitative data related to participants' perceptions, expectations, and experiences with their programs of study as well as potential challenges that they might face with regard to program completion and persistence. A total of 36 students responded to the survey. Surveys were administered and collected by course instructors, and completed surveys were then mailed to the McREL evaluation team for analysis. The student entrance survey was originally intended to be administered at the beginning of each semester to any new students enrolling in programs of study falling beneath the umbrella of the Nunez TAACCCT project, as well as a student exit survey at the end of each semester for students exiting from TAACCCT-affiliated programs. However, Nunez program staff expressed some dismay that they would have to administer two surveys in a single semester; therefore, student entrance and exit surveys were hybridized into a new survey collecting both entrance data from new students and exit data from departing students. As such, though data obtained from the November 2014 student entrance survey was aggregated with student data obtained through subsequent hybridized surveys, the student stand-alone entrance survey was administered only once. The student entrance survey is displayed in Appendix A, and a summary of survey findings by item is included in Appendix A-1.

Hybridized Student Entrance/Exit Survey

After Nunez program staff expressed some dismay in administering two student surveys in a single given semester, student entrance and exit surveys were hybridized into a single survey soliciting data from both new and departing Nunez TAACCCT participants. These hybridized surveys were administered in paper format to students enrolled in any of the three TAACCCT-funded programs of study at the conclusion of each semester. Participants were asked to provide their perceptions, expectations, and experiences with their programs of study as well as potential challenges they might have faced with regard to program completion and persistence. Surveys were administered and collected by course instructors at the beginning of class, and completed surveys were then mailed to the McREL evaluation team for analysis. The hybridized student survey is included in Appendix B of this report, with summaries of survey findings obtained during each administration period shown in Appendix B-1 through B-2.

Student Individual/Group Interviews

In June and October of 2015, members of the evaluation team visited Nunez to conduct on-site individual and group interviews with students enrolled in TAACCCT-funded programs of study. The interviews were designed to gather information about students' experiences with their programs of study, as well as their overall perceptions of the Nunez TAACCCT project – specifically in terms

of their motivation to enroll in their program of study, their involvement and satisfaction with various program components, and any challenges they may have experienced. Unfortunately, due to a lack of recruiting on campus by Nunez program staff prior to the June 2015 student interviews, student interviewee numbers were much less than expected. In light of this, additional steps were taken by McREL evaluators to more closely collaborate with Nunez staff in scheduling student interviews in October 2015, and these efforts ultimately yielded a greater number of interview participants. The interview protocol utilized in conversations with students in presented in Appendix C, and summaries of interview findings from June and October of 2015 are presented in Appendix C-1 and C-2 respectively.

Program Staff Interviews

In June 2015 and June 2016, the evaluation team conducted a series of interviews with the staff of Nunez's TAACCCT grant initiative. The interviews were tailored to staff members' specific responsibilities to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the project's implementation from their various perspectives as well as their overall perceptions of Nunez's TAACCCT project, prompting participants to describe the project's implementation progress, staff and partner involvement, implementation successes and challenges, perceptions of community and workforce impact, project sustainability and transferability, and other overall comments or observations. These interviews were conducted on-campus and in-person in June 2015 and remotely via telephone in June 2016. The interview protocol utilized during these conversations with project staff is included in Appendix D, and summaries of interview findings from June 2015 and June 2016 are presented in Appendix D-1 and D-2 respectively.

Partner Survey

In May 2016, an online survey was administered to industry partners of the Nunez TAACCCT project to gather primarily quantitative data related to partners' perceptions, expectations, and experiences with the project as well as the ways in which industry partners have supported the Nunez TAACCCT project. Nunez program staff were asked to provide names and contact information for all partners. A total of 10 partners responded to the survey. Surveys were administered and collected electronically via Qualtrics. A summary of survey findings by item is included in Appendix E, with the survey shown in Appendix E-1.

Student Education Records

Individual students' educational records were provided to the McREL evaluation team by Nunez TAACCCT project staff. Specifically, grant-affiliated staff at the college shared student-level educational data for the purposes of examining the progress and impact of the TAACCCT project. Additionally, these data were used to respond to the TAACCCT outcome measures (i.e., number of credit hours completed, number of credentials earned), evaluators analyzed other educational data (e.g., grade point average, and different types of credits attempted and earned) to monitor participants' progress toward meeting their educational goals (e.g., program completion and

attainment of credentials). Because personally identifiable information was included in the student educational records, all transfers of data were encrypted using 256-bit SSL (Secure Sockets Layer). This the same security used by banks and many e-commerce sites. SSL works by establishing a private connection and each end of the connection is authenticated before transfer begins. Data traveling between the endpoints can only be decrypted by the intended recipient by using unique decryption keys. A full summary of these results can be found in Appendix F.

Data Limitations

A number of obstacles arose throughout the course of the Nunez TAACCCT project creating impediments to a timely and effective evaluation. Initially, evaluation efforts were late in starting as a result of a six-month delay in the State of Louisiana signing the agreed upon contract. Further, once the project did begin, McREL evaluators encountered difficulty in scheduling an initial kick-off meeting with Nunez staff as a result of repetitious changes in project personnel. Once the contract was signed, it was still four months before the Nunez TAACCCT project team could meet with the evaluation team.

Following the August 2014 onsite visit, McREL evaluators attempted to collaborate with Nunez staff in administering the student entrance survey; however, Nunez staff were unable to return completed surveys to evaluators until December 2014. As a result, the McREL evaluators were unable to report on any student data until after the start of Year 2 (began October 1, 2014). From the August 2014 onsite visit through the final year of the grant, subsequent efforts to collect data from students, staff, and partners were routinely met with a lack of response, resulting in evaluators needing to explore alternative strategies for gathering data. For example, prior to an onsite data collection visit in June 2015, evaluators spoke at length via email and telephone with Nunez program staff about the need to recruit students and staff for interviews. Additionally, student surveys were to have been administered by program staff in May 2015. Upon arrival, evaluators learned that no interviews had been scheduled with students or staff, nor had any arrangements been made to administer surveys to students. In light of this, evaluators visited classrooms and offices personally to ask students and staff to participate in interviews and evaluators distributed surveys manually to instructors. Students who finally agreed to speak with the evaluators shared that no information had been shared with them about the interviews prior to the evaluators visiting the campus.

Additionally, to most effectively examine program outcomes, McREL evaluators initially planned to employ a quasi-experimental, cohort-based longitudinal design with a comparable nonparticipating group of students to assess the extent to which the Nunez TAACCCT project resulted in participant outcomes of interest. Nunez TAACCCT evaluators attempted to collaborate with Nunez staff in obtaining a comparison site. Evaluators identified a comparison site, Mississippi Gulf Coast Community College (MGCCC), and developed talking points for Nunez program staff to use in discussions with MGCCC; however, for unknown reasons, Nunez program staff were ultimately unsuccessful in completing this task. Therefore, as of the writing of this report, there is

no comparison student educational data (survey data, educational records) or wage and employment data. With a lack of comparison data, evaluators were unable to differentiate treatment and control students as initially intended.

Evaluators also sought to conduct analyses of student wage and employment data as a means of assessing the extent to which the Nunez TAACCCT project achieved outcomes of interest. To facilitate this aim, McREL evaluators attempted to collaborate with Nunez TAACCCT program staff in securing student wage and employment data. Following Nunez program staffs' inability to secure the wage and employment data from the local workforce agency, McREL evaluators made countless efforts to work with the local workforce agency and then the Louisiana Workforce Commission at the state level. After persistent follow-up, evaluators were told that no wage and employment data could be shared because of a data sharing agreement with DOL. Therefore, evaluators were unable to collect any wage and employment data for participating students for this program. In June 2016, alternative methods of collecting wage and employment data were proffered, but all data collection efforts had ended by that time.

Lastly, due to low enrollment numbers of WIA-TAA (n=0) and veteran (n=2) students, Nunez enrollment numbers did not meet the minimum reporting sample size (n≥10). Therefore, evaluators cannot determine, with accuracy, the extent to which WIA-TAA and veteran students differ from other participating students on any outcomes.

DATA ANALYSES

Analyses of the quantitative data gathered through the surveys and student educational records involved the calculation of descriptive statistics such as frequencies, percentages, and measures of central tendency and dispersion (e.g., means and standard deviations). Focus group and individual interview data (i.e., qualitative data) were analyzed by question and by theme. Data were segmented into passages through coding. Themes were then identified and summarized by salient and prevalent issues. This descriptive analysis provides contextual and process detail only and does not include quantitative data such as the number and percentage of respondents providing a particular comment.

Formative data collected throughout the project were utilized in answering the Implementation Evaluation Questions. The findings presented in this section are organized by question, with the primary findings in bold, red font. Contextual information and additional detail follow these primary findings.

Q1 How was the particular curriculum selected, used, or created?

The programs of study encompassed in the Nunez TAACCCT project were selected and developed to support and revitalize the local economy of St. Bernard Parish in the aftermath of Hurricane Katrina in August 2005 and the BP oil spill of April 2010.

Nunez TAACCCT project staff explained to McREL evaluators that the business administration, entrepreneurship and small business management, and hotel, restaurant, and tourism administration programs were created as a means of providing aid to the struggling local economy of St. Bernard Parish following the devastation of Hurricane Katrina in August 2005 and the April 2010 BP oil spill, as well as the drilling moratorium in the Gulf of Mexico. Project staff described these fields as the historical foundations of the regional economy and indicated that the majority of organizations in these professions are small, family-owned businesses. These businesses tended to be most affected by Hurricane Katrina and the BP oil spill due to a lack of financial resources, which crippled local industry.

Pre-TAACCCT funding, Nunez's business administration courses tended to focus more on how businesses work. Post-TAACCCT funding, the business administration courses focus on how to operate or manage a business. Once Nunez faculty and staff selected and or created their programs' curricula, the Louisiana Community and Technical College System had to approve all curricula redesign.

"I think it was a great concept. There's a lot of potential for the fields that we focused on with this project, and it was really tailored to the local community and industry."
– Nunez TAACCCT Staff Member

For the HRT program, Nunez engaged the Louisiana Restaurant Association to determine sufficient training for the culinary courses (for the restaurant aspect of the program). The Louisiana Hotel and Lodging Association as well as the Greater New Orleans Hotel and Lodging Association was engaged to determine sufficient training in hotel management. Nunez also engaged the Small Business Administration, the Greater New Orleans

Small Business Development Center and Gulf Coast Bank and Trust to evaluate the credentials that were created.

Q2	How were programs and program design improved or expanded using grant funds?

An on-campus Entrepreneurship Center has been developed and staffed to support students enrolled in any of the three grant-funded programs of study.

Project staff reported during the June 2015 and 2016 interviews that an Entrepreneurship Center has been set up and staffed using grant funds. Interviewees indicated that this center is the means by which most of the Nunez TAACCCT project's student support services are provided to program participants. Project staff described the center as a resource accessible to Nunez students as well as members of the St. Bernard Parish community, offering materials, workshops, tutoring, and other opportunities (e.g., public lectures from visiting business owners and career fairs). Project staff and participants characterized the supports provided through the Entrepreneurship Center as informal in nature and explained that formal guidance and career counseling are already provided through Nunez Community College independent from the Nunez TAACCCT grant, and as such the grant leverages those student support services rather than implementing entirely new systems. Interview participants reported that Entrepreneurship Center staff routinely make referrals and connect students in TAACCCT-funded programs of study with these services.

An on-campus, student-operated café has been developed.

Program personnel and participants explained that the construction of the student-operated Pelican Bay Cafe has been funded through the Nunez TAACCCT project. This café is intended to

serve as an experiential learning opportunity for students enrolled in any of the three grant-funded programs of study, allowing them to develop knowledge and skills relevant to their fields in a hands-on environment. Nunez TAACCCT project staff and participants have reported that the café has been fully implemented despite initial delays. The café is staffed by students who operate the restaurant under the direction of a full-time chef who was hired using grant funds. Project staff expressed the expectation that the café will

continue to provide a valuable service to the school and community after the expiration of grant funds, communicating that it has generated a consistent revenue to date.

Grant funds have been used to purchase new equipment and resources for project staff and participants.

Project staff explained to McREL evaluators during the June 2015 and 2016 interviews that the Nunez TAACCCT project has funded new and up-to-date equipment to be used by program personnel and participants alike. Most of this equipment has been utilized in the Entrepreneurship Center, which has been supplied with new computers and relevant resources to assist students as they progress through their programs of study. Project staff expressed the belief that new equipment provided through the TAACCCT grant has yielded significant positive outcomes for Nunez Community College, such as a June 2016 staff interview participant who shared,

> *The furniture that we were able to buy, the areas that we were able to create… you could see the attitude of our faculty and staff and students change. Having the café on campus has been wonderful, having the space for the Entrepreneurship Center has been great. We have had people come to our campus, people who have been here before, and they see these changes and their jaws just drop. I think it is incredible how everything has come together.*

Q3   What program delivery methods were offered?

The program employs a predominantly traditional delivery model.

Interviews with Nunez TAACCCT project staff and participants revealed that the program primarily utilized a traditional delivery model, wherein students attend class in-person and learn from their instructors in face-to-face contexts. Students and teachers both reported that this model sometimes incorporates online assignments (e.g., projects, homework) and simulations completed via computers, but indicated instruction itself predominantly takes place in person. While neither program staff nor participants raised any specific concerns regarding this method of program delivery, 23% of student survey respondents (n=78) reported struggling with securing transportation to classes at least *sometimes*, suggesting that some students do experience difficulty participating in courses using the current method of program delivery. This also suggests that the Nunez experienced difficulty in achieving one of the goals laid out in its initial grant application, wherein it was articulated that the Nunez Community College Department of Business Administration intended to offer all courses online by Fall 2013.

Another goal of the Nunez TAACCCT project was the implementation of simulation software in grant-affiliated programs of study. Grant personnel and participants indicated that a number of labs and training modules aligned with this goal have been implemented as key components of the Nunez TAACCCT project, wherein students are able to obtain first-hand experience working through real-world scenarios. Labs and simulators implemented in TAACCCT-affiliated programs of study include web-based simulation assignments, crowd sourcing activities, business plan development projects for students

enrolled in business and entrepreneurial courses, and a "front desk simulator" for students enrolled in the HRT administration program. Project personnel also described a "market bay" where students in the entrepreneurship program are invited to develop a service or product and then solicit it to others, as well as participate in "pitch contests" where they receive practice and feedback in presenting services and products to potential funders from the local community. Respondents to student surveys expressed a mixed reaction to these labs and simulators from program participants, with only 30% of respondents reporting having been greatly (22%) or extensively (8%) engaged in lab simulations and 36% reporting having been engaged very little (18%) or not at all (18%) (n=78).

| Q4 | What was the program administrative structure? |

Program staff experienced confusion and frustration regarding the administrative structure of the Nunez TAACCCT project.

At various points throughout the life of the Nunez TAACCCT project, personnel informed McREL evaluators that many staff have been confused regarding the program's organizational structure – particularly regarding program administration. Staff members reported a sense of uncertainty concerning the roles and responsibilities of certain administrative positions, which they indicated was routinely exacerbated by an abnormally high rate of staff turnover. Project personnel explained that this lack of consistency and steady organizational flow in the program administrative structure resulted in a pervasive sense of unpredictability and a lack of accountability, with several members of the Nunez TAACCCT staff indicating that they were repeatedly uncertain of who it is that they were technically supposed to report to within the grant-funded hierarchy. During the June 2015 staff interviews, a member of the project team explained to McREL evaluators,

> *"This place really lacks a structured, organizational flow… there are some people that report to three different bosses."*
> – Nunez TAACCCT Staff Member

It's like, "Well, who am I working for today?" I think that needs to be greatly improved, and it's not difficult. It's just I don't think it was ever done here before because everybody kind of knew what they did, but when people leave and new people come in, they don't even know their job because it's never been written down.

These challenges remained persistent in the final year of the Nunez TAACCCT project, as well, ultimately leading to members of the project staff expressing disappointment and frustration. One such individual explained during the June 2016 staff interviews,

One of the biggest things is a lack of leadership. We had a roadmap of what we needed to do and where we wanted to be, but I don't think anybody took it in any one direction. We were kind of stuck in the middle of the trip the whole time. I just feel, and I've always felt, that we didn't have a spokesperson for the project until the end, we didn't have anybody in charge. Nobody was directing the ship.

According to the proposed organizational structure, the Nunez TAACCCT project was to be overseen by several key administrative positions (pp. 21-23). The first position identified in the application was the Chair of the Department of Business Administration, whose responsibilities included teaching business courses, serving as a mentor to students enrolled in TAACCCT-affiliated programs, providing assistance in tracking program participants, reporting data to the grant coordinator, and any other duties that were required to assist in the management of the grant. The application also indicated that a Director was to be hired to oversee the newly-created Entrepreneurship Center. Initial set-up included specific responsibilities such as purchasing equipment, software, and supplies and coordinating with facilities to ensure the layout of the Entrepreneurship Center aligned with project standard. Additionally, the Director was to be responsible for overseeing the Entrepreneurship Center's daily operations; creating and teaching workshops offered within the Entrepreneurship Center; assisting, tracking, reporting, and mentoring all users of the Entrepreneurship Center; teaching courses; and training and supervising Entrepreneurship Center staff.

The initial application also indicated that a support staff person was to be hired to assist the Director of the Entrepreneurship Center, as well as an additional staff person whose responsibilities would entail running training workshops; developing and administering specialized trainings; track participants; and supporting the Director. While these positions do appear to have been somewhat staffed, the extent to which each of these roles fulfilled their corresponding responsibilities cannot be described with confidence, given the degree of confusion communicated by Nunez staff.

Q5 What support services and other services were offered?

Grant-affiliated student support services are provided through the Entrepreneurship Center, including informal advising, workshops, tutoring, resources, and presentations.

Interviews with project staff and students revealed that the on-campus Entrepreneurship Center served as the primary means by which program participants were provided with student support services related to programs of study falling beneath the umbrella of the Nunez TAACCCT project. These services included informal advising, workshops, tutoring, and presentations and sessions hosted by professionals from the local community. Staff and students informed McREL evaluators that formal guidance and career counseling were already provided through Nunez Community College independent from the Nunez TAACCCT grant, and as such the grant leveraged those student support services instead of developing and implementing entirely new systems. Interview participants reported that Entrepreneurship Center staff routinely made referrals and connected students in TAACCCT-funded programs of study with these services.

Interview participants reported that the Entrepreneurship Center also provided students with resources such as computers for completing electronic assignments and books for studying and

research. All students interviewed by McREL evaluators indicated that they were aware of the student support services offered through the Entrepreneurship Center, but only slightly over half reported that they utilized those services on a regular basis. Specifically, 55% of student survey respondents (n=78) reported that they felt the tutoring, workshops, and labs provided by the Nunez TAACCCT project had *greatly* (31%) or *extensively* (24%) facilitated their learning experience, though 60% of respondents indicated that they felt these supports had *greatly* (36%) or *extensively* (24%) prepared them to be competitive in their field. Students and staff provided mixed reports as to any formal student advising that took place specifically as a component of the Nunez TAACCCT project. Staff interviews revealed a high degree of confusion amongst project personnel as to what role was to be played by certain positions in providing program participants with student support services, and this confusion remained persistent across the span of the grant. Project staff indicated that the student advising that took place under the Nunez TAACCCT grant was primarily informal in nature, with course instructors often stepping in to provide students with guidance of their own volition rather than being assigned as a counselor or adviser to specific students. Several members of the Nunez faculty also reported that Nunez employed an advising system referred to as "a bull pen" for all students, regardless of the programs of study in which they are enrolled. Interview participants explained that, within this system, students from various majors had access to instructors both within and outside of their discipline, giving them the opportunity to explore alternative fields of study and career paths.

This information was corroborated by both surveys and interviews conducted with students enrolled in the three programs of study encompassed beneath the umbrella of the Nunez

TAACCCT grant. Interviewed students indicated that the majority of the advising they received was provided by their instructors or through seeking out assistance at the Entrepreneurship Center. While most program participants expressed the opinion that the advising services they have received from their instructors and the Entrepreneurship Center staff had been helpful and had resulted in them receiving the supports and guidance they needed, others indicated that they have found the advising they have received through the Nunez TAACCCT project to be unsatisfactory. Several students also revealed during interviews with McREL evaluators that they had not received any form of advising services at all, as did 5% of student survey respondents whom reported knowing nothing about having a faculty advisor, 8% whom indicated that they had no faculty advisor assigned to them, and 13% whom reported that they were aware of having a faculty advisor but never met with them (n=77). In contrast, 74% of students surveys reported having met with their faculty advisor (n=77) and characterized the quality of advising services received during those meetings as *good* (37%) or *excellent* (37%) (n=41), as well as communicating that they were *somewhat* (12%) or *very* (62%) satisfied with the frequency advising services were provided (n=41).

In spite of this, the majority of students who indicated they had received any form of advising services reported that they had needed to seek out Nunez staff for assistance rather than having assistance offered to them. Roughly half (48%) of students surveyed shared that they would have liked to have seen faculty advising services handled differently for project participants (n=42), with 24% specifically indicating that they wished their advisors had reached out to them more often and 14% sharing that they wished they had reached out to their advisors more often.

Interviewed students and staff indicated that no job placement or internship services were currently offered specifically as a component of the Nunez TAACCCT project, but several staff members commented that some project industry partners had provided such opportunities of their own volition. Additionally, 52% of survey respondents (n=78) reported receiving opportunities to build a network of professional contacts *frequent*ly (33%) or *very frequently* (19%).

Q6	**Did the grantee conduct an in-depth assessment of participants' abilities, skills, and interests to select participants into the grant program?**
Q7	**What assessment tools and processes were used?**
Q8	**Who conducted the assessment?**
Q9	**Were the assessment results useful in determining the appropriate program and course sequence for participants?**

An assessment tool (COMPASS® placement test) was used upon enrollment at Nunez Community College regardless of major to determine course placement. The Wonderlic

Entrepreneurial Quotient assessment was also employed for students in the Business Administration and Entrepreneurial programs.

Although the topic of in-depth assessment of students did not come up in interviews with Nunez TAACCCT project staff, assessment tools are utilized upon entry to Nunez. All students were assessed via the Compass Test, which serves as placement for developmental education if needed. The Wonderlic Entrepreneurial Quotient assessment was also used with students in the Business Administration program and the Entrepreneurial program.

This assessment determined a student's affinity towards entrepreneurship and/or if their qualities were more in line with management of an existing company. Confirmation of these assessments were provided via interviews with program participants. Interviewees indicated that students had been required to participate in the Compass Assessment upon enrollment at Nunez regardless of major to determine whether or not they are in need of developmental coursework before progressing in their program of study. Several interviewed students reported having been required to complete this developmental coursework and expressed frustration with the experience, characterizing it as another obstacle impeding them from successfully completing their program of study.

> ## Q10 Was career guidance provided and, if so, through what methods?

No formal career guidance was characterized as being specifically provided through the Nunez TAACCCT project; however, students recognized some informal advising and guidance.

Nunez program personnel and students reported in interviews that no formal career guidance had been provided specifically as a component of the Nunez TAACCCT project. Students and staff spoke to Nunez TAACCCT evaluators as to the informal advising and guidance that is provided by students' course instructors and through the Entrepreneurship Center, but none indicated the presence of any formal system for providing career guidance to any students specifically enrolled in the business administration, entrepreneurship and small business management, or hotel, restaurant, and tourism administration programs.

Program participants who did report meeting with a member of the Nunez staff for career guidance prior to enrolling in courses were typically unable to identify that staff member's position, but generally indicated that they did not believe the individual was specifically associated with the Nunez TAACCCT project and instead served as a general counselor for all students attending

18

Nunez Community College. Those students who were able to identify the staff member's position overwhelmingly reported that that they had received career guidance offered informally by their instructors. "My students know that they can always come to me if they have a question about anything that they've got going on with their business or business plan," shared one such instructor, "I'm always available to help them out with their businesses."

Q11	**What contributions did each of the partners make in terms of (1) program design; (2) curriculum development; (3) recruitment; (4) training; (5) placement; (6) program management; (7) leveraging of resources; and commitment to program sustainability?**
Q12	**What factors contributed to partners' involvement or lack of involvement in the program?**
Q13	**What contributions from partners were most critical to the success of the grant program?**
Q14	**What contributions from partners had less impact?**

Nunez project staff believe that TAACCCT project partners provided valuable supports to program design and curriculum development through serving on advisory boards.

Project staff informed McREL evaluators during the June 2015 and 2016 interviews that partners have been heavily engaged in supporting the Nunez TAACCCT project and its objectives, particularly through their active participation in advisory boards. Interview participants explained that industry professionals participating in the advisory board meetings provide valuable input to Nunez staff as to what knowledge and skills program participants should be obtaining from their classes to be viable candidates for employment, informing both program design and curriculum development. Project staff also indicated that partners used these meetings as opportunities to share recent developments and news relevant to the industries being served. One interview participant commented,

> *I would say the advisory boards are a big success. We have had information come back from the advisory board that has helped with employability of students outside of these programs as well. So that's been helpful to grow the college and [the] employability of <u>all</u> of our students in addition to the TAACCCT students.*

For the most part, industry partners corroborated that they had been involved in this facet of the Nunez TAACCCT project, with 75% reporting having assisted in curriculum design to ensure training provided is aligned with industry needs (n=8). As a result, most industry partners (63%) reported the perception that the curriculum design and development of Nunez TAACCCT programs has been of high quality across the life of the grant.

Interview participants indicated that partners have also paid visits to the Entrepreneurship Center on the Nunez campus to sit in on student presentations and provide feedback on their work, actively taking part in student learning and sharing invaluable expertise. Describing one such event, an interview participant shared,

> *Our partners come in several times a semester and they'll listen to students' sales pitches and they act as judges. They give really good feedback on the students' work and let them know where they can improve. It's interesting to see because students give two sales pitches – one for a product they choose themselves, and then another pitch for a "bad" product that they get assigned. The partners seemed to enjoy watching the "bad" presentations, it looked like a lot of fun.*

Partners supported the Nunez TAACCCT project through leveraging resources.

Program personnel shared that partners of the Nunez TAACCCT grant provided valuable supports to the project through the leveraging of resources. Examples of this include partners offering industry-based testing directly to students, providing trolley services to assist students experiencing difficulty in securing transportation to classes, and offering their physical offices and resources to support students living far from campus. Staff explained that partners have also assisted in establishing a social media presence for the Nunez TAACCCT project, as well as providing financial support for a billboard advertising Nunez Community College's HRT administration program. Program personnel also shared that several project partners provided a number of scholarships for students to enroll in Nunez TAACCCT programs of study, indicating that these partners have made it possible for multiple students to receive education and training that would have otherwise been unavailable.

> *"Our entire goal with this program was to have our students prepared to go into the industry and work, and our partners have played a big part in achieving that goal."*
> – Nunez TAACCCT Staff Member

Partners served as advocates for the Nunez TAACCCT project throughout the state of Louisiana, actively engaging in recruitment of participants and additional partners.

Program personnel reported that partners conducted outreach activities across the state of Louisiana, referring potential participants to programs of study funded by the Nunez TAACCCT project. Partners also engaged local businesses which are not currently affiliated with the Nunez TAACCCT project, negotiating with these businesses to open their facilities for visits, workshops, and site-based trainings. Most partners (88%) who responded to the Summer 2016 Partner Survey (n=10) indicated that they are *likely* (33%) or *very likely* (56%) to continue recommending Nunez TAACCCT programs to companies, organizations, and community partners with which they collaborate.

High turnover of project personnel during the first two years of the Nunez TAACCCT project presented an early barrier to partners' participation.

Staff advised that any issues they experienced with partners to date have stemmed from obstacles within the college itself, specifically arising from the high degree of turnover among project personnel. One staff member shared that there had been several program directors and this inconsistency led to initial delays with getting partners involved in the grant activities. The interviewee noted, "There was a lot of time, quite frankly, wasted there. I think there was a lot of lost opportunity there . . . because we had a lot of good press when we first got the grant and that sort of was able to die off because nothing really happened from it." In light of this, only 44% of partners who responded to the Summer 2016 Partner Survey (n=9) reported that the Nunez TAACCCT project has provided adequate partnership support.

> *"Our partnerships made our students stronger, our school stronger, and our partners stronger."*
> – Nunez TAACCCT Staff Member

In spite of these initial challenges, partners demonstrated a strong commitment to the Nunez TAACCCT project. When asked to identify factors that may contribute to partners'

> *"Our partners have really just been wonderful and we would not be where we are now without them."*
> – Nunez TAACCCT Staff Member

involvement in the Nunez TAACCCT project, program personnel provided a variety of responses. Several members of the project staff shared that partners want to be involved in the training programs at Nunez as it allows them to have a role in facilitating the professional growth and development of potential future employees, giving them access to a high-caliber pool of workers. Other interview participants expressed that partners are willing to support the project as a result of the strong relationships that Nunez has fostered with members of the local community. "I think it's an issue of quantity vs. quality, in the end," explained an interview participant, who elaborated,

> *We're a small school and so we don't put out the same numbers as a lot of larger institutions around the area, but that allows us to individualize our instruction for every student that walks through our door. I think partners realize that.*

Project staff believe the most critical support that partners can provide is to continue hiring program graduates, and are confident that in doing so partners will play an integral role in supporting the Nunez TAACCCT project even after the expiration of DOL funds.

Nunez personnel explained to evaluators that they have cultivated strong relationships with local foundations and business with whom they have partnered. A member of the project staff commented, "They trust that the students who've finished with us have the skills they need to be successful, so we're seeing that our students are being hired." Program personnel communicated in interviews that these relationships will prove instrumental in sustaining components of the Nunez TAACCCT project following the expiration of grant funding. Interview participants indicated that they are confident that partners are up to the challenge, communicating that numerous partners have affirmed their commitment to the Nunez TAACCCT project beyond the life of the grant. "A lot of our partners are more active than the partners for other programs or other schools," said a staff

member, "I think the good relationships that we have built with our partners will continue." Results from the Summer 2016 Partner Survey appear to support this sentiment, with 88% of respondents *agreeing* (38%) or *strongly agreeing* (50%) that their companies and Nunez Community College TAACCCT programs will continue and expand beyond the life of the grant period, as well as 88% of respondents *agreeing* (38%) or *strongly agreeing* (50%) that they will consider collaborating with Nunez Community College on other projects in the future (n=8).

OUTCOME FINDINGS

TAACCCT outcomes are geared towards the attainment of both academic and employment outcomes for participants. Education outcomes include program completion, continued enrollment, credential(s) earned, credit attainment, and further enrollment in education post-program completion. Employment outcomes include wage increases for incumbent workers, as well as new employment and retained employment for non-incumbent workers. Collected summative data were utilized in examining the extent to which the grant was successful in meeting its objectives regarding each of these TAACCCT-specific elements.

Education Outcomes[2]

Education outcome data were collected by Nunez Community College staff and shared with project evaluators at the conclusion of the spring 2015 semester and the spring 2016 semester. Across the span of the project, the Nunez TAACCCT project served a total of 72 unique participants, most of whom were enrolled in either the Entrepreneurship (25%) or Business Administration (21%) programs of study (see Table 4). Of these 72 participants, Nunez records indicated that 52 (72%) completed a TAACCCT-funded program of study, though 56 students (78%) obtained some form of credential. Most of these students (61%) obtained more than one certificate, with 17% obtaining two certificates, 10% obtaining three certificates, and 13% obtaining four or more certificates. Of these students, 37 specifically earned either a Certificate or Associates of Applied Science (see Table 5).

Table 4. Student Concentration Data

Item	n	Major	Frequency*	%**
Concentration	72	Louisiana Transfer Degree	--	--
		Business Administration	--	--
		Business Administration	15	20.8
		Hotel, Restaurant, and Tourism	--	--
		Medical Office Management	--	--
		Accounting	--	--
		Entrepreneurship	18	25.0
		Associate of General Studies	--	--
		Elementary Education	--	--
		Business Technology	--	--

---

[2] Outcome item data presented in this report represent only those Nunez TAACCCT students who gave permission for their data to be obtained and shared.

Item	n	Major	Frequency*	%**
		Medical Coding and Billing	--	--
		Culinary Arts	--	--
		Paramedic	--	--

*Assessments with a frequency <10 are not reported.
** Sum of percentages will not equal 100% due to missing data of insufficient frequencies.

Table 5. Degree and Certificate Attainment Data

Item	n	Frequency	%
Total number of students earning Associates of Applied Science (aggregate across all enrollees)	72	13	18.1
Total number of students earning Certificate of Applied Science (aggregate across all enrollees)		24	33.3

Note: A student could logically be going for a certificate and an Associate's Degree. It is possible to get multiple certificates and an Associate's Degree.

Education outcome data provided by Nunez indicated that students also obtained a number of other credentials. A number of students enrolled in programs falling under the Hotel, Restaurant, and Tourism (HRT) administration component of the Nunez TAACCCT grant also worked toward obtaining professional certifications. Specifically, seven students (10%) earned a Training for Intervention Procedures (TIPS) certificate, three students (4%) earned a ServSafe certificate, and nine students (13%) earned a Certified Guest Service Professional (CGSP) certificate (see Table 6).

Table 6. HRT Certification Attainment Data

Item	n	Frequency	%
Total number of students earning TIPS Alcohol certificates (aggregate across all enrollees)		7	9.7
Total number of students earning ServSafe certificates (aggregate across all enrollees)	72	3	4.2
Total number of students earning CGSP certificates (aggregate across all enrollees)		9	12.5

Many students also obtained a National Career Readiness Certificate (NCRC) following participation in the American College Testing (ACT) WorkKeys assessments. These assessments are used to help employers select, hire, train, develop, and retain a quality workforce, measuring both foundational and "soft" skills (e.g., professional conduct, teamwork, etc.). Most students participating in the Nunez TAACCCT project (68%) participated in the ACT WorkKeys assessments (see Table 7).

Table 7. ACT WorkKeys Participation Data

Item	n	Total	Frequency	%
Participation in ACT WorkKeys assessments	72	Students who participated in ACT WorkKeys assessments	49	68.1
		Students who did not participate in ACT WorkKeys assessments	23	31.9

Students' average cumulative GPA was a C average (1.9) or higher. Overall, student's cumulative average GPA was 2.5. In 2016, students earned the highest average cumulative GPA with 2.7 (see Table 8).

Table 8. Student Cumulative GPA Data

Item	n	Year	Average GPA
Student grade point averages (GPA)	5	2014	1.9
	18	2015	2.3
	45	2016	2.7

*Sixty-eight students reported the year in which their enrollment in Nunez TAACCCT programs ended.

The statistics for students completing credit hours shows the increment in which students completed courses. Most students were not enrolled or completing credit hours until Fall 2014. The percentages of those completing credit hours are based on the total number of participating students rather than the total enrolled from semester to semester. For a further breakdown of this information, refer to the following tables showing the number of students who completed all attempted credit hours (Table 9) and total credit hours earned (see Table 10).

Table 9. Credit Hour Completion Data

Item	n*	Semester	Frequency	%**
Total number of students completing credit hours	71	Fall 2013	31	43.1
		Spring 2014	39	51.2
		Fall 2014	60	83.3
		Spring 2015	58	80.6
		Fall 2015	53	73.6
		Spring 2016	45	62.5

*Not all students were enrolled every year from 2013 to 2016.
 **Percentages represent those who completed credit hours by year (i.e., Total). To equal 100%, percentages would need to be compared to the equation (*n – freq)* to determine those who did not complete credit hours each semester rather than comparing percentages from semester to semester.

Table 10 presents the aggregate number of credit hours attempted, completed, and ultimate earned by students participating in the Nunez TAACCCT project. Although students attempted credits by enrolling in courses, many of the participants did not complete all credits in which they enrolled. Of the students who were enrolled in Nunez TAACCCT-affiliated programs across all

semesters, only seven of them (10%) completed all attempted credit hours. However, 71students (99%) completed at least some credit hours. After evaluating how many students were able to complete all attempted credit hours, the number of hours completed were compared to the number of hours earned. Schools may require a specific letter grade in courses for them to be considered earned toward the degree and may not count toward graduation merely because the student was able to complete a course. The credits completed and earned are not comparative across semesters due to the variations in enrollment.

Table 10. Credit Hour Completion Data Continued

Item	n	Completed/Earned	Credits	% Attempted Earned*	% Completed Earned**
Total number of credit hours (aggregate across all enrollees)	71	Attempted	6375	72.1	88.2
		Completed	5208		
		Earned	4594.5		

*Percentage earned is equal to the number of credit hours earned from the hours attempted.
**Percentage earned is equal to the number of credit hours earned from the hours completed.

At of the conclusion of the Nunez TAACCT project, a total of four students remain enrolled in their grant-funded programs of study, and seven students enrolled in further education following the completion of their programs. These numbers, as outlined above, are displayed below in comparison to the overall objectives for education outcomes of the Nunez TAACCCT project (see Table 11). Educational outcomes were shared with evaluators in June 2015 and 2016 and are also displayed in comparison to yearly objectives for Years 2 and 3 in Tables 12 and 13. The only education-oriented outcome objective for Year 4 entailed a total of 115 students enrolling in further programs of study following the completion of their current TAACCCT-funded programs. The Nunez TAACCCT project fell short of this goal, with only seven total students enrolling in additional programs of study following the completion of their enrollment in TAACCCT-affiliated programs.

Table 11. Overall Education Outcome Objective Comparison Data

	Outcome	Overall Target	Overall Actual	Difference
1	Total unique participants served	400	72	**328**
2	Total number of participants completing a TAACCCT-funded program of study	100	52	**48**
3	Total number of participants still retained in their program of study or other TAACCCT-funded program of study	339	4	**335**
4	Total number of participants completing credit hours	400	71	**329**
5	Total number of participants earning credentials	300	56	**244**
6	Total number of participants enrolled in further education after TAACCCT-funded program of study completion	115	7	**108**

Table 12. Year 2 Education Outcome Objective Comparison Data

	Outcome	Year 2 Target	Year 2 Actual	Difference
1	Total unique participants served	140	40	**100**
2	Total number of participants completing a TAACCCT-funded program of study	30	0	**30**
3	Total number of participants still retained in their program of study or other TAACCCT-funded program of study	119	39	**82**
4	Total number of participants completing credit hours	140	39	**101**
5	Total number of participants earning credentials	100	35	**65**
6	Total number of participants enrolled in further education after TAACCCT-funded program of study completion	30	0	**30**

Table 13. Year 3 Education Outcome Objective Comparison Data

	Outcome	Year 3 Target	Year 3 Actual	Difference
1	Total unique participants served	170	27	**103**
2	Total number of participants completing a TAACCCT-funded program of study	50	7	**43**
3	Total number of participants still retained in their program of study or other TAACCCT-funded program of study	144	53	**91**
4	Total number of participants completing credit hours	170	59	**111**
5	Total number of participants earning credentials	150	41	**109**

	Outcome	Year 3 Target	Year 3 Actual	Difference
6	Total number of participants enrolled in further education after TAACCCT-funded program of study completion	35	1	**34**

Employment Outcomes

As previously outlined in this report, evaluators sought to conduct analyses of student wage and employment data as a means of assessing the extent to which the Nunez TAACCCT project achieved its overarching objectives regarding employment outcomes. To facilitate this aim, McREL evaluators attempted to collaborate with Nunez TAACCCT program staff in securing student wage and employment data however, after not receiving wage and employment data for two years, McREL evaluators tried establishing a data sharing agreement with, first, the local workforce office and then, second, with the Louisiana Workforce Commission, a state-level agency. Following countless attempts to talk with workforce staff, evaluators were told that no workforce agency in Louisiana could share wage and employment data due to an agreement with DOL. The only information related to employment outcomes provided to evaluators by Nunez Community College concerned the total number of participants employed following the completion of their TAACCCT-funded programs of study. In total, data provided by Nunez indicated that 19 participants (26%) obtained employment following the completion of their programs of study, falling short of the TAACCCT grant's initial goal of 100 participants.

LESSONS LEARNED

At the close of this TAACCCT grant, a number of insights have been gained regarding the development of new or modified programs. Through its successes and challenges, the Nunez TAACCCT project can effectively serve as both a positive and negative exemplar for institutions seeking to implement similar projects and programs. Although the Nunez TAACCCT project struggled to meet its performance targets throughout the grant, the project still experienced key successes, most notably related to partner engagement and commitment to program sustainability.

- ✓ Future projects should strive to establish similarly strong relationships with local industry partners, both as a means of soliciting such supports from partners as well as to more comprehensively integrate academic institutions implementing grants into their local communities and facilitate stakeholder involvement.

- ✓ The Pelican Bay Café fulfilled a need communicated by students and staff alike. In doing so, the Nunez TAACCCT project was made immediately relevant to students attending Nunez Community College, regardless of whether or not they were specifically enrolled in TAACCCT-affiliated programs of study. The student-operated café is also a model of a unique approach to ensuring program sustainability, with funds generated from its revenue being reinvested back into TAACCCT-funded programs of study.

- ✓ Clear and consistent organizational communication and buy-in from all stakeholders is crucial to the success of any project. Expectations must be discussed at the outset of the project. All stakeholders must be knowledgeable of project components and external entities (i.e., partners, evaluators, etc.) will remain more knowledgeable about program components.

- ✓ Engaging project staff in the evaluation from the outset by having a kick-off evaluation meeting is vital to project success. It is beneficial for articulating expectations to stakeholders, establishing a common understanding of the evaluation, and helping stakeholders understand the value and purpose of evaluation.

- ✓ Inconsistency among personnel will exacerbate prevalent problems caused by communicative barriers, inhibiting staff investment and introducing a series of recurring personnel changes making it difficult to fully streamline any organizational structure.

- ✓ Low survey response rates impeded evaluation efforts. Despite efforts to try various methods to secure higher response rates (e.g., shortening the survey, using both paper and online, having advisors go to classrooms to distribute the survey, etc.), response rates tended to be low. One barrier to potentially securing a higher response rate was not being allowed to use incentives.

- ✓ Projected outcomes that were included in the grant application were frequently unrealistic. This appears to primarily be due to the lack of understanding about the definition of the indicators when grantees prepared the proposals and those with familiarity or knowledge of realistic targets were not the grant writers. The SGA provides some initial description of the outcome indicators. A suggestion is greater detail is provided as that may result in more realistic projections. Furthermore, recruitment became an issue with the upturn in the economy.
- ✓ Implementing data sharing agreements has been challenging. Discussions of data sharing expectations, logistics, and costs should have been discussed as proposals were being developed. Not only do some states not permit the sharing of data, but in states that due there have been misunderstandings about what is possible and for what fees. This has taken considerable time to address and in some situations data sharing agreements were still unable to be established.
- ✓ More recently (June 2016) it was made known that other data sources are permissible for reporting on the outcome indicators. It would have been ideal to have this information as structures and processes were being established for data collection (i.e., Year 1 of a TAACCCT grant).
- ✓ An expectation of TAACCCT evaluations was to employ either an experimental or quasi-experimental design. Experimental designs were not permissible for TAACCCT evaluations we conducted due to the fact that grantees could not (colleges would not permit) random selection of who could participate in the grant. Although quasi-experimental designs were proposed in the evaluation plan (e.g., comparison with students in similar programs at same college or students in same programs at a non-TAACCCT college). Securing data from comparison students was virtually impossible without being able to secure other colleges' buy-in.
- ✓ As an organization that is evaluating more than one TAACCCT, it has been advantageous to build upon economies of scale. Internally evaluators have learned from each other's projects and used common evaluation methods and scales. It would have been valuable to have all TAACCCT evaluators convene for at least one national meeting as proposed in the SGA. These types of meetings would have built a community of learners that would have permitted each of us to share what was learned with the evaluations, instruments and processes as well as facilitated networking with one another.
- ✓ Consider funding studies to longitudinally track a sample of participants to examine long term outcomes and likewise study sustainability of the TAACCCT funded programs at a sample of colleges.

REFERENCES

Congleton, R. D., (2006). The story of Katrina: New Orleans and the political economy of
catastrophe. *Public Choice,* 127, 5-30.

Department of Labor. (2011). Trade Adjustment Assistance Community College and Career
Training (TAACCCT) Grant Program. Retrieved from http://www.doleta.gov/taaccct/

Dolfman, M. L., Wasser, S.F., & Bergman, B. (2007). The effects of Hurricane Katrina on the New
Orleans economy. Retrieved from http://www.bls.gov/opub/mlr/2007/06/art1full.pdf

APPENDIX A: STUDENT ENTRANCE SURVEY

General Information

1. What is your student enrollment ID number? _____

2. What is your name?

   _____ _____ _____
   (Last Name)   (First Initial) (Middle Initial)

3. What educational outcomes do you expect to achieve as a result of attending this college? Select one that best describes your most important current goal.
   - ○ Earn some credits
   - ○ Earn a certificate or multiple certificates
   - ○ Earn a diploma
   - ○ Earn an associate's degree (with or without certificates)
   - ○ Earn a bachelor's degree or higher

4. What is your current employment situation?

   - ○ Not employed
   - ○ Employed part-time in a business management or restaurant, hotel, or tourism administration field
   - ○ Employed full-time in a business management or restaurant, hotel, or tourism administration field
   - ○ Employed part-time in a field other than business management or restaurant, hotel, or tourism administration
   - ○ Employed full-time in a field other than business management or restaurant, hotel, or tourism administration

Perceptions, Expectations, and Experiences

5. To what extent do the tutoring, workshops, and labs provided by the Nunez TAACCCT facilitate your learning experience?
   - O Not at all
   - O Very little
   - O Somewhat
   - O Greatly
   - O Extensively
   - O N/A

6. To what extent does the Nunez TAACCT provide state-of-the-art lab and training equipment that is preparing you be competitive in your field?
   - O Not at all
   - O Very little
   - O Somewhat
   - O Greatly
   - O Extensively
   - O N/A

7. How often have you had opportunities to build a network of professional contacts (including peers, mentors, employers, and so on)?
   - O Never
   - O Rarely
   - O Occasionally
   - O Frequently
   - O Very Frequently
   - O N/A

8. How often have you had opportunities specifically to network, connect, or interact with potential employers?
   - O Never
   - O Rarely
   - O Occasionally
   - O Frequently
   - O Very Frequently
   - O N/A

9. How engaged have you been in lab simulations (e.g., student café, simulated hotel, simulated business) during your enrollment in the Nunez TAACCCT?
   - O Not at all engaged
   - O Slightly engaged
   - O Moderately engaged
   - O Very engaged
   - O Extremely engaged
   - O N/A

10. How did you hear about the program in which you are currently enrolled? (Select all that apply)

   - ○ Advertisements (such as TV, radio, newspaper, online ads, or billboards)
   - ○ News or media reports (such as TV interviews, news releases, or a story in the paper)
   - ○ Newsletter from the program
   - ○ Newsletter from a company or trade union/association
   - ○ Social media or social networking (such as Facebook, Twitter, LinkedIn, YouTube, blogs, or RSS feeds)
   - ○ E-mail (such as through a listserv)
   - ○ College or program website
   - ○ Other websites (such as a workforce/unemployment center)
   - ○ Program brochures, flyers, postcards, or posters
   - ○ Online search I initiated
   - ○ Community events (including college, career, or employment fairs)
   - ○ From family and friends
   - ○ From workforce center staff (such as job counselor, social services, or public assistance programs)
   - ○ From employers/potential employers
   - ○ Personal contact with college faculty or staff

Experience with Faculty Advising Services

To support student success in academic learning, your college assigns a **faculty advisor** (most likely, an instructor in the program) to support your individual learning needs. We would like to learn more about your interactions and experiences with your faculty advisor since enrollment.

11. Have you met with your faculty advisor since enrollment?

- ○ I know nothing about the faculty advisor.
- ○ I do not have a faculty advisor assigned to me.
- ○ I know I have a faculty advisor, but I have not met with him/her yet.
- ○ I have met with my faculty advisor.

If you <u>have met</u> with your faculty advisor, please respond to the following question:

11b.   Have you talked to your faculty advisor about planning for your courses?

- ○ Yes
- ○ No

12. How likely is it that you will go to your faculty advisor for advice and support in the following situations? Please fill in the bubble that best represents your response.

	Definitely not	Probably not	It depends	Probably yes	Definitely yes	Does not apply
If you have **personal problems** (e.g., family problems, financial problems, child care issues, or transportation issues).	○	○	○	○	○	○
If you have problems with **course work.**	○	○	○	○	○	○
If you have problems with **your instructors**.	○	○	○	○	○	○

Potential Barriers for Program Completion and Persistence

13. What is your current living arrangement?

- ○ Own house/apartment
- ○ Rental house/apartment
- ○ Government-assisted housing
- ○ Parents' house
- ○ Homeless
- ○ Other (please specify: _____)

14. How supportive is your family of your decision to continue your education?

- ○ Very unsupportive
- ○ Somewhat unsupportive
- ○ Neutral
- ○ Somewhat supportive
- ○ Very supportive

15. To what extent do you struggle with securing support or resources for child care so that you can attend classes?

- ○ Child care is always an issue for me.
- ○ Child care is sometimes an issue for me.
- ○ Child care is rarely an issue for me.
- ○ Child care is never an issue for me.
- ○ I do not have children.

A-3

16. To what extent do you struggle with securing transportation to school?
   - ○ Transportation is always a struggle for me.
   - ○ Transportation is sometimes a struggle for me.
   - ○ Transportation is rarely a struggle for me.
   - ○ Transportation is never a struggle for me.

17. Are there any other things in your life right now that may make it hard for you to complete the program?
   - ○ Yes
   - ○ No

Thank you so much for completing this survey! We appreciate your time and assistance!

APPENDIX A-1: FALL 2014 STUDENT ENTRANCE SURVEY SUMMARY

Fall 2014 Student Entrance Survey Summary

During the Fall 2014 semester, students enrolled at Nunez Community College in one of the three programs of study receiving funding through the Trade Adjustment Assistance Community College and Career Training (TAACCCT) grant (i.e., business administration, entrepreneurship/small business management, and hotel, restaurant, and tourism [HRT] administration) were asked to participate in a Student Entrance Survey. This survey asked students about their perceptions, expectations, and experiences with their programs of study as well as potential challenges that they might have been facing with regard to program completion and persistence. A summary of the data provided by students enrolled in these three TAACCCT-funded programs is presented in the following tables.

Overall, the majority of respondents expressed high aspirations concerning their education, identifying themselves as full-time students (81%) despite a large portion (80%) indicating that they are also employed at least part-time while in school. Additionally, in stark contrast to their parents (69% of whom had achieved no degrees or certifications beyond a high school diploma or general education diploma [GED]), 89% reported that they intend to earn an associate's degree or higher. Interestingly, despite their parents' lack of experience in higher education, 97% of respondents reported that their families consider education and achievement to be important. Other values that students identified as being important for their families are having respect for one's family members (100%), working hard (97%), carrying out one's obligations (100%), and maintaining family values (100%) and traditions (94%). A smaller percentage of students indicated that their family values also include a desire for material possessions (60%) and a sense of shame concerning their reliance upon public assistance (66%).

Survey Items	n	%
Are you classified as a full-time student or as a part-time student?	36	
Full-time student	29	80.6
Part-time student	7	19.4
What educational outcomes do you expect to achieve as a result of attending this college? Select one that describes your most important goal.	36	
Earn some credits	1	2.8
Earn a certificate or multiple certificates	2	5.6
Earn a diploma	--	--
Earn an associate's degree (with or without certificates)	27	75.0
Earn a bachelor's degree or higher	5	13.9

Survey Items	n	%
What is your current employment situation?	35	
Not employed	7	20.0
Employed part-time in a business management or HRT administration field	2	5.7
Employed full-time in a business management or HRT administration field	5	14.3
Employed part-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration	9	25.7
Employed full-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration	9	25.7
Own my own business	3	8.6
What is the highest level of education obtained by your parents?	36	
Did not graduate from high school	7	19.4
High school diploma or equivalent (GED)	18	50.0
Vocational certificate	3	8.3
Associate degree	5	13.9
Bachelor's degree	3	8.3
Master's degree	--	--
Ph.D. or Ed.D.	--	--
How important is each of the following issues regarding your immediate and extended family?		
Education and achievement	35	
Not at all important	1	2.9
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	4	11.4
Very important	4	11.4
Extremely important	26	74.3
Respect for family members	35	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	2	5.7
Very important	3	8.6
Extremely important	30	85.7

Survey Items	n	%
Desire for material possessions	35	
Not at all important	5	14.3
Not very important	9	25.7
Fairly important	9	25.7
Very important	8	22.2
Extremely important	4	11.1
A belief in the value of hard work	35	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	1	2.9
Fairly important	2	5.7
Very important	7	20.0
Extremely important	25	71.4
Ashamed to be dependent on public assistance	35	
Not at all important	8	22.9
Not very important	4	11.4
Fairly important	9	25.7
Very important	4	11.4
Extremely important	10	28.6
Responsible for carrying out obligations	35	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	3	8.6
Very important	7	20.0
Extremely important	25	71.4
Maintenance of family values	35	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	3	8.6
Very important	7	20.0
Extremely important	25	71.4

Survey Items	n	%
Maintenance of family traditions	**35**	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	2	5.7
Fairly important	6	17.1
Very important	3	8.6
Extremely important	24	68.6

Perhaps contradictory to the aforementioned importance that students' families place upon education, only 78% of respondents expressed that they feel supported by their families in continuing their education beyond a high school diploma or GED. While still a sizeable majority, the disparity between these numbers stands out given that almost half (49%) of the students surveyed reported that they are living at home with their parents. Thus, a lack of parental support could have significant implications for students' educational endeavors. Aside from housing, however, students indicated that they are relatively autonomous, with only 17% and 8% reporting that they struggle with securing resources for transportation to school and child care, respectively.

Survey Items	n	%
How supportive is your family of your decision to continue your education?	**31**	
Very unsupportive	6	16.7
Somewhat unsupportive	--	--
Neutral	2	5.6
Somewhat supportive	1	2.8
Very supportive	27	75.0
What is your current living arrangement?	**35**	
Own house/apartment	4	11.4
Rental house/apartment	12	34.3
Government-assisted housing	--	--
Parents' house	17	48.6
Homeless	--	--
Other	2	5.7

- *Live at home with my mother*
- *Live with some family members*

Survey Items	n	%
To what extent do you struggle with securing support or resources for child care so that you can attend classes?	36	
Child care is always an issue for me.	1	2.8
Child care is sometimes an issue for me.	2	5.6
Child care is rarely an issue for me.	1	2.8
Child care is never an issue for me.	6	16.7
I do not have children.	26	72.2
To what extent do you struggle with securing transportation to school?	36	
Transportation is always a struggle for me.	2	5.6
Transportation is sometimes a struggle for me.	4	11.1
Transportation is rarely a struggle for me.	7	19.4
Transportation is never a struggle for me.	23	63.9

Slightly more than half of the surveyed students (53%) reported having learned about the programs of study in which they are enrolled through online means, both through Nunez's official school website (41%) and from independent online searches (12%). A number of students (14%) also indicated that they had heard about their program of study through personal contact that they had with Nunez faculty and staff.

Survey Item	n	%
How did you hear about the programs in which you are currently enrolled? (Select all that apply)	51	
Advertisements	2	3.9
News or media reports	1	2.0
Newsletter from the program	2	3.9
Newsletter from a company or trade union/association	--	--
Social media or social networking	3	5.9
E-mail	2	3.9
College or program website	21	41.2
Other websites	1	2.0
Program brochures, flyers, postcards, or posters	1	2.0
Online search I initiated	6	11.8
Community events	--	--

Survey Item	n	%
From family and friends	3	5.9
From workforce center staff	1	2.0
From employers/potential employers	1	2.0
Personal contact with college faculty or staff	7	13.7

Students reported positive perceptions of the instruction and career training they are receiving at Nunez. Overall, respondents indicated that they are satisfied with the quality of instruction they have received (92%) and that the instruction/career training has met their needs and expectations (94%), given them the knowledge and skills necessary to be successful (94%), and will ultimately help them find employment (92%). Further, the majority of students (75%) also reported having had opportunities to build a network of professional contacts at least occasionally. Most of the respondents (69%) indicated that the tutoring, workshops, and labs provided by Nunez have help to facilitate their learning experience, and 81% agreed that they have been provided with state-of-the-art lab and training equipment, preparing them to be competitive in their fields. Thus far, however, only 45% of the students indicated that they have been at least moderately engaged in lab simulations (e.g., the student café, simulated hotel, and simulated class business), although this may stem from their lack of progress through their program at the time of the survey. As such, this number may improve over time.

Survey Items	n	%
Please indicate your level of agreement with each of the following statements based on your own experiences during your training.		
The quality of instruction I have received at Nunez Community College has been satisfactory.	36	
Strongly disagree	1	2.8
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	2	5.6
Agree	9	25.0
Strongly agree	24	66.7
In general, the quality of instruction I have received at Nunez Community College has met my needs and/or expectations.	36	
Strongly disagree	1	2.8
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	1	2.8
Agree	11	30.6
Strongly agree	23	63.9

Survey Items	n	%
I feel that the career training I am receiving here will give me the knowledge and skills I need to be successful.	36	
Strongly disagree	--	--
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	2	5.6
Agree	11	30.6
Strongly agree	23	63.9
I feel that the career training I am receiving here will help me find employment.	36	
Strongly disagree	--	--
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	3	8.3
Agree	9	25.0
Strongly agree	24	66.7
To what extent does the tutoring, workshops, and labs provided by Nunez Community College facilitate your learning experience?	36	
Not at all	2	5.6
Very little	1	2.8
Somewhat	3	8.3
Greatly	10	27.8
Extensively	12	33.3
N/A	8	22.2
To what extent does Nunez Community College provide state-of-the-art lab and training equipment that is preparing you to be competitive in your field?	36	
Not at all	--	--
Very little	--	--
Somewhat	6	16.7
Greatly	11	30.6
Extensively	12	33.3
N/A	7	19.4

Survey Items	n	%
How often have you had opportunities to build a network of professional contacts (including peers, mentors, employers, and so on) at Nunez?	36	
Never	1	2.8
Rarely	4	11.1
Occasionally	7	19.4
Frequently	14	38.9
Very frequently	6	16.7
N/A	4	11.1
How engaged have you been in lab simulations (e.g., student café, simulated hotel, and simulated business) during your enrollment at Nunez Community College?	36	
Not at all engaged	8	22.2
Slightly engaged	8	22.2
Moderately engaged	7	19.4
Very engaged	6	16.7
Extremely engaged	3	8.3
N/A	4	11.1

The majority of students (78%) reported having met with their faculty advisors prior to completing this survey, and 96% of those students indicated that these meetings were focused primarily on planning and preparing for courses in their programs of study. In addition, students predominantly indicated that they were likely to approach their faculty advisors (72%) or instructors (75%) for assistance if they had any concerns regarding their course work, but exhibited reluctance to meet with their faculty advisor concerning topics not specifically related to their schooling (i.e., only 19% reported that they were likely to meet with their advisor concerning personal problems). This reluctance could pose some difficulty for students, as 17% indicated having other factors in their life making it harder for them to successfully complete their program of study. A recurring theme amongst these factors was the challenge of finding a balance between work, family, and school, as depicted below.

"Working in a full-time job while being a full-time student has its difficult moments, but I refuse to give up."

CHALLENGE:
Finding a balance between
work, family, and school

"I'm just busy, I have two kids and a home to keep up with."

Survey Items	n	%
Have you met with you faculty advisor since enrollment?	36	
I know nothing about the faculty advisor	1	2.8
I do not have a faculty advisor assigned to me	3	8.3
I know I have a faculty advisor, but I have not met with him/her yet	4	11.1
I have met with my faculty advisor	28	77.8
If you *have met* with your faculty advisor, did you talk to him/her about planning for your courses?	28	
Yes	27	96.4
No	1	3.6
How likely is it that you will go to your faculty advisor for advice and support in the following situations?		
Personal Problems	36	
Definitely not	10	27.8
Probably not	10	27.8
It depends	7	19.4
Probably yes	1	2.8
Definitely yes	6	16.7
Does not apply	2	5.6
Problems with Your Coursework	36	
Definitely not	2	5.6
Probably not	3	8.3
It depends	4	11.1
Probably yes	4	11.1
Definitely yes	22	61.1
Does not apply	1	2.8
Problems with Your Instructors	36	
Definitely not	2	5.6
Probably not	3	8.3
It depends	3	8.3
Probably yes	8	22.2
Definitely yes	19	52.8
Does not apply	1	2.8

Survey Items	n	%
Are there any other things in your life right now that may make it hard for you to complete the program?	36	
Yes	6	16.7
No	30	83.3

APPENDIX B: HYBRIDIZED STUDENT ENTRANCE AND EXIT SURVEY

General Information

1. What is/was your student enrollment ID number? _____

2. What is your name? _____ _____ _____
   (Last Name)   (First Name)   (Middle Initial)

3. Are/were you classified as a:
   ○ Full-time student
   ○ Part-time student

4. What educational outcomes do/did you expect to achieve as a result of attending Nunez Community College? Select one that best describes your most important goal.
   ○ Earn some credits
   ○ Earn a certificate or multiple certificates
   ○ Earn a diploma
   ○ Earn an associate degree (with or without certificates)
   ○ Earn a bachelor's degree or higher

5. What is/was your employment situation while enrolled in your program of study?
   ○ Not employed
   ○ Employed part-time in a business management or HRT administration field
   ○ Employed full-time in a business management or HRT administration field
   ○ Employed part-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration
   ○ Employed full-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration
   ○ Own my own business

6. What is your current employment situation?
   ○ Not employed
   ○ Employed part-time in a business management or HRT administration field
   ○ Employed full-time in a business management or HRT administration field
   ○ Employed part-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration
   ○ Employed full-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration
   ○ Own my own business

Perceptions and Expectations

In this section, we would like to learn more about your perceptions and expectations. These questions will help the college understand how to improve its programs to fit student needs and better support students' educational and career goals.

7. Please indicate your level of agreement with each of the following statements based on your own experiences **during** your education by filling in the bubble for the most applicable response option.

Item	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neither Agree or Disagree	Agree	Strongly Agree
a. The quality of instruction I am receiving or have received at Nunez is or has been satisfactory.	○	○	○	○	○
b. In general, the quality of instruction I am receiving or have received at Nunez is or has met my needs and/or expectations.	○	○	○	○	○
c. I feel that the career training I am receiving here or have received will give me the knowledge and skills I need to be successful.	○	○	○	○	○
d. I feel that the career training I have received or am receiving here will help me find employment.	○	○	○	○	○

8. What is the highest level of education obtained by your parents?
   - ○ Did not graduate from high school
   - ○ High school diploma or equivalent (GED)
   - ○ Vocational certificate
   - ○ Associate degree
   - ○ Bachelor's degree
   - ○ Master's degree
   - ○ Ph.D. or Ed.D.

9. How important is each of the following issues regarding your immediate and extended family (i.e., spouse, children, parents, siblings, etc.)? Please fill in the bubble that best represents your response.

Item	Not at All Important	Not Very Important	Fairly Important	Very Important	Extremely Important
a. Education and achievement	○	○	○	○	○
b. Respect for family members	○	○	○	○	○
c. Desire for material possessions	○	○	○	○	○
d. A belief in the value of hard work	○	○	○	○	○
e. Ashamed to be dependent on public assistance	○	○	○	○	○
f. Responsible about carrying out obligations	○	○	○	○	○
g. Maintenance of family values	○	○	○	○	○
h. Maintenance of family traditions	○	○	○	○	○

10. While you have been or were completing your program of study, to what extent do you feel that the tutoring, workshops, and labs provided by Nunez facilitated your learning experience?
   ○ Not at all
   ○ Very little
   ○ Somewhat
   ○ Greatly
   ○ Extensively
   ○ N/A

11. While you have been or were completing your program of study, to what extent do you feel that Nunez provided state-of-the-art lab and training equipment that prepared you to be competitive in your field?
   ○ Not at all
   ○ Very little
   ○ Somewhat
   ○ Greatly
   ○ Extensively
   ○ N/A

12. While you have been or were completing your program of study, how often were you given opportunities to build a network of professional contacts (including peers, mentors, employers, and so on) at Nunez?
   ○ Never
   ○ Rarely
   ○ Occasionally
   ○ Frequently
   ○ Very frequently
   ○ N/A

13. While you have been or were completing your program of study, how engaged were you in lab simulations (e.g., student café, simulated hotel, and simulated business) during your enrollment at Nunez?
   ○ Not at all
   ○ Very little
   ○ Somewhat
   ○ Greatly
   ○ Extensively
   ○ N/A

14. How did you hear about the program in which you are currently enrolled or were enrolled? (Select all that apply)
    ○ Advertisements (such as TV, radio, newspaper, online ads, or billboards)
    ○ News or media reports (such as TV interviews, news releases, or a story in the paper)
    ○ Newsletter from the program
    ○ Newsletter from a company or trade union/association
    ○ Social media or social networking (such as Facebook, Twitter, LinkedIn, YouTube, blogs, or RSS feeds)
    ○ E-mail (such as through a listserv)
    ○ College or program website
    ○ Other websites (such as a workforce/unemployment center)
    ○ Program brochures, flyers, postcards, or posters
    ○ Online search I initiated
    ○ Community events (including college, career, or employment fairs)
    ○ From family and friends
    ○ From workforce center staff (such as job counselor, social services, or public assistance programs)
    ○ From employers/potential employers
    ○ Personal contact with college faculty or staff

Experience with Faculty Advising Services

To support student success in academic learning, your college assigns a faculty advisor (most likely, an instructor in the program) to support your individual learning needs. We would like to learn more about your interactions and experiences with your faculty advisor since enrollment.

15. Did you meet with your faculty advisor at all after enrollment?
    ○ I know nothing about the faculty advisor.
    ○ I do not/did not have a faculty advisor assigned to me.
    ○ I know I have/had a faculty advisor, but I have not met/did not meet with him/her.
    ○ I have met with my faculty advisor.

16. If you **met** with your faculty advisor, did you talk to him/her about planning for your courses?
    ○ Yes
    ○ No

17. How likely was it that you would go to your faculty advisor for advice and support in the following situations at the **beginning** of the semester? Please feel in the bubble that best represents your response.

Item	Definitely Not	Probably Not	It Depends	Probably Yes	Definitely Yes	Does Not Apply
If you have **personal problems** (e.g., family problems, financial problems, child care issues, or transportation issues)	○	○	○	○	○	○
If you have problems with your **course work**	○	○	○	○	○	○
If you have problems with your **instructors**	○	○	○	○	○	○

18. How likely is/was it that you would go to your faculty advisor for advice and support in the following situations at the **end** of the semester? Please feel in the bubble that best represents your response.

Item	Definitely Not	Probably Not	It Depends	Probably Yes	Definitely Yes	Does Not Apply
If you have **personal problems** (e.g., family problems, financial problems, child care issues, or transportation issues)	○	○	○	○	○	○
If you have problems with your **course work**	○	○	○	○	○	○
If you have problems with your **instructors**	○	○	○	○	○	○

19. Overall, how would you rate the quality of the faculty advising services you have received?
    ○ Very poor
    ○ Poor
    ○ Fair
    ○ Good
    ○ Excellent

20. Overall, how satisfied are you with the frequency of the faculty advising services you have received?
    ○ Very dissatisfied
    ○ Somewhat dissatisfied
    ○ Neither satisfied or dissatisfied
    ○ Somewhat satisfied
    ○ Very satisfied

21. What would you like to see differently in terms of faculty advising services offered for students like you? Select all that apply and describe if needed.
    ○ I wish my faculty advisor would reach out/would have reached out to me more often.
    ○ I wish I would have reached out to my faculty advisor more often.
    ○ None of the above (i.e., I am satisfied with the services I have received from my faculty advisor.)
    ○ Other (please specify): _____

22. What is/was your living arrangement while enrolled in your program of study at Nunez?
    - ○ Own house/apartment/townhouse/condominium
    - ○ Rental house/apartment/townhouse/condominium
    - ○ Government-assisted housing
    - ○ Parents' house
    - ○ Homeless
    - ○ Other (please specify): _____

23. How supportive was your family of your decision to continue your education?
    - ○ Very unsupportive
    - ○ Somewhat unsupportive
    - ○ Neutral
    - ○ Somewhat supportive
    - ○ Very supportive

24. To what extent do you or did you struggle with securing support or resources for child care so that you can/could attend classes while enrolled at Nunez?
    - ○ Child care is/was always an issue for me.
    - ○ Child care is/was sometimes an issue for me.
    - ○ Child care is/was rarely an issue for me.
    - ○ Child care is/was never an issue for me.
    - ○ I do not have children.

25. To what extent do you or did you struggle with securing transportation to school while enrolled at Nunez?
    - ○ Transportation is/was always a struggle for me.
    - ○ Transportation is/was sometimes a struggle for me.
    - ○ Transportation is/was rarely a struggle for me.
    - ○ Transportation is/was never a struggle for me.

26. Is/was there anything else in your life that may be making/have made it hard for you to complete your program of study while enrolled at Nunez?
    - ○ Yes
    - ○ No

27. If yes, please list the issues that may be making/have made it difficult for you to complete your program.

28. Overall, how would you rate the quality of your education/training program?
   - ◯ Very poor
   - ◯ Poor
   - ◯ Fair
   - ◯ Good
   - ◯ Excellent

29. Overall, how satisfied are you with your education/training program?
   - ◯ Very dissatisfied
   - ◯ Somewhat dissatisfied
   - ◯ Neither satisfied or dissatisfied
   - ◯ Somewhat satisfied
   - ◯ Very satisfied

30. How likely are you to recommend your education/training program to your friends and prospective students?
   - ◯ Very unlikely
   - ◯ Unlikely
   - ◯ Neither likely or unlikely
   - ◯ Likely
   - ◯ Very likely

Thank you so much for completing this survey! We appreciate your time and assistance!

APPENDIX B-1: SUMMER 2015 HYBRIDIZED STUDENT ENTRANCE AND EXIT SURVEY SUMMARY

Summer 2015 Student Entrance and Exit Survey Summary

During the Summer 2015 semester, students enrolled in one of three programs of study: (1) business administration, (2) entrepreneurship/small business management, and (3) hotel, restaurant, and tourism [HRT] administration at Nunez Community College that are being funded by the Trade Adjustment Assistance Community College and Career Training (TAACCCT) grant. These students were asked to participate in a hybridized Student Entrance and Exit Survey, which asked students about their perceptions, expectations, and experiences with their programs of study as well as potential challenges they might have been facing with regard to program completion and persistence. A summary of the data provided by students enrolled in these three TAACCCT-funded programs is presented in the following tables.

Overall, the majority of respondents expressed high aspirations concerning their education, identifying themselves as full-time students (75%) with the intention of obtaining at least an associate's degree (75%) despite being mostly first generation college students (i.e., 55% came from families in which the highest level of education for the parents was high school). Survey respondents reported that they were predominantly unemployed while attending Nunez (60%), with 55% indicating that they remained unemployed during the term. Regardless of being first generation college students, all of the survey respondents (100%) reported that their families consider education and achievement to be at least fairly important. Other values that students considered important by members of their families were respect for one's family members (100%), hard work (100%), carrying out one's obligations (100%), and maintaining family values (100%) and traditions (80%). A smaller percentage of students indicated that their family values also include a desire for material possessions (65%) and a sense of shame concerning reliance upon public assistance (63%).

Survey Items	n	%
Are/were you classified as a full-time student or as a part-time student?	**20**	
Full-time student	15	75.0
Part-time student	5	25.0
What educational outcomes do/did you expect to achieve as a result of attending Nunez Community College? Select one that describes your most important goal.	**20**	
Earn some credits	2	10.0
Earn a certificate or multiple certificates	2	10.0
Earn a diploma	1	5.0
Earn an associate's degree (with or without certificates)	13	65.0
Earn a bachelor's degree or higher	2	10.0

Survey Items	n	%
What is/was your employment situation while enrolled in your program of study?	**20**	
Not employed	12	60.0
Employed part-time in a business management or HRT administration field	--	--
Employed full-time in a business management or HRT administration field	4	20.0
Employed part-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration	2	10.0
Employed full-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration	2	10.0
Own my own business	--	--
What is your current employment situation?	**20**	
Not employed	11	55.0
Employed part-time in a business management or HRT administration field	--	--
Employed full-time in a business management or HRT administration field	3	15.0
Employed part-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration	4	20.0
Employed full-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration	2	10.0
Own my own business	--	--
What is the highest level of education obtained by your parents?	**20**	
Did not graduate from high school	3	15.0
High school diploma or equivalent (GED)	8	40.0
Vocational certificate	3	15.0
Associate degree	3	15.0
Bachelor's degree	3	15.0
Master's degree	--	--
Ph.D. or Ed.D.	--	--
How important is each of the following issues regarding your immediate and extended family?		
Education and achievement	**20**	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	2	10.0
Very important	4	20.0
Extremely important	14	70.0

Survey Items	n	%
Respect for family members	**20**	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	2	10.0
Very important	6	30.0
Extremely important	12	60.0
Desire for material possessions	**20**	
Not at all important	1	5.0
Not very important	6	30.0
Fairly important	9	45.0
Very important	2	10.0
Extremely important	2	10.0
A belief in the value of hard work	**20**	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	1	5.0
Very important	6	30.0
Extremely important	13	65.0
Ashamed to be dependent on public assistance	**19**	
Not at all important	3	15.8
Not very important	4	21.1
Fairly important	7	36.8
Very important	1	5.3
Extremely important	4	21.1
Responsible for carrying out obligations	**20**	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--

Survey Items	n	%
Fairly important	1	5.0
Very important	2	10.0
Extremely important	17	85.0
Maintenance of family values	**20**	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	3	15.0
Very important	5	25.0
Extremely important	12	60.0
Maintenance of family traditions	**20**	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	4	20.0
Fairly important	3	15.0
Very important	3	15.0
Extremely important	10	50.0

Perhaps contradictory to the importance that students reported that their families place upon education and achievement, only 75% of respondents indicated that they feel their families support their decision to continue their education beyond a high school diploma or GED. While still a significant majority, the disparity between these data stands out given that almost half (45%) of the students surveyed reported that they are either currently living at home with their parents or lived with their parents while enrolled in their program of study at Nunez. As such, a lack of parental support could have negative implications for students' educational aspirations. Apart from housing, students indicated that they are relatively independent, with only 8% reporting that they struggle in securing support and resources for child care so that they can attend classes. Although, multiple respondents (40%) indicated that they experience at least some challenges in securing transportation to school.

Survey Items	n	%
How supportive was your family of your decision to continue your education?	**20**	
Very unsupportive	2	10.0
Somewhat unsupportive	1	5.0
Neutral	2	10.0
Somewhat supportive	3	15.0
Very supportive	12	60.0
What is/was your living arrangement while enrolled in your program of study at Nunez?	**20**	
Own house/apartment	2	10.0
Rental house/apartment	7	35.0
Government-assisted housing	1	5.0
Parents' house	9	45.0
Homeless	--	--
Other	1	5.0
• *With my girlfriend and her family*		
To what extent do/did you struggle with securing support or resources for child care so that you can/could attend classes while enrolled at Nunez?	**20**	
Child care is always an issue for me.	2	2.8
Child care is sometimes an issue for me.	3	5.6
Child care is rarely an issue for me.	--	--
Child care is never an issue for me.	6	30.0
I do not have children.	9	45.0
To what extent do/did you struggle with securing transportation to school while enrolled at Nunez?	**20**	
Transportation is always a struggle for me.	2	10.0
Transportation is sometimes a struggle for me.	6	30.0
Transportation is rarely a struggle for me.	3	15.0
Transportation is never a struggle for me.	9	45.0

Many survey participants (44%) reported having learned about the programs of study in which they are enrolled through online means, such as Nunez's official school website (26%), independent online searches that they initiated (12%), and e-mail correspondence (7%). A significant portion of students (35%) also revealed that interpersonal networking was a pervasive means by which they had heard

about educational opportunities at Nunez, specifically through family and friends (14%), workforce center and staff (5%), employers and/or potential employers (5%), and college faculty and staff (12%). In addition, several survey respondents (7%) indicated that they had heard about their program of study through local advertisements.

Survey Item	n	%
How did you hear about the programs in which you are currently enrolled or were enrolled? *(Select all that apply)*	43	
Advertisements	3	7.0
News or media reports	1	2.3
Newsletter from the program	--	--
Newsletter from a company or trade union/association	--	--
Social media or social networking	1	2.3
E-mail	3	7.0
College or program website	11	25.6
Other websites	--	--
Program brochures, flyers, postcards, or posters	1	2.3
Online search I initiated	5	11.6
Community events	3	7.0
From family and friends	6	14.0
From workforce center staff	2	4.7
From employers/potential employers	2	4.7
Personal contact with college faculty or staff	5	11.6

Students expressed primarily positive perceptions concerning the instruction and career training they were being offered at Nunez. All of the respondents (100%) described their programs of study as at least "*fair*" in terms of the overall quality, with most reporting satisfaction with the quality of instruction they have received (80%) and the training programs as a whole (85%), indicating that they were likely to recommend the programs of study at Nunez to friends and prospective students (85%). Most of the survey participants also expressed the opinion that the instruction and career training offered has met their needs and expectations (75%), has given them the knowledge and skills necessary to be successful (80%), and will ultimately help them find employment (75%).

Furthermore, the majority of students (80%) reported having had opportunities to build a network of professional contacts at least on an occasional basis. Most of the respondents (65%) indicated that the tutoring, workshops, and labs provided by Nunez have helped

facilitate their learning experiences, and 70% agreed that they have been provided with state-of-the-art lab and training equipment, preparing them to be competitive in their fields. Thus far, however, only half (50%) of the survey participants indicated that they have been at least moderately engaged in lab simulations (e.g., the student café, simulated hotel, and simulated class business).

Survey Items	n	%
Please indicate your level of agreement with each of the following statements based on your own experiences during your training.		
The quality of instruction I have received at Nunez Community College is or has been satisfactory.	20	
Strongly disagree	2	10.0
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	2	10.0
Agree	10	50.0
Strongly agree	6	30.0
In general, the quality of instruction I have received at Nunez Community College is meeting or has met my needs and/or expectations.	20	
Strongly disagree	2	10.0
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	3	15.0
Agree	9	45.0
Strongly agree	6	30.0
I feel that the career training I am receiving here or have received will give me or has given me the knowledge and skills I need to be successful.	20	
Strongly disagree	2	10.0
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	2	10.0
Agree	10	50.0
Strongly agree	6	30.0
I feel that the career training I have received or am receiving here will help me find employment.	20	
Strongly disagree	2	10.0
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	3	15.0

Survey Items	n	%
Agree	9	45.0
Strongly agree	6	30.0
While you have been or were completing your program of study, to what extent do you feel that the tutoring, workshops, and labs provided by Nunez Community College facilitated your learning experience?	**20**	
Not at all	--	--
Very little	2	10.0
Somewhat	6	30.0
Greatly	3	15.0
Extensively	5	25.0
N/A	4	20.0
While you have been or were completing your program of study, to what extent do you feel that Nunez Community College provided state-of-the-art lab and training equipment that prepared you to be competitive in your field?	**20**	
Not at all	--	--
Very little	3	15.0
Somewhat	4	20.0
Greatly	8	40.0
Extensively	2	10.0
N/A	3	15.0
While you have been or were completing your program of study, how often were you given opportunities to build a network of professional contacts (including peers, mentors, employers, and so on) at Nunez?	**20**	
Never	1	5.0
Rarely	2	10.0
Occasionally	7	35.0
Frequently	6	30.0
Very frequently	3	15.0
N/A	1	5.0

Survey Items	n	%
While you have been or were completing your program of study, how engaged were you been in lab simulations (e.g., student café, simulated hotel, and simulated business) during your enrollment at Nunez Community College?	**20**	
Not at all engaged	4	20.0
Slightly engaged	3	15.0
Moderately engaged	3	15.0
Very engaged	4	20.0
Extremely engaged	1	5.0
N/A	5	25.0
Overall, how would you rate the quality of your education/training program?	**20**	
Very poor	--	--
Poor	--	--
Fair	4	20.0
Good	9	45.0
Excellent	7	35.0
Overall, how satisfied are you with your education/training program?	**20**	
Very dissatisfied	--	--
Somewhat dissatisfied	--	--
Neither satisfied or dissatisfied	3	15.0
Somewhat satisfied	7	35.0
Very satisfied	10	50.0
How likely are you to recommend your education/training program to your friends and prospective students?	**20**	
Very unlikely	--	--
Unlikely	--	--
Neither likely or unlikely	3	15.0
Likely	7	35.0
Very likely	10	50.0

Most of the students (70%) reported having met with their faculty advisors prior to completing this survey, and 93% of those specified that these meetings focused primarily on planning and preparing for courses in their programs of study. Survey participants predominantly indicated that they were likely to approach their faculty advisors for assistance if they had any concerns regarding their instructors (65%) or coursework (55%) at the beginning of the semester, but reported that they were far less likely to approach their advisor regarding issues related to personal problems (20%). By the end of the semester, these numbers fluctuated with students indicating that they were slightly less likely to seek out their advisors concerning issues with their instructors (55%) or coursework (45%), but were slightly more likely to approach their advisors about personal problems (25%). Students' reluctance to discuss personal issues with their advisors could bear negative implications for their persistence and retention, as a significant portion of the survey respondents (32%) reported that they are facing other challenges in their life beyond those addressed in this survey which may make it difficult for them to successfully complete their programs of study. Students conveyed that such challenges include financial difficulties and stress resulting balancing their personal, academic, and professional lives. One participant, for example, explained, "I'm a full-time manager, so working 60 hours a week and coming to class at 7 a.m. on my days off has been very difficult. I need to make enough money to pay my bills, and it affects my studies." Others expressed similar sentiments, such as one respondent who commented, "We have busy lives, and trying to find time to complete my coursework and get to class can be really hard."

Survey Items	n	%
Did you meet with your faculty advisor at all after enrollment?	20	
I know nothing about the faculty advisor	1	5.0
I do not have a faculty advisor assigned to me	--	--
I know I have a faculty advisor, but I have not met with him/her yet	5	25.0
I have met with my faculty advisor	14	70.0
If you *met* with your faculty advisor, did you talk to him/her about planning for your courses?	14	
Yes	13	92.9
No	1	7.1
How likely was it that you would go to your faculty advisor for advice and support in the following situations at the beginning of the semester?		
Personal Problems	20	
Definitely not	5	25.0
Probably not	7	35.0
It depends	3	15.0
Probably yes	2	10.0

Survey Items	n	%
Definitely yes	2	10.0
Does not apply	1	5.0
Problems with Your Coursework	**20**	
Definitely not	1	5.0
Probably not	2	10.0
It depends	6	30.0
Probably yes	6	30.0
Definitely yes	5	25.0
Does not apply	--	--
Problems with Your Instructors	**20**	
Definitely not	2	10.0
Probably not	1	5.0
It depends	3	15.0
Probably yes	8	40.0
Definitely yes	5	25.0
Does not apply	1	5.0
How likely was it that you would go to your faculty advisor for advice and support in the following situations at the end of the semester?		
Personal Problems	**20**	
Definitely not	4	20.0
Probably not	7	35.0
It depends	3	15.0
Probably yes	4	20.0
Definitely yes	1	5.0
Does not apply	1	5.0
Problems with Your Coursework	**20**	
Definitely not	1	5.0
Probably not	5	25.0
It depends	5	25.0
Probably yes	6	30.0

Survey Items	n	%
Definitely yes	3	15.0
Does not apply	--	--
Problems with Your Instructors	20	
Definitely not	2	10.0
Probably not	3	15.0
It depends	3	15.0
Probably yes	8	40.0
Definitely yes	3	15.0
Does not apply	1	5.0
Overall, how would you rate the quality of the faculty advising services you have received?	20	
Very poor	--	--
Poor	3	15.0
Fair	4	20.0
Good	7	35.0
Excellent	6	30.0
Overall, how satisfied are you with the faculty advising services you have received?	20	
Very dissatisfied	--	--
Somewhat dissatisfied	1	5.0
Neither satisfied or dissatisfied	8	40.0
Somewhat satisfied	1	5.0
Very satisfied	10	50.0
Is/was there anything else in your life that may be making/have made it hard for you to complete your program of study while enrolled at Nunez?	19	
Yes	6	31.6
No	13	68.4

APPENDIX B-2: SPRING 2016 HYBRIDIZED STUDENT ENTRANCE AND EXIT SURVEY SUMMARY

Spring 2016 Student Entrance and Exit Survey Summary

During the Spring 2016 semester, students enrolled in or exited from one of three programs of study: (1) business administration, (2) entrepreneurship/small business management, and (3) hotel, restaurant, and tourism [HRT] administration at Nunez Community College that are being funded by the Trade Adjustment Assistance Community College and Career Training (TAACCCT) grant. These students were asked to participate in a hybridized Student Entrance and Exit Survey, which asked students about their perceptions, expectations, and experiences with their programs of study as well as potential challenges they might have been facing with regard to program completion and persistence. Twenty-two students responded to the survey. A summary of the data provided by students enrolled in these three TAACCCT-funded programs is presented in the following tables.

A majority of survey respondents identified themselves as being enrolled or having been enrolled full-time in their programs of study (82%), and all respondents reported having enrolled with the intention of obtaining at least an associate's degree (100%) despite being mostly first generation college students (i.e., 50% of respondents shared that they come from families in which the highest level of education for the parents was high school, and 18% of respondents reported coming from families in which their parents never obtained a high school diploma or equivalent [GED]). For the most part, survey participants indicated having been employed while enrolled at Nunez Community College (73%), many of whom reported that they were employed full-time (41%).

Despite many students having reported being the first member of their family to attend college, all survey respondents (100%) indicated that their families believe education and achievement are at least fairly important. Students also communicated that their families place high value on having and showing respect for one's family members (100%), working hard (100%), fulfilling obligations and commitments (100%), and maintaining family values (100%) and traditions (91%). Additionally, many survey respondents also shared that their family values include a desire for material possessions and wealth (64%), as well as a sense of shame associated with reliance upon public assistance (64%).

Survey Items	n	%
Are/were you classified as a full-time student or as a part-time student?	**22**	
Full-time student	18	81.8
Part-time student	4	18.2

Survey Items	n	%
What educational outcomes do/did you expect to achieve as a result of attending Nunez Community College? Select one that describes your most important goal.	**20**	
Earn some credits	--	--
Earn a certificate or multiple certificates	--	--
Earn a diploma	--	--
Earn an associate's degree (with or without certificates)	18	90.0
Earn a bachelor's degree or higher	2	10.0
What is/was your employment situation while enrolled in your program of study?	**22**	
Not employed	6	27.3
Employed part-time in a business management or HRT administration field	2	9.1
Employed full-time in a business management or HRT administration field	2	9.1
Employed part-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration	4	18.2
Employed full-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration	7	31.8
Own my own business	1	4.5
What is your current employment situation?	**22**	
Not employed	7	31.8
Employed part-time in a business management or HRT administration field	1	4.5
Employed full-time in a business management or HRT administration field	2	9.1
Employed part-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration	4	18.2
Employed full-time in a field other than business management or HRT administration	6	27.3
Own my own business	2	9.1
What is the highest level of education obtained by your parents?	**22**	
Did not graduate from high school	4	18.2
High school diploma or equivalent (GED)	11	50.0
Vocational certificate	3	13.6
Associate degree	2	9.1
Bachelor's degree	1	4.5
Master's degree	--	--
Ph.D. or Ed.D.	1	4.5

Survey Items	n	%
How important is each of the following issues regarding your immediate and extended family?		
Education and achievement	22	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	3	13.6
Very important	3	13.6
Extremely important	16	72.7
Respect for family members	22	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	1	4.5
Very important	8	36.4
Extremely important	13	59.1
Desire for material possessions	22	
Not at all important	1	4.5
Not very important	7	31.8
Fairly important	9	40.9
Very important	2	9.1
Extremely important	3	13.6
A belief in the value of hard work	22	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	1	4.5
Very important	5	22.7
Extremely important	16	72.7

Survey Items	n	%
Ashamed to be dependent on public assistance	22	
Not at all important	3	13.6
Not very important	5	22.7
Fairly important	5	22.7
Very important	5	22.7
Extremely important	4	18.2
Responsible for carrying out obligations	22	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	1	4.5
Very important	6	27.3
Extremely important	15	68.2
Maintenance of family values	22	
Not at all important	--	--
Not very important	--	--
Fairly important	1	4.5
Very important	5	22.7
Extremely important	16	72.7
Maintenance of family traditions	22	
Not at all important	1	4.5
Not very important	1	4.5
Fairly important	6	27.3
Very important	3	13.6
Extremely important	11	50.0

Fitting with the high degree of importance that students indicated their families associate education and achievement, 77% of respondents indicated that they feel their families have been very supportive of their decision to continue their education beyond a high school diploma or GED. Survey participants appear to be relatively autonomous, with 32% of respondents indicating that they own their own home or apartment and 36% of respondents sharing that they independently rent. Most students (82%) also reported that they

rarely or never struggle in securing transportation to and from their classes, and 81% of survey respondents shared that child care is not a recurring obstacle to their education.

Survey Items	n	%
How supportive was your family of your decision to continue your education?	**22**	
Very unsupportive	3	13.6
Somewhat unsupportive	--	--
Neutral	2	9.1
Somewhat supportive	--	--
Very supportive	17	77.3
What is/was your living arrangement while enrolled in your program of study at Nunez?	**22**	
Own house/apartment	7	31.8
Rental house/apartment	8	36.4
Government-assisted housing	--	--
Parents' house	6	27.3
Homeless	--	--
Other	1	4.5
• *"I live with my boyfriend and his family pays our bills."*		
To what extent do/did you struggle with securing support or resources for child care so that you can/could attend classes while enrolled at Nunez?	**21**	
Child care is always an issue for me.	2	9.5
Child care is sometimes an issue for me.	2	9.5
Child care is rarely an issue for me.	4	19.0
Child care is never an issue for me.	5	23.8
I do not have children.	8	38.1
To what extent do/did you struggle with securing transportation to school while enrolled at Nunez?	**22**	
Transportation is always a struggle for me.	1	4.5
Transportation is sometimes a struggle for me.	3	13.6
Transportation is rarely a struggle for me.	8	36.4
Transportation is never a struggle for me.	10	45.5

Survey participants reported that Nunez Community College's website was the primary means by which they learned about their programs of study (31%), followed by personal contact with college faculty or staff (23%), recommendations from family and/or friends (15%), and independent online searches (10%). Students also indicated having heard about Nunez Community College's TAACCCT project through program brochures, flyers, postcards, or posters (8%), community events (5%), referrals from workforce center staff (3%) or employers (3%), and advertisements (3%). Altogether, Nunez's Community College's online presence account for 41% of these responses, whereas general word of mouth and recommendations accounted for 44% and marketing and outreach for 16%.

Survey Item	n	%
How did you hear about the programs in which you are currently enrolled or were enrolled? *(Select all that apply)*	39	
Advertisements	1	2.6
News or media reports	--	--
Newsletter from the program	--	--
Newsletter from a company or trade union/association	--	--
Social media or social networking	--	--
E-mail	--	--
College or program website	12	30.8
Other websites	--	--
Program brochures, flyers, postcards, or posters	3	7.7
Online search I initiated	4	10.3
Community events	2	5.1
From family and friends	6	15.4
From workforce center staff	1	2.6
From employers/potential employers	1	2.6
Personal contact with college faculty or staff	9	23.1

Students shared predominantly positive feedback regarding the instruction and career training they have received at Nunez Community College. Most survey respondents (96%) expressed agreement that the quality of instruction they have received at Nunez has been satisfactory and has met their needs, and all respondents shared the perspective that the career training that they have received has given (or will give) them the knowledge and skills necessary to be successful in their fields. The majority of students (91%) also indicated

being optimistic concerning opportunities for future employment, expressing the belief that the career training they have received at Nunez will help them effectively transition from students to professionals.

Additionally, many students (55%) reported having had opportunities to build a network of professional contacts at least on an occasional basis. Most students (59%) also reported that the tutoring, workshops, and labs provided by Nunez have helped facilitate their learning experiences, with 64% of survey participants expressing agreement that they have been provided with state-of-the-art lab and training equipment that has prepared them to be competitive in their fields. However, less than half of respondents (41%) indicated having made frequent use of these resources (e.g., the student café, simulated hotel, and simulated class business).

Survey Items	n	%
Please indicate your level of agreement with each of the following statements based on your own experiences during your training.		
The quality of instruction I have received at Nunez Community College is or has been satisfactory.	22	
Strongly disagree	--	--
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	1	4.5
Agree	8	36.4
Strongly agree	13	59.1
In general, the quality of instruction I have received at Nunez Community College is meeting or has met my needs and/or expectations.	22	
Strongly disagree	--	--
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	1	4.5
Agree	8	36.4
Strongly agree	13	59.1
I feel that the career training I am receiving here or have received will give me or has given me the knowledge and skills I need to be successful.	22	
Strongly disagree	--	--
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	--	--
Agree	9	40.9
Strongly agree	13	59.1

Survey Items	n	%
I feel that the career training I have received or am receiving here will help me find employment.	22	
Strongly disagree	--	--
Disagree	--	--
Neither agree or disagree	2	9.1
Agree	9	40.9
Strongly agree	11	50.0
While you have been or were completing your program of study, to what extent do you feel that the tutoring, workshops, and labs provided by Nunez Community College facilitated your learning experience?	22	
Not at all	--	--
Very little	--	--
Somewhat	4	18.2
Greatly	11	50.0
Extensively	2	9.1
N/A	5	22.7
While you have been or were completing your program of study, to what extent do you feel that Nunez Community College provided state-of-the-art lab and training equipment that prepared you to be competitive in your field?	22	
Not at all	--	--
Very little	--	--
Somewhat	3	13.6
Greatly	9	40.9
Extensively	5	22.7
N/A	5	22.7

Survey Items	n	%
While you have been or were completing your program of study, how often were you given opportunities to build a network of professional contacts (including peers, mentors, employers, and so on) at Nunez?	**22**	
Never	--	--
Rarely	3	13.6
Occasionally	7	31.8
Frequently	6	27.3
Very frequently	6	27.3
N/A	--	--
While you have been or were completing your program of study, how engaged were you been in lab simulations (e.g., student café, simulated hotel, and simulated business) during your enrollment at Nunez Community College?	**22**	
Not at all engaged	2	9.1
Slightly engaged	3	13.6
Moderately engaged	5	22.7
Very engaged	7	31.8
Extremely engaged	2	9.1
N/A	3	13.6
Overall, how would you rate the quality of your education/training program?	**22**	
Very poor	--	--
Poor	--	--
Fair	2	9.1
Good	10	45.5
Excellent	10	45.5
Overall, how satisfied are you with your education/training program?	**22**	
Very dissatisfied	--	--
Somewhat dissatisfied	--	--
Neither satisfied or dissatisfied	--	--
Somewhat satisfied	7	31.8
Very satisfied	15	68.2

Survey Items	n	%
How likely are you to recommend your education/training program to your friends and prospective students?	**22**	
Very unlikely	--	--
Unlikely	--	--
Neither likely or unlikely	1	4.5
Likely	8	36.4
Very likely	13	59.1

Most of the students (70%) reported having met with their faculty advisors prior to completing this survey, and 93% of those specified that these meetings focused primarily on planning and preparing for courses in their programs of study. Survey participants predominantly indicated that they were likely to approach their faculty advisors for assistance if they had any concerns regarding their instructors (65%) or coursework (55%) at the beginning of the semester, but reported that they were far less likely to approach their advisor regarding issues related to personal problems (20%). By the end of the semester, these numbers fluctuated with students indicating that they were slightly less likely to seek out their advisors concerning issues with their instructors (55%) or coursework (45%), but were slightly more likely to approach their advisors about personal problems (25%). Students' reluctance to discuss personal issues with their advisors could bear negative implications for their persistence and retention, as a significant portion of the survey respondents (32%) reported that they are facing other challenges in their life beyond those addressed in this survey which may make it difficult for them to successfully complete their programs of study. Students conveyed that such challenges include financial difficulties and stress resulting balancing their personal, academic, and professional lives. One participant, for example, explained, "I'm a full-time manager, so working 60 hours a week and coming to class at 7 a.m. on my days off has been very difficult. I need to make enough money to pay my bills, and it affects my studies." Others expressed similar sentiments, such as one respondent who commented, "We have busy lives, and trying to find time to complete my coursework and get to class can be really hard."

Survey Items	n	%
Did you meet with your faculty advisor at all after enrollment?	**21**	
I know nothing about the faculty advisor	2	9.5
I do not have a faculty advisor assigned to me	3	14.3
I know I have a faculty advisor, but I have not met with him/her yet	1	4.8
I have met with my faculty advisor	15	71.4

Survey Items	n	%
If you _met_ with your faculty advisor, did you talk to him/her about planning for your courses?	19	
Yes	15	78.9
No	4	21.1
How likely was it that you would go to your faculty advisor for advice and support in the following situations at the beginning of the semester?		
Personal Problems	22	
Definitely not	3	13.6
Probably not	7	31.8
It depends	4	18.2
Probably yes	5	22.7
Definitely yes	3	13.6
Does not apply	--	--
Problems with Your Coursework	21	
Definitely not	--	--
Probably not	3	14.3
It depends	3	14.3
Probably yes	2	9.5
Definitely yes	13	61.9
Does not apply	--	--
Problems with Your Instructors	21	
Definitely not	--	--
Probably not	2	9.5
It depends	6	28.6
Probably yes	3	14.3
Definitely yes	10	47.6
Does not apply	--	--

Survey Items	n	%
How likely was it that you would go to your faculty advisor for advice and support in the following situations at the end of the semester?		
Personal Problems	22	
Definitely not	2	9.1
Probably not	6	27.3
It depends	6	27.3
Probably yes	4	18.2
Definitely yes	4	18.2
Does not apply	--	--
Problems with Your Coursework	21	
Definitely not	--	--
Probably not	5	23.8
It depends	2	9.5
Probably yes	1	4.8
Definitely yes	13	61.9
Does not apply	--	--
Problems with Your Instructors	21	
Definitely not	1	4.8
Probably not	3	14.3
It depends	5	23.8
Probably yes	1	4.8
Definitely yes	11	52.4
Does not apply	--	--
Overall, how would you rate the quality of the faculty advising services you have received?	21	
Very poor	--	--
Poor	--	--
Fair	4	19.0
Good	8	38.1
Excellent	9	42.9

Survey Items	n	%
Overall, how satisfied are you with the frequency of the faculty advising services you have received?	**22**	
Very dissatisfied	--	--
Somewhat dissatisfied	--	--
Neither satisfied or dissatisfied	2	9.1
Somewhat satisfied	4	18.2
Very satisfied	16	72.7
What would you like to see differently in terms of faculty advising services offered to students like you?	**22**	
I wish my faculty advisor would reach out/would have reached out to me more often.	3	13.6
I wish I would have reached out to my faculty advisor more often.	2	9.1
None of the above (i.e., I am satisfied with the services I have received from my faculty advisor.)	14	63.6
Other	3	13.6

- *"Didn't know I had one."*
- *"Grading assignments faster (some teachers)."*
- *"I wish my adviser could be an adviser to all Nunez students. She is a wonderful and understanding person."*

Is/was there anything else in your life that may be making/have made it hard for you to complete your program of study while enrolled at Nunez?	**22**	
Yes	7	31.8
No	15	68.2

APPENDIX C: STUDENT GROUP INTERVIEW PROTOCOL

NUNEZ COMMUNITY COLLEGE TAACCCT PROJECT
STUDENT GROUP INTERVIEW PROTOCOL

[Introduce yourself to the Nunez students and explain that you work for McREL, the external evaluator of the Nunez Community College TAACCCT project.]

Nunez Community College received a grant from the U.S. Department of Labor to expand and improve career training programs in business administration; entrepreneurship/small business management; and hotel, restaurant, and tourism (HRT) administration. I am talking to you today to gather your feedback and insights about your experiences as a student enrolled in one of these programs of study during this past school year. Nunez's staff plans to use findings from interviews with students like you to improve activities and help describe the impact of the Nunez TAACCCT grant and the programs of study it supports.

When McREL evaluators report the findings from these interviews, the information will be combined for all individuals and no one will be identified by name. However, because this is a group interview, I cannot guarantee confidentiality for what you say as you are all going to hear it. Although, I would ask that each of you keep what you hear in this room to yourself.

I will be audio recording our discussion today. The only person who will hear the discussion, other than myself, will be the transcriptionist. Once the transcript is completed, we will erase the recording.

I want to reiterate that we are conducting this interview today so you can share your perceptions of **Nunez Community College's TAACCCT-funded programs of study, courses, and instructors.** It is very important that we remain focused on your experiences with only the TAACCCT grant. Do you have any questions before I start the interview? *(Answer any questions that they may have.)* Okay, I'll turn on the recorder now and we'll begin. Please keep in mind that you may have different perceptions and opinions, and that's okay. I want to hear all of your thoughts.

INTRODUCTION QUESTIONS

1. First off, which programs of study are/were you enrolled in and when are you scheduled to graduate/did you graduate? *(Probe: If they have just been taking certain classes, find out which ones those were.)*

2. What made you decide to enroll at Nunez? How did you select your program of study? *(Probe to see if students were connected to the TAACCCT grant through a workforce center. If a workforce center was involved, probe to see if that support was helpful.)*

COMPONENT QUESTIONS

Now, I'd like to spend some time talking about your experiences with different components of your programs of study and courses.

3. How have the faculty advisors supported you? (*Probe for the frequency and the nature of the meetings, as well as the type of support being provided.*)

   a. Do you feel that you get the support you need from your faculty advisor? Why or why not? (*Probe for additional types of support that the student feels might be necessary.*)

   b. How satisfied are you with the faculty advising services you are receiving? What can your faculty advisor do differently to better support your needs?

4. What kinds of interactions or opportunities (e.g., internships or apprenticeships) have you had with business administration; entrepreneurship/small business; or HRT employers? (*Probe: What kinds of interactions are taking place – guest lecturing, networking, mock interviews, etc.?*)

   a. Have those interactions or opportunities been helpful for you? Why or why not?

5. What kinds of experiential learning opportunities have you had (i.e., student café, simulated hotel, or simulated business)?

   a. How well have these opportunities supported your learning?

6. Have you utilized the Entrepreneurship Center?

   a. What resources does the Entrepreneurship Center provide you?

   b. Do you feel you receive adequate support from the Entrepreneurship Center?

7. How do you feel about the quality of your education here?

   a. How would you describe the quality of your program of study?

   b. How well have your instructors supported your education here?

   c. Are your courses adequately preparing you for a career in your field? Why or why not?

   d. What changes, if any, would you suggest for improving your program of study?

CONCLUDING QUESTIONS

6. What challenges have you encountered while enrolled at Nunez? (*Probe: It could be personal or academic – whatever you feel comfortable sharing in this setting.*) How have those challenges been resolved?

7. What has been the most valuable aspect of your program of study and why?

8. Is there anything else you would like to share about your experiences at Nunez?

Thank you so much for taking the time to talk with me today!

APPENDIX C-1: JUNE 2015 STUDENT GROUP INTERVIEW SUMMARY

Introduction

In June 2015, members of McREL International's evaluation team visited Nunez Community College to conduct on-site group interviews with students currently enrolled in programs of study (e.g., business administration; entrepreneurship and small business management; and hotel, restaurant, and tourism [HRT] administration) being funded through the U.S. Department of Labor's (DOL's) Trade Adjustment Assistance Community College and Career Training (TAACCCT) grant initiative. The interviews were designed to gather information about students' specific experiences with their programs of study, as well as their overall perceptions of Nunez's TAACCCT project.

McREL evaluators were on-site from June 15 through 19, 2015 to conduct these student group interviews as well as project staff interviews, which will be discussed in a later report. Unfortunately, Nunez TAACCCT program staff were unable to share information about the interviews with students until the week that McREL evaluators arrived on campus; therefore, student participation was limited to just one student group interview. This summary uses the interview data obtained during the group interview to describe students' motivation to enroll in their grant-funded programs of study; their involvement and satisfaction with various program components (e.g., student support services, experiential learning opportunities, as well as workforce and employer partner involvement and engagement); challenges they have experienced; and their overall perspectives concerning the quality of the Nunez TAACCCT project.

Student Interview Findings

Program of Study Enrollment Decision

The students participating in the group interview were enrolled in and provided perspectives from the three programs of study being funded by the Nunez TAACCCT project: (1) business administration, (2) entrepreneurship and small business management, and (3) HRT administration. Interview participants reported that they anticipate graduating from their respective programs of study sometime within the next year.

Most of the students indicated that they chose to enroll in courses at Nunez Community College for financial reasons, explaining that they found Nunez's offerings to be more affordable than similar programs of study offered at other colleges in the area. Interview participants also commented that Nunez was the closest college geographically to where they lived that offered the programs of study in which they were interested. One student reported that he or she heard about the courses being offered at Nunez through a family member who recently graduated from the college and recommended the program. Yet another student reported having learned about Nunez's programs of study from an advertisement in the newspaper.

Key Project Strategies and Components

McREL evaluators asked interview participants to report on their experiences thus far with several key program strategies and components of Nunez's TAACCCT project, including

- student support services;
- experiential learning opportunities; and
- workforce and employer partner involvement and engagement.

Participants were also asked to describe any successes and challenges associated with these strategies and components. The following sections summarize the interview data related to these components of the Nunez TAACCCT project. In addition to addressing questions related to the project's implementation, evaluators asked interview participants to reflect on the impact that the project has had on their individual professional development.

Student Support Services

Interview participants were asked to comment on the academic advising or career counseling they have received from Nunez TAACCCT project staff, as well as their perspectives as to whether or not staff have provided them with the support they need. Student responses were mixed, with several respondents indicating that they have received ample support while others reported receiving none at all. Those participants who indicated having received support shared that it was primarily provided by their course instructors who were available for questions during office hours or between classes. "I've discovered that most of the faculty around here are more than happy to help anybody if they have any questions," said one student. However, the students also shared that they do not believe Nunez staff have been necessarily proactive in providing them with support outright; rather, it typically falls to students to make contact or ask for assistance. One interviewee provided an example, explaining how he or she learned too late that there was a course he or she was required to take: "I had to go back and repeat a class because they didn't tell me to take the right class, so it was kind of frustrating." Another student described a similar situation that he or she had experienced: "When I went to schedule my summer classes, I found out [about] some classes that I have to take over, which I'm not happy about."

Students were also asked to describe any experiences they have had with the Entrepreneurship Center and the services it provides. While several interview participants reported having not had any experiences with the center, others commented that they believe it offers valuable resources to them. In particular, one student described the materials being offered by the Entrepreneurship Center as good practice for when students eventually transition from school into their profession, providing them with a number of hypothetical scenarios to work through and problem solve. Another respondent indicated that the center has invited several workforce members to campus to speak to students and share their experiences. Students who reported having utilized such resources indicated that they felt the Entrepreneurship Center provided valuable support to their learning.

Experiential Learning Opportunities

Interview participants reported they have had little to no experience thus far with any experiential learning opportunities (e.g., the hotel simulator, business simulator, or student café) funded by the TAACCCT project. In fact, several students commented that were unaware of any such opportunities being offered. One student enrolled in the HRT administration program shared that he or she has experience working with software used by professionals in the industry, but commented that he or she has yet to participate in any actual simulations. Other students indicated that they have worked through hypothetical scenarios and received hands-on training via their coursework, but not in the form of any simulation activities.

Workforce and Employer Partner Involvement and Engagement

Participants were also asked to comment on any opportunities they have had thus far to interact with workforce and employer partners of the Nunez TAACCCT project. Most of the students reported that they have not experienced these opportunities to date, while one indicated that he or she did attend an "entrepreneur week" event facilitated by the school. This student explained that the event allowed him or her to learn more about potential career opportunities and noted that members of the local workforce have been invited to speak to students by the Entrepreneurship Center over the last several semesters.

Overall Program Quality

Another aspect of the group interview included asking students to share their perspectives about the overall quality of the programs of study in which they were enrolled. Most of the interview participants indicated that they have been satisfied with their experience at Nunez thus far, praising the willingness of instructors and staff to assist struggling students, though reiterating that they typically have to approach faculty with their questions or concerns. Students also shared that they have learned a great deal from their courses at Nunez, and believe those courses are adequately preparing them for careers in their respective fields of study. At the same time, interview participants commented that they have yet to feel overwhelmed by their courses or coursework, and roughly half indicated that they are aware of the resources available to them through the Entrepreneurship Center should the need arise.

When asked to describe any challenges experienced during their enrollment at Nunez, multiple students indicated that inadequate communication from the school was a major issue. "Communication falls through the cracks a lot," explained one interview participant, "like getting some information – to get just one e-mail sent . . . was a hassle, and I think that's one reason why they don't communicate as much, . . . it's time consuming to get it done." Students were also asked to identify aspects of their programs of study they have found to be most valuable. Respondents indicated that the hands-on training they receive from their courses is particularly useful, with students commenting that only so much can be learned from "just reading books." Another student enrolled in the business administration program reported that he or she enjoyed the presentations

required for his or her courses, as they serve as good practice for leading meetings and have increased his or her professional confidence.

Summary

Overall, students expressed mixed opinions regarding the Nunez TAACCCT project and the grant-funded programs of study in which they are enrolled. While several interview participants reported feeling adequately supported by Nunez staff and the Entrepreneurship Center and had opportunities to engage in hands-on learning and interact with potential employers, roughly half of the students interviewed indicated that they were unaware of these services being available. Given this, it is unsurprising that multiple students identified insufficient communication from Nunez as the greatest challenge faced during their enrollment. No students indicated that they participated in any experiential learning opportunities beyond the basic classroom-based problem solving activities. In addition, none of the participants were aware of details involving the student café or the hotel and business simulators. While several interview participants were quick to praise the support they have received from their instructors and Nunez staff, they added that the responsibility of initiating these faculty interactions seemed to fall to them. Students also expressed the opinion that the Entrepreneurship Center provides a valuable service in helping students prepare for transitioning from the classroom to the workforce, though the number of students reporting that they have utilized this service was limited.

APPENDIX C-2: OCTOBER 2015 STUDENT GROUP INTERVIEW SUMMARY

Introduction

In late October 2015, members of McREL International's evaluation team visited Nunez Community College to conduct on-site interviews with students currently enrolled in programs of study being funded through the U.S. Department of Labor's (DOL's) Trade Adjustment Assistance Community College and Career Training (TAACCCT) grant initiative (i.e., business administration; entrepreneurship and small business management; and hotel, restaurant, and tourism [HRT] administration). The interviews were designed to gather information about students' specific experiences with their programs of study as well as their overall perceptions of Nunez's TAACCCT project.

Prior to the arrival of McREL evaluators on campus, Nunez TAACCCT program staff shared information about the interviews with students, resulting in 11 students agreeing to participate in the interviews. This report summarizes the interview data obtained to describe students' motivational factors to enroll in their grant-funded programs of study; their involvement and satisfaction with various program components (e.g., student support services, experiential learning opportunities, and partners' involvement and engagement); and their overall perspectives concerning the quality of the Nunez TAACCCT project.

Student Interview Findings

Program of Study Enrollment Decision

Students participating in the interviews were enrolled in and provided their perspectives of the three programs of study being funded by the Nunez TAACCCT project: (1) business administration, (2) entrepreneurship and small business management, and (3) HRT administration. Interviewees reported that they anticipate a variety of graduation dates from their respective programs of study, ranging from within the next year to the summer of 2020. Several students also indicated that they are unaware of their projected graduation date.

Most of the students indicated that they chose to enroll at Nunez because it was the closest college geographically to where they lived that offered the programs of study in which they were interested. One student reported that he or she heard about the programs being offered at Nunez through a family member who recently graduated from the college and recommended it. Multiple interviewees also spoke about the advantages of attending a smaller school, such as Nunez. As one student explained, "I like the individualized attention that you get at Nunez. Nunez does this individualization better than anybody I've seen. You're not mixed in the crowd and numbers with the young people just graduating, and the career students. You get the attention that you need here." Additionally, several interview participants reported that Nunez provides a more affordable pricing model than other schools in the area, allowing students to save money before transferring elsewhere to pursue a four-year degree.

Key Project Strategies and Components

McREL evaluators asked interview participants to report on their experiences thus far with several key program strategies and components of Nunez's TAACCCT project, including

- student support services;
- experiential learning opportunities; and
- workforce and employer partners' involvement and engagement.

Participants were also asked to describe any successes and challenges they have experienced associated with these strategies and components. The following sections summarize the interview data related to these components of the Nunez TAACCCT project. In addition to addressing questions related to the project's implementation, evaluators asked interview participants to reflect on the impact that the project has had on their individual professional development.

Student Support Services

Interviewees were asked to comment on the academic advising or career counseling they have received from Nunez TAACCCT project staff, as well as their perspectives as to whether or not staff have provided them with the support they need. Responses from the students were mixed, with several respondents indicating that they have received ample support while others reported receiving none at all. Those participants who reported that they have received support shared that it was primarily provided by their course instructors who were available for questions during office hours or between classes, though some reported that they met with other Nunez staff members as well, including advisors specifically associated with the grant-funded programs of study (e.g., Entrepreneurship Center staff). Of the students who indicated that they received advising services, they shared that the sessions provided them with valuable supports, though they do not believe Nunez staff have been necessarily proactive in providing them with those supports. Rather, interview participants indicated that it typically falls to them to make contact or ask for assistance, instead of a faculty advisor being assigned to students and initiating communication. All of the interviewees who received advising services from Nunez staff, TAACCCT-affiliated or otherwise, reported that it had been their responsibility to seek guidance from teachers and project personnel.

Students were also asked to describe any experiences they have had with the Entrepreneurship Center and the services it provides. Despite all of the interviewees indicating that they are aware of the center and the resources it offers, only about half of them reported that they visit it on a regular basis. Of those students, they routinely described the tools and materials the center provides as being extremely valuable. Students were particularly positive about the seminars hosted in the Entrepreneurship Center by guest speakers from the local community and workforce, though several indicated that they wish these seminars could provide more opportunities for professional networking rather than just being informational presentations. Interview participants also described the center as being an excellent location for working on homework or studying for courses, providing numerous books and online resources in addition to the knowledge and guidance of the Entrepreneurship Center staff. "They're really helpful here, you just need to come in,"

reported one student, "Luckily, my teachers really pushed me to start using the Entrepreneurship Center and I'm so grateful."

Experiential Learning Opportunities

Most of the interviewees reported having had no experience with any of the experiential learning opportunities funded by the TAACCCT project to date (i.e., the hotel simulator, business simulator, or student café), and several students commented that were completely unaware of these opportunities being offered. Students who have participated in experiential learning opportunities described the development of the student-operated café on campus and referred to projects and coursework they completed in their business administration and entrepreneurship programs of study. These projects included the development of business plans for hypothetical companies and the presentation of an "unsellable" product to a panel of judges. "We actually had to draw up a business plan and present it before a board, kind of like *Shark Tank* [a television show]," explained one student. "We had our own Shark Tank. They critique you hard, and we even had one assignment where we had to pick an as-seen-on-TV product, what they considered a 'product fail', and we actually had to sell that product."

Students who have participated in these experiential learning opportunities described them as extremely valuable, albeit challenging. "It was really hard, but it was a great teaching tool and it really helped my communication skills," commented an interviewee, "At the time, it was difficult, but in the long run, it's definitely helpful." Other students who participated in these activities reported similar sentiments, such as one interview participant who told McREL evaluators, "They present us, the entrepreneurship students and the business students, with everything we need." The students being interviewed did suggest to McREL evaluators that the only problem they perceived in regard to the experiential learning opportunities has been a lack of marketing and outreach, resulting in many of their classmates being unaware of their existence. "Communication can get muddy here at times," explained an interviewee, "Granted, a lot of students here are just kids walking around with their heads in the clouds, but someone still has to bring them back to reality and make them aware of what they can do here. I would guess that most probably have no idea."

Workforce and Employer Partners' Involvement and Engagement

Interview participants were also asked to comment on any opportunities they have had to interact with workforce and employer partners of the Nunez TAACCCT project. Students reported mixed experiences in this regard, with several interviewees indicating that they have had such opportunities and others reporting that they have not. One student informed McREL evaluators that there have been numerous job fairs hosted at the civic center as well as informational seminars presented at the Entrepreneurship Center by local professionals. Several students reported having heard of these opportunities, but indicated that they chose not to participate. An interviewee explained, "We do have schools and businesses that come into the main lobby area. They'll set up a table, put the name of where they work there, and have a representative come in and tell you about the place, about the programs that they have, but typically I don't stop at those." Another interview participant expressed the opinion that students' lack of knowledge concerning these opportunities

stem from minimal outreach and marketing being directed towards the student body, explaining, "The information is posted on the wall, but if you don't read it, then you don't know."

As mentioned previously, students who participated in these job fairs and seminars shared that the events served primarily as informational presentations, with little opportunity for professional networking. "You're not networking at all," commented one interviewee, "They come in and talk to us, but nothing happens. They give their speech and then it's over." Several other students offered similar statements, expressing disappointment that the job fairs and seminars have not included opportunities for networking thus far. "They're interesting and they're helpful, but I just think they need to offer more. They fall short."

Overall Program Quality

Another aspect of the student interviews included asking participants to share their perspectives about the overall quality of their programs of study. For the most part, interviewees reported that they have been satisfied with their experiences at Nunez. "I think the programs are well put together," commented a student,

We have different programs – the advertising department, the marketing department . . . all kinds of different areas and concentrations. If you're interested in the marketing field, they have that. If you're interested in knowing how to advertise your local business that you've just started, they have that, too. I've taken classes with a few people who own their own businesses and they've talked about how, because some of the courses here, they've learned the steps that they need to take if they're going to be successful. They're learning they've been doing all these things out of order, so these courses are helping them build real careers.

Students specifically praised the instructors and staff as being extremely helpful, both inside and outside of the classroom. "They're awesome," reported an interviewee, "It's professional, but we can still have fun. They make learning less of a chore and that's really refreshing. They're constantly making themselves available to students and letting us know we can count on them."

The interviewees also informed McREL evaluators that, for the most part, they feel the courses they have taken at Nunez have been instrumental in preparing them to be professionals in their respective fields of study. "There's some overlap between classes, sure, but it's all relevant to what I'm trying to do," reported one student. Another commented, "There's a bunch of math and memorization in the general electives that we have to take that doesn't have much to do with anything I'm here for, but my business classes have been amazing." Several students made it a point to praise the rigor of courses in which they have participated, explaining that the most challenging assignments have also proven to be the greatest learning experiences. One such student explained, "I want more than to just sit in class for an hour going over vocab[ulary] words, that won't get me to where I need to be. I'm here because I'm on a mission. We need to do more work like developing business and marketing plans. That's the stuff that will get me where I want to be."

Summary

Overall, students expressed mostly positive opinions regarding the Nunez TAACCCT project and the grant-funded programs of study in which they are enrolled, though mixed levels of involvement in multiple components of the grant were reported. Interviewees who received student support services reported feeling adequately supported by Nunez staff, including those from the Entrepreneurship Center. Additionally, students who indicated having had opportunities to engage in hands-on learning and interact with potential employers expressed the opinion that these experiences have been beneficial. However, a significant number of students also shared that they

> *"I'm really thankful to Nunez. I'm really grateful that I got this opportunity."*

have been unaware of such opportunities and offerings, or have heard of them and chose not to participate. Based on this perception, many of the interview participants suggested that Nunez's TAACCCT programs could become more effective through increased marketing and outreach efforts to both students on campus and members of the surrounding community. "This is a great opportunity. I think they just still need to get the word out," commented a student, "Instead of just posting information on the bulletin board, really step out there and be vocal about all the great ways that Nunez can help people achieve their goals."

Interview participants were particularly positive concerning their experiences with their instructors, as well as the material covered in their courses. "The knowledge of the instructors is just so valuable for me," an interviewee told McREL evaluators, "I'm learning something new every day and that's exciting." Multiple students expressed their appreciation for the individualized attention they have received from their instructors, explaining that this personalized instruction has

> *"I haven't had a bad day once here, I'm never just sitting at my desk thinking, 'I'm ready to get out of here.' It's never that. I want to stay four hours past the end of class."*

proven to be instrumental in their learning. As one student commented, "You can go to any one of your teachers - and that's not just the business teachers, it can be a math teacher or any teacher - and they'll be so willing to help you. And that's great for me. I'm not just a name or a number on a sheet. They're going the extra mile for me."

Nunez TAACCCT Project Staff Interview Protocol

Project Implementation

I will start by asking about the status of project implementation during the third year of the grant. As part of the evaluation, we are interested in learning about how the programs and their designs have been improved or expanded using grant funds. We understand that the project has identified several key strategies and components that support participants' success and project goals. We also understand that you may have limited involvement in certain activities and components given your role and responsibilities. As any of those situations occur, you can simply let me know and we can skip those questions.

Overall, the Nunez Community College TAACCCT project involves several different components:

- **Experiential learning opportunities** (i.e., student café, hotel simulator, and business simulator).

- **Student support services** (e.g., the Entrepreneurship Center and the provision of individualized student coaching and advising).

- **Workforce and employer partner involvement and engagement**

1. To what extent have you been involved in or have knowledge about any of these components? *(Probe with each component and follow up with the appropriate section as appropriate; for instance, if the interviewee was only involved in experiential learning opportunities, you can skip all other questions.)*

2. **Experiential learning opportunities:** Have you been involved in this component? *(If "yes," continue with the subquestions; if "no," skip the subquestions.)*

    a. What types of experiential learning opportunities have been provided to students?

    b. What have been the successes with regard to providing students with experiential learning opportunities?

    c. What have been the challenges and how have they been addressed?

3. **Student support services:** Have you been involved in this component? *(If "yes," continue with the subquestions; if "no," skip the subquestions.)*

    a. What types of support services were provided to participants?

        i. Was career guidance provided and, if so, through what methods?

        ii. How did faculty advisors and instructors work together to support student success?

        iii. What types of job placement services were provided?

    b. To what extent were the student support service components implemented as planned? What adjustments, if any, have been made to support implementation?

    c. What have been the successes with regard to the student support services offered?

    d. What have been the challenges and how have they been addressed?

4. **Partner engagement:** Have you been involved in this component? *(If "yes," continue with the subquestions; if "no," skip the subquestions.)*

   a. How have the partnerships supported the project objectives in terms of . . . *(Probe to address all partners: industry, workforce, and education)*
      - program design
      - curriculum development
      - recruitment
      - training placement (i.e., placing students into the programs that are aligned with their skills and career interests)
      - program management
      - leveraging of resources
      - commitment to program sustainability
      - job placement

   b. What factors contribute to partners' involvement, or lack of involvement, in the program?

   c. Which contributions from partners were most critical to the success of the grant program? Which contributions had less of an impact? *(Probe to address all partners: industry, workforce, and education)*

   d. What have been the successes with regard to partner engagement?

   e. What have been the challenges and how have they been addressed?

Project Impact on the Local Community and Workforce

5. From your viewpoint, how well does the project appear to be serving the needs of the local workforce and community?

   a. What are the reactions among local community and business stakeholders to Nunez Community College's TAACCCT program?

   b. What kind of impact do you think Nunez's TAACCCT program will have on the local business industry?

Sustainability and Transferability

6. To the best of your knowledge, how has the Nunez project team planned for project sustainability in the following areas?
   - Experiential learning opportunities
   - Student support services
   - Employer engagement

7. How has Nunez's project team planned for the transferability (replicability) of the following TAACCCT project component areas? By transferability, we mean the ability to apply and/or adapt a component in other colleges, programs, or future projects.
   - Experiential learning opportunities
   - Student support services
   - Employer engagement

8. To your knowledge, how will the Nunez TAACCCT project partners (i.e., workforce, community, and employer partners) support program sustainability beyond the life of the grant period?

9. In what specific ways has the Nunez Community College TAACCCT project increased your center's capacity to support student success? Can you share some examples (e.g., any anecdotal stories) of how capacity has been increased?

Wrapping Up

10. Reflecting back on the Nunez TAACCCT project, are there any components of the grant/program you would have changed? If yes, please explain.

11. Do you have anything else you would like to share about the development and implementation of the Nunez Community College TAACCCT project or your involvement so far?

APPENDIX D-1: SUMMER 2015 STAFF INTERVIEW SUMMARY

Introduction

In June 2015, members of McREL International's evaluation team visited Nunez Community College to conduct on-site interviews with the staff of the college's Trade Adjustment Assistance Community College and Career Training (TAACCCT) grant initiative. This grant, funded through the U.S. Department of Labor (DOL), is geared toward supporting the education and training of students enrolled in one of three programs of study at Nunez: (1) business administration, (2) entrepreneurship and small business management, and (3) hotel, restaurant, and tourism (HRT) administration. The interviews were tailored to staff members' specific responsibilities to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the project's implementation from their various perspectives as well as their overall perceptions of Nunez's TAACCCT project.

McREL evaluators were on-site from June 15 through 19, 2015 to conduct these staff interviews as well as a student group interview, which has been discussed in a previous report. This summary uses interview data to provide an overview, from the perspective of project staff, of the Nunez TAACCCT project's implementation progress; staff and partner involvement; implementation successes and challenges; perceptions of community and workforce impact; project sustainability and transferability; and other overall comments or observations.

Implementation of Key Project Strategies and Components

McREL evaluators asked project staff to report on the progress that has been made in implementing several key strategies and components of the Nunez TAACCCT project, including

- experiential learning opportunities;
- student support services; and
- workforce and employer partner involvement and engagement.

Participants were also asked to describe any successes and challenges associated with these strategies and components. The following sections summarize the interview data related to these components. In addition to addressing questions related to implementation of the project components, evaluators asked project staff to reflect on the impact the project has had to date on the community and workforce, as well as Nunez Community College, and their plans for sustaining the project beyond the life of the grant.

Experiential Learning Opportunities

During the interviews, project staff were asked to comment on any experiences they have had to date with the experiential learning opportunities being supported by Nunez's TAACCCT project. This component includes student learning that has arisen from their interactions with the educational modules or simulators, which are being used to replicate occupational scenarios, within their programs of study.

Implementation Progress

While only half of the project staff members interviewed indicated that they were involved in the implementation of experiential learning opportunities, all reported that they were aware of at least some of the training simulators being funded through the Nunez TAACCCT project. These include the use of web-based simulation assignments, crowd sourcing activities, business plan development projects for students enrolled in business and entrepreneurial courses, and a "front desk simulator" for students enrolled in the HRT administration program. One staff member also described a "market bay" where students in the entrepreneurship program are invited to develop a service or product and then solicit it to others, as well as participate in a "pitch contest" where they receive practice and feedback in presenting services and products to potential funders from the local community.

All staff members interviewed by McREL evaluators were also familiar with the construction of a student-run café on campus, which will provide students with hands-on experiences "from purchasing, to working with customers, to handling the accounting for the center, and looking at profitability." Project staff reported that they expect the student café to be finished and operational in the very near future, but none were able to provide a specific date. Thus far, a location has been chosen, equipment has been purchased and is on hold to be delivered, the building architect has completed all renderings and drawings of the café, and the proposed menu has been submitted to the State of Louisiana Department of Health and Hospitals, Office of Public Health. Staff were predominantly positive and optimistic about the eventual utility of the student café, but were unanimous in their opinion that the process of constructing it has proven to be a significant challenge.

Implementation Successes

Project staff reported numerous student successes resulting from the implementation of experiential learning opportunities at Nunez. Several staff members described the simulators provided to HRT administration students as extremely effective in preparing them for the everyday responsibilities they will face in their professional careers in the industry. Indeed, project staff explained, "when it was time for businesses to come [to Nunez's campus] and recruit, these students already had an understanding of what it may be like in the field." One staff member commented, "I think that was probably our shining moment, when we had companies come on campus and hired our students on the spot."

Additionally, staff shared that they have noticed significant positive changes in individual students enrolled in the business administration and the entrepreneurship and small business management programs as a result of their engagement in experiential learning opportunities. "The rewards have been actually seeing our students when they have that completed business plan and they feel really confident about it," explained one staff member, referring to business plan development projects that students in both programs of study are required to complete. "The simulators, the business plan, and [the] marketing plan, those are the biggest difficulties that a lot of

our students have to overcome, but they're also the biggest successes because once they have it, once all the pieces come together, they really feel confident about it."

Implementation Challenges

As mentioned previously, project staff indicated that the construction of the student-operated café has proven to be a significant challenge. Specifically, a major obstacle arose when Nunez put out the initial request for construction proposals from potential contractors, as respondents universally replied asking for compensation far exceeding the project budget. Ultimately, the price of construction was negotiated to be within budget and a contractor was selected. One staff member reported during the interviews that he or she would be meeting with the contractor and architect for a preconstruction meeting on Thursday, June 18. Another challenge associated with the student café stems from what some project staff perceive to be a "disconnect between faculty and curriculum development and administration of the grant." Specifically, these project staff members expressed concern as to whether there are enough students enrolled in Nunez's HRT administration and culinary programs to adequately staff the café. "Our culinary program is small… we have a class of maybe seven people total, and they're in soups and stocks and that's their objective for the semester… it's very difficult to say they're also going to run the café on campus," explained one interview participant. Another voiced similar sentiments, commenting, "With faculty and program managers involved this plan could've been a lot smoother and better for the students."

Staff also commented on the challenges posed to program enrollment by the local culture within St. Bernard Parish, Louisiana, where the college is located. One interviewee stated, "We're dealing with a very finite pool of applicants to begin with; [there's] not a traditionally strong college background in this community," reported an interview participant. "The way of doing things is: you go to high school, you get a job, and that's what you do for the next 40 years, so changing that mindset has been difficult. . . ..We're getting there, but again, it's just [that] the change has been slow."

> *"People have done things in this area the same way for a long time, and it can be really challenging to have people to think in terms of doing things differently."*

In addition, project staff reported that they initially perceived reluctance among students to participate in the experiential learning opportunities offered at Nunez. "I don't think a lot of our students have had the opportunity to deal with an online simulation before," commented a staff member, "so getting past that learning curve was kind of steep, but once we got past it they seemed to really enjoy it."

Student Support Services

Project staff were also asked about student support services being provided by Nunez with support from the TAACCCT project. This component includes the provision of individualized coaching and advising services to students, as well as the availability of academic and professional

resources for students through Nunez's Entrepreneurship Center, which is located on the college's campus.

Implementation Progress

Staff reported that the Entrepreneurship Center has been providing the majority of student support services being offered through the TAACCCT project. Project staff described the center as a resource accessible to Nunez students as well as members of the St. Bernard Parish community, offering materials, workshops, tutoring, and other opportunities (e.g., public lectures from visiting business owners and career fairs). "The Entrepreneurship Center always has different events going on. Probably at least once a week, there's somebody from the community that comes in to speak on topics of entrepreneurship," commented one interviewee. Most of the counseling that takes place through the Entrepreneurship Center was reported by project staff as being informal in nature, with students often "wandering in with a question" that eventually leads to a more structured conversation with a staff member of the Nunez TAACCCT project.

Some confusion appears to exist among project staff as to what roles their colleagues fulfill in providing support services to students. One interviewee listed numerous positions among the staff but indicated that he or she was confused as to what the duties and responsibilities were for any of these roles. Other project personnel also seemed unclear as to which Nunez project staff members were responsible for providing specific student support services, with several explaining that, in light of this, instructors often take the task upon themselves. "Instructors act as advisors," explained one staff member, adding that instructors also provide student support services through the Entrepreneurship Center alongside the designated support staff: "We've had faculty come in here and help with enrollment and advising."

Staff reported that Nunez employs an advising system referred to as "a bull pen," wherein students are advised informally in a group setting. Within this system, students from various majors have access to instructors outside of their discipline, giving them the opportunity to explore alternative fields of study and career paths. "Students just come here and we take them as they come in, regardless of whatever their major is, regardless of whatever our discipline is, whatever we teach, and we try to advise them that way." One staff member of the Nunez TAACCCT project commented that he or she felt this style of advising was beneficial as it exposes faculty to a greater number of students than would have been accessible to them otherwise. "I don't try to convince them to go into business or entrepreneurship, but I really let them see five years from now [by asking: Where do you find yourself? Where do you see yourself? That's how I handle the advising."

Implementation Successes

Project staff described several students who seem to have benefited from the support services offered through the Nunez TAACCCT project. These successes have stemmed primarily from students initiating interactions with the Entrepreneurship Center or approaching course instructors for informal advising. "My students know that they can always come to me if they have a question about anything that they've got going on with their business or business plan. I'm always available to help them out with their businesses," commented one member of the Nunez

TAACCCT project team. Another staff member described numerous instances in which students were able to utilize materials through the Entrepreneurship Center that would have otherwise been financially inaccessible: "They say they can't afford to buy something, but they'll come to the center."

Implementation Challenges

Similar to comments about the implementation challenges faced with the experiential learning opportunities, project staff indicated that the local culture has proven to be a significant obstacle for Nunez's implementation of student support services. According to staff, students from the local community are reluctant to approach faculty or project staff for additional assistance. One staff member explained, "I think the biggest challenge has been having the students to take advantage of what we have available. I don't know if they're feeling that it's a sense of failure that they get some extra help, but trying to change their mindset that it's okay to ask for help when you need it . . . it is very, very hard." Another project staff member expressed similar sentiments, reporting that "the ones that need tutoring the most are the hardest to get to go to tutoring." Several staff members also indicated that it has been difficult to find tutors. As one interviewee stated,

> *I think the other challenge we had with the tutoring side of it is we did have students who did want math help, and just getting folks in who are comfortable with tutoring in math has really been a challenge. I don't know where all of the mathematicians are but they're clearly not in this area and they're clearly not wanting to tutor.*

While project staff reported that job placement services have not yet been offered through the Nunez TAACCCT project, they did indicate that a system for doing so is in development. Staff noted that one challenge of providing job placement services to students enrolled in the entrepreneurship and small business management program is rooted in the very nature of the program's focus, as "entrepreneurship" by definition entails the development of one's own business. Additionally, one staff member seemed reluctant to offer job placement, job shadowing, or internship opportunities to students. This staff member explained, "If our students aren't ready to go into internships, we're not going to damage those relationships [with our partners] by sending them students who are not ready."

In addition to the previously noted challenges, Nunez TAACCCT staff indicated that ambiguity and confusion had arisen among project staff as to whom specific responsibilities fell, as well as who serves in what role under the grant. One interviewee commented,

> *Some people were put into roles just because . . . we had huge budget cuts and they got rid of a lot of people, and said, "Well, you can – you're gonna do this now." So [while] giving somebody a job is wonderful, it may not be necessarily the best person for that role. . . [it's] kind of a "putting a round peg into a square hole" kind of thing. Does it – I mean, can you make it work? Absolutely. Is it the best for the process? Probably not.*

Staff also expressed the opinion that this ambiguity stemmed from an absence of any "clear cut" organizational structure. One project staff member shared, "This is a very tiny educational family at Nunez, and when I say family, I literally mean a lot of people are family here. We have a lot of cousins and sisters and — 'Well, that's my aunt' and 'That's my mom' — there's a lot of family connections within the staff." Another staff member added,

> *The staff's less than 100 people, so it is very much a "Well, that's the way we've always done it. That's the way my dad did it when he worked here" kind of thing. The things that I've struggled with since I've been here. . . . It's like, "Okay, well, why am I doing this right now? I'm gathering data for who, for what? What's it gonna be used for?"*

Similar concerns were expressed by two other members of the project staff. One stated, "This place really lacks a structured, organizational flow. Nobody's really sure — there are some people that report to three different bosses." While the other indicated,

> *It's like, "Well, who am I working for today?" I think that needs to be greatly improved, and it's not difficult. It's just I don't think it was ever done here before because everybody kind of knew what they did, but when people leave and new people come in, they don't even know their job because it's never been written down.*

Workforce and Employer Partner Engagement

Additionally, project staff were asked about Nunez's efforts to engage partners and how the partnerships have been supporting the objectives of the Nunez TAACCCT project. Examples of ways in which partners can support the project include providing funding, advertising for the program in the community, and securing job placement for program interns and graduates.

Implementation Progress

Staff indicated that the workforce and employer partners have been heavily engaged in supporting the Nunez TAACCCT project and its objectives. Specifically, project staff reported that one essential service the partners have been providing is their participation on the advisory boards. "We sit and talk and they tell us what the industry is looking for," commented one interviewee, further explaining that partners' input is central in curriculum development and preparing students to enter the workforce. During the board meetings, the partners share important information that is directly relevant to the industries being served, such as "software that's not gonna be used anymore; don't use this certification, use this one; . . . sort of real-world business-specific feedback that can give us those little pieces that make our students more employable." These advisory boards have also proven to be valuable in acquiring industry-based testing. In addition, staff noted that the project partners are also offering assistance directly to students, be it through workshops and lectures facilitated by the Entrepreneurship Center or on-campus visits and interviews. One interviewee elaborated by saying, "The accessibility to the students . . . that's important and also [the] real-world feedback."

A variety of other services that partners have been providing to students were reported by project staff as well. One staff member identified a project partner that had gone so far as to offer a trolley service to students experiencing difficulties in securing transportation to classes, as well as another partner who offered one of their office branches as a resource center to students who live farther away from campus. Staff commented that numerous partners have made themselves readily available to meet with students who may have questions about the industry, offering valuable insight and expertise. A staff member stated that "any time a student has any question, if we have a subject-matter expert that we can direct them to, they're like, 'Just let us know. We'll set up the meeting.' They've been great." Project staff also reported that the partners have offered support in generating publicity, such as assisting in social media marketing, for the TAACCCT project. Another interviewee noted that one partner even provided financial support for a billboard advertising Nunez Community College's HRT administration program, helping to facilitate greater program enrollment.

Implementation Successes

Nunez TAACCCT project staff were unanimously positive regarding workforce and employer partners' contributions to the grant-affiliated programs. Project staff emphasized the value of the advisory boards in developing the curriculum and training modules to better prepare students for employment, even if those students are not enrolled in the business administration, entrepreneurship and small business management, or HRT administration programs of study. One interviewee expanded on this by saying,

> *I would say the advisory boards are a big success. We have had information come back from the advisory board that has helped with employability of students outside of these programs as well. So that's been helpful to grow the college and [the] employability of <u>all</u> of our students in addition to the TAACCCT students.*

Another staff member reported that several partners have been getting involved in the actual coursework in addition to providing assistance with the curriculum and program development. Typically, this level of involvement has been through project partners' attendance at student presentations on campus, where one interviewee noted, "They actually come for the final presentations and they help judge [them]."

Staff indicated that the advisory board members have also acted as advocates for the Nunez TAACCCT project across the state of Louisiana, conducting outreach activities with high school students as well as negotiating with businesses that are not currently partnered with the project to open their facilities for visits, workshops, and site-based trainings. "The field trips are wonderful," commented a project staff member, "they're out there lobbying for us."

Implementation Challenges

Project staff had little to say concerning challenges they have experienced in working with the workforce and employer partners of the Nunez TAACCCT project. Staff reported that any issues had stemmed from obstacles within the college itself, specifically a high turnover of project

staff. One staff member shared that there had been several program directors and this inconsistency led to initial delays with getting partners involved in the grant activities. He or she noted, "There was a lot of time, quite frankly, wasted there. I think there was a lot of lost opportunity there . . . because we had a lot of good press when we first got the grant and that sort of was able to die off because nothing really happened from it."

Project Impact on Local Community and Workforce

For the most part, Nunez TAACCCT project staff members indicated that they believe their efforts are meeting the needs of the local workforce and community. Specifically, staff viewed the grant as being a valuable service to local employers by providing them with access to a pool of highly qualified graduates for recruitment. Several staff members mentioned that this was primarily due to the extensive technical training and industry-based testing to which students enrolled in the grant-funded programs at Nunez are exposed. "When students leave our programs, they have industry-based certificates and credentialing that sometimes people in the field take years for their companies to allow them to do," explained one interviewee. "Sometimes it's cost prohibitive for the individual to get it if their company doesn't pay, but our students are able to get that through these programs."

While staff members were optimistic about the Nunez TAACCCT project, several expressed that it is still too early to accurately gauge the project's impact. "Generally, to see growth in an educational program, . . . you need a period of time. Three years is really a short period of time to be able to measure impact, especially when you're talking about a brand new program," explained one interviewee. "I think in the first three years you're just getting the word out that the program exists. Then, by that time, I have some graduates or some completers so now people know that it exists. Now that they know that you can do this . . . the momentum starts to build."

Project staff also shared mixed opinions about the community's reaction to the Nunez TAACCCT project. "I think that the community has really embraced us having these resources available. They've been really excited and [have] been wanting to see how it's all going to pan out," said one interviewee. Others made similar comments, such as "I think it's been very positive . . . it's really been a very good mixture of [the] industry telling us what they need, government agencies' education, and people who can take people who are out of work and get them someplace where they need work." Another member of the project team commented, "We've done a good job locally, very locally in this parish. We've recently developed some better relationships with the foundation in this community. That's supported us in some other ways, so we've been able to leverage some of our recognition that way."

However, some of the project staff members reported that the community remains largely unaware of the services being offered through the Nunez TAACCCT project. One interviewee explained, "For the most part, . . . I would have to guess that not a lot of people know about what we do here. A lot of the businesses that are in St. Bernard Parish are 'mom and pops'. They're the small – little, you know, five-man operations . . . and I just don't see those people coming in for help." Others expressed similar sentiments during their interviews, with one staff member

indicating that there is still considerable work to be done in spreading awareness about the project within St. Bernard Parish and beyond: "We still need more recognition of our programs outside of this particular parish and some stronger connections with maybe some other institutions just so that the options are there and the relationships are stronger."

Project Impact on Nunez Community College

Project staff were also asked to describe the impact of the Nunez TAACCCT project on the college's ability to support student learning and success. Staff unanimously agreed that the grant has been a major boon for the college, dramatically increasing the effectiveness of faculty and staff. In particular, one staff member shared his or her view of the grant's impact at the college: "Wow! I think that's been one of the best things . . . I mean, all the learning labs that we have, you know, three learning labs – that's phenomenal for a school our size, I think. You know, having up-to-date and new equipment, [and the] computers that we have are state-of-the-art. . . . It's attractive to students and they want to come to the center."

> *"I'm looking forward to the café really helping out because it's a need on so many levels. It's a need for the students to get that experience. It's a need for the campus community to be able to engage with each other and things like that. It's a need for profitability as well because that will help to keep everything else moving forward."*

Interview participants emphasized that the experiential learning opportunities provided through the grant-funded simulators have proven to be invaluable in supporting student success as well. "I think that if it hadn't been for the TAACCCT grant, I wouldn't be here and then wouldn't be able to give my knowledge [as] a seasoned entrepreneur to these students who actually want to go through this program and want to open up their own businesses," explained one interviewee. Additionally, project staff indicated that they believe the Nunez TAACCCT project has helped to also refine the school's curriculum. One staff member stated, "Entrepreneurship is a new program within the business curriculum and it is necessary. I think it's a good curriculum. It's given our students additional options for small business owners."

While project staff expressed that the Nunez TAACCCT project was impacting the college in a positive manner, it is important to note that several interviewees shared their belief that the project's impact could have been even more substantial if not for initial delays in hiring staff and getting programs off the ground. Referring to challenges that the project has faced, a member of the project team stated, "The biggest [challenge] of all of this was getting somebody in at the late end of the game," referring to grant positions that remained unfilled until Year 3. Another staff member conveyed,

> *I just think it was a little bit too late . . . because a lot of things could have definitely helped us out in Years 2 and 3 instead of Years 3 and 4. At the tail-end, it's kind of hard to implement anything at that late stage of the game when most of the time's up and most of the money's dried up as well.*

Project Sustainability and Transferability

Project staff predominantly reported that they believe the products and services being offered through the Nunez TAACCCT grant will continue to be made available to students and members of the community even after the grant ends. One member of the project team affirmed this sentiment by stating, "It's designed to be sustainable. We wouldn't be in the process of getting a new student success center if we didn't think that a lot of our programs here were sustainable. We wouldn't have invested this kind of money in something just for it to last three or four years." Other staff members indicated that they have high expectations for project sustainability as well. "I think the seed is there now so I think everything that's in place now will probably continue on after the expiration of the grant," explained one interviewee. This individual further commented that he or she feels that the course instructors in Nunez's grant-funded programs of study have also been able to establish credibility in the community: "I think it will go on because I think there's interest there now and I think with our instructors, I think they've got a good enough reputation where people will come here."

Once completed, project staff stated that it is expected that the student-operated café will provide the college with a steady stream of revenue to help sustain components of the Nunez TAACCCT project after grant funding ends. One interviewee expressed that currently "there is nowhere to get food on campus. There is no cafeteria. There is no breakroom. We have a couple of vending machines and that's it. I sit every morning sometimes and watch students come in [carrying] Wendy's bags, Burger King bags, and McDonald's bags. There's an audience here." Elaborating further, this staff member stated, "We think that's literally gonna be a gold mine because there's nowhere for the students to eat. . . . So, I think the sustainability of that moving forward will be very good. We can hire a real manager. It'll move forward. It'll sustain itself quite well, which then will hopefully fund this center as well." Other staff members also reported having high expectations for the student café, anticipating that it will serve as a major financial asset for Nunez as well as an invaluable opportunity for students to receive hands-on training. As one interviewee explained,

> "The curriculum has national certifications in it, so it can easily be used anywhere."

> *Not only will the students be getting this experience, but it also provides a service to the students and faculty and staff on campus because, you know, everybody likes to eat. Having somewhere for them to grab coffee or grab something to eat is going to be a way for it to sustain itself. I think that it could actually help to keep the Entrepreneurship Center open with the revenue that it's generating once it's up and running and it is doing well.*

Project staff indicated that they also believe Nunez's employer and workforce partners will play an integral role in supporting project components after the TAACCCT grant expires. The most critical support they can provide, according to several staff members, is simply continuing to hire Nunez graduates. "I think our partners will help by hiring our students. They trust that the students who've finished with us have the skills they need to be successful, so we're seeing that our students

are being hired," explained one interviewee. He or she further stated, "We've built some relationships with foundations and groups in our immediate area so I think those will continue."

Nunez TAACCCT project staff had less to say concerning project transferability. Indeed, many of the interview participants reported that they were unaware of any specific strategies or efforts to make project components transferable to other schools. In spite of this, multiple staff members commented that they believe what has been done at Nunez could successfully be replicated elsewhere. One interviewee explained, "I definitely would say that there are lots of things in there that I know work. For instance, you know, working students into cohorts and doing things like that, I think those are absolutely wonderful ways of getting students through a program and getting them ready. So if [the project plan] was followed more like the way that it was written, absolutely I think you could take it and go other places." Another staff member of the Nunez TAACCCT project commented,

> *I think that this could easily be replicated at different sites. I think that this could be replicated at any other community colleges that have a significant level of tourism. I think with entrepreneurship, I mean, you're asking students to go out and create their own businesses, so you know we have to look at LLCs [limited liability corporations], but I think it can be replicated.*

Project staff also elaborated that the curricula designed for the business administration, entrepreneurship and small business management, and HRT administration programs to meet the objectives of the Nunez TAACCCT project were in no way specific to any one college. One interviewee stated, "The programs [have not been] specifically developed so that they transfer to one specific university. I think the curriculum could be used and tweaked by other institutions, especially in HRT [administration] and entrepreneurship. The entrepreneurship curriculum has undergone quite a bit of review but I think it's pretty solid, so that sort of curriculum absolutely could be replicated and used going forward."

Summary

Overall, project staff expressed mixed opinions regarding the implementation and effectiveness of the Nunez TAACCCT project. While reporting that all of the key components of the grant have begun implementation, project staff indicated that there is still considerable progress to be made. Nunez staff participating in the interviews commented numerous times that the project's implementation had been severely delayed from the onset by a high degree of staff turnover, resulting in integral positions needing to be filled before any progress could be made. As of Year 3, the majority of the Nunez team indicated that they felt those positions have been successfully filled, though several shared their concerns regarding the amount of project time lost.

For the most part, interview participants told McREL evaluators that they believe the Nunez TAACCCT project is meeting the needs of the local community and workforce. Additionally, the grant-funded programs offered at Nunez seem to be well-received by those members of the community who have been made aware of their availability. Several staff members conveyed that

they believe there is room for improvement in this regard with a greater awareness of the course offerings at Nunez needing to be cultivated both within the local community and beyond.

Project staff members also expressed their belief that the Nunez TAACCCT project is highly sustainable and that the programs currently funded by the grant will continue to be offered after the grant ends. Staff commented that sustainability is largely contingent upon the continued support from the workforce and employer partners as well as the success of the student café, which the Nunez team anticipates will produce a substantial stream of revenue with which to continue funding programs. While project staff indicated that they were currently unaware of any specific plans or strategies for transferability, they did communicate their belief that the Nunez TAACCCT project is highly transferable and could be successfully replicated at any university with similar program offerings.

Introduction

In June 2016, staff of Nunez Community College's Trade Adjustment Assistance Community College and Career Training (TAACCCT) grant evaluation team, from McREL International, conducted a series of telephone interviews with the Nunez Community College TAACCCT program staff. This TAACCCT grant, funded through the U.S. Department of Labor (DOL), is geared toward supporting the education and training of students enrolled in one of three programs of study at Nunez Community College (hereafter, Nunez): (1) business administration, (2) entrepreneurship and small business management, and (3) hotel, restaurant, and tourism (HRT) administration. The interviews were tailored to staff members' specific responsibilities to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the project's implementation from their various perspectives as well as their overall perceptions of Nunez's TAACCCT project.

This summary uses interview data to provide an overview, from the perspective of project staff, of the Nunez TAACCCT project's implementation progress; staff and partner involvement; implementation successes and challenges; perceptions of community and workforce impact; project sustainability and transferability; and other overall comments or observations.

Implementation of Key Project Strategies and Components

Project staff were asked to report any progress that has been made in the implementation of several key components of the Nunez TAACCCT project, specifically

- experiential learning opportunities;
- student support services; and
- workforce and employer partner involvement and engagement.

Interview participants were also asked to share any successes and/or challenges they have experienced regarding any of these strategies and components. The following sections summarize the interview data related to these components. In addition to addressing questions related to implementation of the project components, evaluators asked project staff to reflect on the impact that they believe the project has had to date on the local community and workforce, as well as Nunez Community College, and their plans for sustaining the project beyond the life of the grant.

Experiential Learning Opportunities

Nunez TAACCCT evaluators asked project staff to report on any experiences they have had to date with the experiential learning opportunities offered beneath for programs of study falling under the umbrella of the Nunez TAACCCT project. Experiential learning opportunities refers to student learning that has arisen from interactions with the educational modules or simulators, which are being used to replicate occupational scenarios, within their programs of study.

Implementation Progress

Less than half of all interview participants reported having been involved in the implementation of experiential learning opportunities, however, most Nunez TAACCCT project staff indicated that they had some knowledge of at some of the simulators being implemented as a part of the grant. Interview participants explained that these simulators include a student-run café, web-based simulation assignments, activities and assignments involving crowd sourcing, and business plan development projects for students enrolled in business and entrepreneurial courses, while a "front desk simulator" has been used for students enrolled in the HRT administration program. Interview participants also shared that students participated in events called "pitch contests," wherein students present and attempt to sell a product to members of the faculty and community. Interview participants indicated that students are invited to do so twice – once with a viable product that students select on their own, and once with a "bad" product they are assigned that is more difficult to sell.

Nunez TAACCCT staff who were knowledgeable of the experiential learning opportunities supported by the grant reported that all simulators have been fully implemented and are functioning effectively, particularly the student-operated café. While interview participants expressed frustration with delays in the implementation of the café and several voiced some logistical concerns, most shared that they believe it has been worth the wait and is providing a valuable service to students, the school, and the community. "Students didn't have a place near campus that they could eat until now," commented one such member of the Nunez TAACCCT staff, "so they're not just learning how to run a business, they're providing a service to their classmates." Interview participants reported that progress has also been made toward ensuring sustainability for the student-operated café, though expressed some concern for other simulators supported by the TAACCCT following the eventual expiration of grant funds.

Implementation Successes

Interview participants identified a number of student successes that have arisen as a result of participation in experiential learning opportunities provided at Nunez Community College. "I think that the students who took part in the modules, especially the hotel module, gained a lot of experience that they could fall back on when applying for jobs," shared a member of the Nunez TAACCCT staff,

> *A couple of students have told me about how employers who were interviewing them described the tools they would be using on the job, and the students were able to say, "Oh, yeah, I've worked on that software before and already know my way around it," and most of them were hired as a result of their experiences here at Nunez.*

Nunez TAACCCT staff also reported that the experiential learning opportunities provided through the grant have helped students develop the necessary skills for employment and attain industry-recognized credentials in their fields. "We've had great success in getting our students certified," shared another interview participant. "For example, we had students complete the Work Keys assessment, and almost all of them were certified at the bronze, silver, or gold level, which has

opened doors for a lot of them." Several interview participants also described the advantages of experiential learning compared to the training done in more traditional programs of study in general, suggesting that first-hand learning provides numerous benefits which are not otherwise available. "Some things you just don't pick up from reading a textbook," commented a member of the Nunez TAACCCT staff,

> *Some things you just have to learn for yourself, and sometimes you learn lessons the hard way, but it cements those lessons. You learn what happens if you don't keep your restaurant stocked, you learn what happens when you're not managing traffic in and out of your store. Once you learn those kind of things firsthand, you're probably not going to forget them again.*

Additionally, staff shared that they believe there is tremendous value in the service-centered training taking place through the student-operated café. "I think the café is a big success, maybe our biggest success," reported one such interview participant,

> *We're a small community college, so we don't have a food court or anything like that on campus. Outside of vending machines or neighboring businesses, which are all pretty far away, there was no way for students to get something to eat. Having that café on campus meets a real need for students, for faculty, and for anyone who lives in this area.*

Several staff also expressed hopes that the student-operated café will provide an important means by which to sustain programs of study supported by the TAACCCT grant after the eventual expiration of grant funds, indicating that the café has been able to generate a consistent revenue stream to date. "We're hoping that it [the café] will pay for itself in the long run," reported an interview participant, "We have a chef there at all times overseeing things, but he has trained the students and they seem excited to be involved, and I think it's just a valuable experience for everyone."

Implementation Challenges

Project staff were also asked to describe any challenges they had experienced during the implementation of experiential learning opportunities. Most interview participants shared the perspective that the most significant obstacle to this implementation was a pervasive lack of clarity and communication both within the grant and beyond with external stakeholders, including students, staff, and members of the community. One such member of the Nunez TAACCCT staff shared,

> *I feel like a lot more could have been done, and I know early on we had lots of students who were really excited about getting the opportunity to have hands-on experience, but it seemed like no one really knew what was happening. The café should have been done earlier, and people were willing to help, but there was just no information or updates, and now that the grant is winding down I just look back and think it's a shame because there was so much potential.*

Several interview participants suggested that this lack of consistent communication stemmed from high levels of staff turnover, reporting that numerous positions were being vacated and filled throughout all stages of the grant. "We had faculty changing in midstream, so to speak, and any

time you have that change things get difficult because the new faculty has different ideas and goes about things differently than the old faculty would have," commented a member of the project staff,

> *Walking into a situation that's ongoing, that's already up and running, and finding that you have to do things another way is always difficult. Having said that, I think the new people we hired are terrific, I think they're great. I just wish we'd had them from the start.*

Staff also described challenges arising as a result of the type of students who tend to enroll in programs at community colleges such as Nunez, explaining that these students tend to have many responsibilities beyond attending class and participating in trainings. "People have families, jobs, commitments. So even if they were excited in the beginning, life happens, and that can be a big problem as far as student participation," commented an interview participant. To accommodate this, another member of the Nunez TAACCCT staff shared that project personnel have made numerous attempts to reach out to students and determine dates and times for classes that would work best for their busy schedules. "We had a lot of difficulty in fitting our class times into students' busy schedules, so we sent out a survey to try and find out what time of the day would work best for them," he/she explained, "In the end we got some good feedback from that survey and since then we've been offering our seminars at different times, and that seems to be working well."

Student Support Services

Interview participants were asked to describe the student support services being provided by Nunez with support from the TAACCCT project. This component includes the provision of individualized coaching and advising services to students, as well as the availability of academic and professional resources for students through Nunez's Entrepreneurship Center, which is located on the college's campus.

Implementation Progress

Interview participants indicated that, for the most part, student support services provided through the Nunez TAACCCT project have been offered through the grant-funded Entrepreneurship Center on the Nunez campus. Project personnel explained that the Entrepreneurship Center functions as a resource center for both students enrolled at Nunez Community College and members of the local community. Resources offered at the Entrepreneurship Center include materials and infrastructure (e.g., computer and internet connectivity), tutoring services, workshops and trainings, and other opportunities (e.g., guest speakers, career fairs, etc.). Interview participants reported that career guidance and counseling services are also available, but are informal in nature and do not utilize any structured systems for advising. Project staff explained that formal guidance and career counseling are already provided through Nunez Community College independent from the Nunez TAACCCT grant, and as such the grant leverages those student support services instead of creating entirely new systems. Interview participants reported that Entrepreneurship Center staff routinely make referrals and connect students in TAACCCT-funded programs of study with these services. Project staff also shared that

numerous instructors in classes falling under the umbrella of the Nunez TAACCCT project serve as informal advisors, as well, though several commented that instructors did not appear to frequently remain in contact nor collaborate with Nunez Community College's official student support personnel. For the most part, interview participants reported that project staff's implementation of student support services has remained relatively consistent throughout the grant, though commented that staff positions relevant to these services were subject to the same high degree of staff turnover that was persistent across other areas of the Nunez TAACCCT project.

Implementation Successes

When asked to describe any notable successes that have arisen as a result of the student support services offered through the Nunez TAACCCT grant, project personnel provided numerous individual stories about specific students who appear to have benefited from visits to the Entrepreneurship Center. For the most part, these stories revolved around the transformation that several interview participants believed they saw take place in their students after utilizing the resources and opportunities provided through the Entrepreneurship Center. "I was able to see some students who struggled at first really blossom, I think that is probably my biggest success story," commented an interview participant, "There were some students who came into the Entrepreneurship Center for their first visit who looked almost lost, and to watch them grow to the point that they were ready to graduate was wonderful."

Implementation Challenges

Interview participants indicated that reaching students with information concerning the resources and supports available through the Entrepreneurship Center has been a significant challenge across the course of the entire Nunez TAACCCT grant. "Getting the word out to the students was the biggest challenge, I think," commented one member of the Nunez TAACCCT staff,

> *I found out that students just do not read their e-mails, and I found that out the hard way. I had been posting bulletins all around the school and sending out e-mails to all of the students, and one of the students wandered into the [Entrepreneurship] Center and said they'd seen me around and wanted to know what I did at Nunez. After all the work I had put in to let them know who I was, I was curious, and I asked, "Did you receive your e-mail from me? And they said, "Well, let me look through my phone," and it was all right there, just pages of unopened e-mails. So I realized at that point that what we were doing just wasn't working.*

In spite of these initial challenges in reaching students, however, staff did report experiencing greater success after adopting new outreach strategies. Specifically, these strategies entailed reaching out to students who were already engaged and active in Entrepreneurship Center activities and having them distribute information concerning the center to their peers. "I went out and I spoke with students I had worked with one-on-one, and I asked if they would be willing to share their experiences with their classmates," continued to earlier interview participant, "And the next day they came into the [Entrepreneurship] Center with two friends, then those two friends brought their friends, and it turned out to be a much better method for reaching the students."

Another member of the Nunez TAACCCT staff communicated that a lack of communication and consensus among project personnel posed another significant obstacle to the implementation of student support services, stemming from disagreements between members of the project staff that resulted in several members of the team ultimately no longer being kept informed of project developments. Specifically, this disagreement concerned determining the best method for offering effective tutoring services to students in grant-funded programs of study, as Nunez had provided no tutoring services to students prior to receiving the Nunez TAACCCT grant. "We had no tutoring on this campus for anybody at all," explained an interview participant, continuing,

> *A couple of us saw that as a major problem. Students were not completing classes, they were not getting good grades, and yet we didn't have support mechanisms in place to help them. So what we wanted to do was to combine business faculty or people who could be business tutors with the English, the Math, and the Sciences so that students would just have one place to go to get tutored and it would be as simple and as streamlined as possible. However, some of the people higher up felt like it would be better if the tutors were kept separate, and by keeping them separate we would hire tutors and the tutors would let students know when they could get with him and they could decide when and where they wanted to go and what they wanted to work on. We had concerns with that because it is more work for the tutors and the students, and the way that we proposed to offering tutoring would allow us to have a system in place to easily track student data and monitor their progress.*

Project staff reported that this disagreement resulted in several members of the Nunez TAACCCT team no longer being included in future discussions concerning the grant. "After that discussion, I wouldn't be able to tell you anything about student support services," shared an interview participant. "We were told that they (Nunez TAACCCT grant leadership) were going to handle tutoring the way that they wanted and that was final, and then they just stopped including us."

Workforce and Employer Partner Engagement

Interview participants were asked to describe Nunez's efforts to engage partners and to explain the ways in which partnerships have been supporting the objectives of the Nunez TAACCCT project. Examples of ways in which partners can support the project include providing funding, advertising for the program in the community, and securing job placement for program interns and graduates.

Implementation Progress

Project staff reported that industry partners, for the most part, have been actively engaged in supporting the Nunez TAACCCT project and helping the project fulfill its objectives. Similar to information provided by TAACCCT personnel in previous data collection efforts, interview participants indicated that partners have made valuable contributions to the project through participation on advisory boards. These advisory boards provide TAACCCT staff with information concerning current trends in industry, identify important credentials for new professionals in the fields of businesses, hotel, restaurant, and tourism management, and facilitate connections between Nunez and members of the community. "The advisory boards have been instrumental,"

commented a member of the project staff, "They have provided great feedback and have helped us ensure alignment between our programs and industry needs." Another interview participant shared, "The advisory boards let us know what resources are available and make sure we are aware of what opportunities are available, such as conferences or other events where we can get a chance to network with students and workers."

Interview participants identified other ways in which partners have supported the Nunez TAACCCT project, as well. Specific support activities include providing guidance in curriculum development, assisting in student training placement (i.e., placing students in programs that align with their skills and interests), facilitating job placement for program interns and graduates, and leveraging resources (e.g., money, material infrastructure, etc.) to support the project. Several partners have also paid visits to the Entrepreneurship Center on the Nunez campus to sit in on student presentations and provide feedback on their work. Describing one such event, an interview participant shared,

> Our partners come in several times a semester and they'll listen to students' sales pitches and they act as judges. They give really good feedback on the students' work and let them know where they can improve. It's interesting to see because students give two sales pitches – one for a product they choose themselves, and then another pitch for a "bad" product that they get assigned. The partners seemed to enjoy watching the "bad" presentations, it looked like a lot of fun.

Another staff member identified a project partner that has provided a number of scholarships for students to enroll in Nunez TAACCCT programs, indicating that this partner has made it possible for multiple students to receive education and training that would have otherwise been unavailable. "Our partners have really just been wonderful and we would not be where we are now without them," commented a member of the project staff.

When asked to identify factors that may contribute to partners' involvement in the Nunez TAACCCT project, interview participants provided a variety of responses. Several members of the project staff shared the perspective that partners want to be involved in the training programs at Nunez as it allows them to have a role in facilitating the professional growth and development of potential future employees, giving them access to a high-caliber pool of workers. Other interview participants expressed the opinion that partners are willing to support the project as a result of the strong relationships that Nunez has fostered with members of the local community. "I think it's an issue of quantity vs. quality, in the end," explained an interview participant,

> We're a small school and so we don't put out the same numbers as a lot of larger institutions around the area, but that allows us to individualize our instruction for every student that walks through our door. I think partners realize that.

Implementation Successes

Staff shared successes that they have experienced in regard to partners' contributions to the Nunez TAACCCT project. Interview participants re-iterated the critical role that the advisory boards have played in curriculum development and job placement services. "Our entire goal with

this program was to have our students prepared to go into the industry and work, and our partners have played a big part in achieving that goal," commented an interview participant,

> *Seeing that happen, seeing our partners say that they have positions available and having students that were prepared and were able to go in and get those positions – that for me, is the biggest success. That would not have happened if not for the input we received from our partners… from the feedback they provided.*

Many staff members shared similar sentiments, expressing the opinion that the most notable success that has arisen from partner engagement in the Nunez TAACCCT project has been securing employment for program graduates. "Our partners helped us get the students where they needed to be in order to finish their programs, and they've taken it one step further by hiring the students that have finished their programs," reported an interview participant. Another member of the Nunez TAACCCT staff commented, "Our partnerships made our students stronger, our school stronger, and our partners stronger."

Implementation Challenges

Nunez TAACCCT project staff were also asked to identify any challenges that they have encountered regarding partner engagement, as well as to describe any strategies undertaken to navigate those challenges. Interview participants indicated that one such obstacle had emerged in regard to the Nunez TAACCCT's HRT program. Specifically, project staff indicated that partners had expressed concern regarding the program's low enrollment numbers and expressed frustration that the grant was not meeting its promised quota. "They [industry partners] were persistent, asking 'Where are we supposed to be with the grant? Why aren't we there?' They were really scrutinizing it," explained an interview participant,

> *They gave us ideas and shared strategies for things we could do, and eventually they took a look at what we'd done and said, "Look, the person you have running this right now is not doing what they need to do. This person is not the right person for the job right now. They're not getting it done." So we had to look at our staff, and we ended up replacing the individual who had been in charge of recruiting students.*

While communicating that it was unfortunate to lose a member of the project team, this interview participant went on to indicate that the new person who was hired to fill this role has performed an exemplary job and has doubled student enrollment rates. In turn, the interview participant indicated that partners were pleased that Nunez TAACCCT personnel had listened to their feedback and taken the course of action they had recommended. "It's just a shame we hired [the new staff member] so late into the grant, because [he/she] has just done such a phenomenal job," the interview participant added.

Project Impact on Local Community and Workforce

Staff were asked to comment on the extent to which they believe that the Nunez TAACCCT project is meeting the needs of the local workforce and community. For the most part, interview participants expressed the opinion that the grant has done so through providing students with

opportunities for hands-on, experiential learning utilizing industry recognized training and credentials as well as providing local employers with access to a highly qualified and skilled pool of program graduates for employment. "I think these [Nunez TAACCCT] programs are really starting to thrive and are helping the neighboring parishes in addition to St. Bernard," shared one member of the project staff, "The programs are spreading in reach and recognition." Other project members expressed different sentiments, however, indicating that they feel the Nunez TAACCCT project has missed its mark. "I think the idea of the grant was really spot on. This was very much needed and really important," shared one such interview participant,

> *That being said, getting buy-in is always a challenge. We ran into a lot of issues, like students starting programs and not finishing them, staff coming and going, [and] partners becoming frustrated. This (the Nunez TAACCCT project) had so much potential and it perplexes me that more members of the community didn't get involved because the outreach and the marketing have been there.*

Another member of the staff expressed the perspective that the impact of the Nunez TAACCCT project is contingent upon the mentality and attitude of those who interact with it. "I think the mature students with a goal and a plan take a lot away from their training, but some of the younger students often just go through the motions without really considering why they're here," he/she commented, "In my opinion, the same thing applies to partners and community members. If they invest in themselves and the program they seem to do wonderful, but the ones who don't participate as much won't take as much away."

Most interview participants indicated that they believe that, while community stakeholders initially responded positively to the Nunez TAACCCT project, interest and investment have waned over time. "I think the response was great when we first got going, we had lots of interest and people were excited," indicated an interview participant,

> *But as the program continued, it wasn't new to people anymore. Excitement would sort of ebb and flow depending what was happening, like if we opened a new lab people would show interest and then it would die down again, back and forth over and over. For whatever reason it just wasn't consistent, and it's unfortunate. I don't know what more we could have done.*

Another interview participant suggested that these fluctuations in public interest could have stemmed from the high-degree of staff turnover that has been present throughout the entirety of the Nunez TAACCCT project, commenting that community members would establish rapport with TAACCCT staff in specific positions only for those positions to be vacated, inhibiting further communication. "We had one gentleman, for instance, who was really the face of the project for some time, and when he left I stopped hearing about community events or involvement nearly as much," he/she reported.

Project Impact on Nunez Community College

Interview participants were asked to characterize the impact of the Nunez TAACCCT project on the college's ability to support student learning and success. Most project staff expressed

the opinion that the TAACCCT grant has provided a valuable opportunity for Nunez Community College to increase its capacity in this regard, with interview participants identifying various ways in which this has been achieved. Specifically, staff reported that the TAACCCT grant has strengthened the college's relationships with its industry partners and cultivated new relationships that would not otherwise exist, provided students with the opportunity to explore new career trajectories that had not been available prior to the grant, and facilitated student growth and development through the resources, guidance and tutoring provided by the Entrepreneurship Center. "This project brought up the idea of tutoring as at the forefront of student success and I believe it has made ensuring student access to tutoring and other support services a priority for this school," reported an interview participant, "Prior to the grant, this school had no tutoring services whatsoever. This has been huge for us."

Several interview participants also indicated that the implementation of the Nunez TAACCCT project has had a less positive impact on Nunez Community College, as well. Referring to aforementioned disagreements in the implementation of tutoring services, some project staff shared that their experiences working with colleagues on the TAACCCT project has undermined previously strong professional relationships with other Nunez faculty. "I'm uncomfortable sharing it, but it's important to know," commented one such interview participant,

I love this community and this school, but it seemed to me that you either agreed with the first idea that was put on the table or you were out. If you disagreed, then there was not much reason to come back and talk to you later.

Multiple interview participants communicated curiosity as to the impact the Nunez TAACCCT project could have had on the college had staffing remained consistent throughout the grant. Project staff reported that it was difficult to establish consistent processes and clear procedures with the continuous personnel changes that occurred, and several suggested that these changes resulted in a lack of communication that they feel inhibited project outcomes.

Project Sustainability and Transferability

Project staff communicated a sense of uncertainty as far as whether or not Nunez TAACCCT project components will continue to be offered following the expiration of grant funds. While interview participants indicated the certain aspects of the project are inherently more sustainable than others, such as the student-operated café as it "pays for itself," staff expressed concern regarding other components. "The HRT program just doesn't have the numbers we were hoping for," shared an interview participant,

The Louisiana budget is in a bit of a mess right now, and we're concerned about the HRT program being able to continue at full force since our enrollment numbers are so low. We have to be able to justify hiring a full-time instructor.

Several TAACCCT staff reported being unsure as to whether or not the Entrepreneurship Center would continue to remained open, as well. "The entrepreneurship program will

definitely be sustainable, but I don't know if we will have the money to keep the Entrepreneurship Center staffed full-time," commented one such interview participant, "Everything is just very hectic with the budget crisis in Louisiana right now. There are going to be big cuts and we need to justify every cent we spend."

Project staff shared that they believe the contributions of Nunez's industry partners will become that much more integral in sustaining project programs after the TAACCCT grant expires. Interview participants indicated that they are confident partners are up to the challenge, communicating that numerous partners have affirmed their commitment to the Nunez TAACCCT project even after the expiration of grant funds. "A lot of our partners are more active than the partners for other programs or other schools," said a member of the staff, "I think the good relationships that we have built with our partners will continue."

Interview participants reported that, for the most part, they are unaware of any efforts to ensure transferability of Nunez TAACCCT programs between Nunez and similar institutions. However, project staff communicated the opinion that replicating project components across other schools is feasible so long as the local culture of the surrounding community is appropriately accounted for. "I think, fundamentally, these programs are definitely doable at another place," commented an interview participant, "And they could do well to learn from our missteps. If they make sure their staff are going to stay for the entire grant and understand what is needed in their position, I think you can replicate the programs."

Additional Feedback

Interview participants were also provided with an opportunity to provide any additional feedback which they thought could inform an evaluation of the Nunez TAACCCT project. Similar to input provided regarding specific aspects of the project, additional staff feedback was generally mixed. Several interview participants took the opportunity to reaffirm the extent to which they perceive that the Nunez TAACCCT project has yielded positive outcomes for the local community and workforce, with multiple interview participants expressing gratitude for having received the opportunity to participate in the grant. "I'm very grateful for the grant because it brought a different atmosphere to the college," shared one such member of the project staff,

> *The furniture that we were able to buy, the areas that we were able to create… you could see the attitude of our faculty and staff and students change. Having the café on campus has been wonderful, having the space for the Entrepreneurship Center has been great. We have had people come to our campus, people who have been here before, and they see these changes and their jaws just drop. I think it is incredible how everything has come together.*

All staff, even those who provided less positive feedback, reiterated that they feel the overall aim of the Nunez TAACCCT was well-developed. "I think it was a great concept. There's a lot of potential for the fields that we focused on with this project, and it was really tailored to the local community and industry," commented an interview participant, "I hope that, now that the school

has learned how to work on grants of this nature, Nunez receives another opportunity to implement a similar program in the future."

Several members of the project staff were more critical of the Nunez TAACCCT project, expressing disappointment and frustration that it did not live up to their expectations. When asked if there were any significant factors that may have caused the project to fall short regarding specific objectives, one interview participant responded,

> *One of the biggest things is a lack of leadership. We had a roadmap of what we needed to do and where we wanted to be, but I don't think anybody took it in any one direction. We were kind of stuck in the middle of the trip the whole time. I just feel, and I've always felt, that we didn't have a spokesperson for the project until the end, we didn't have anybody in charge. Nobody was directing the ship.*

In spite of this, multiple staff members communicated that they are pleased with the progress that the project made in spite of the challenges and obstacles they encountered. "I would say, even with a lot of the challenges that we had, we figured out a way to kind of make things work," reported one interview participant,

> *And even if we had to go back and rework things a second time or a third time, or if it was just a few people working at it, I think we were pretty successful in completing the project to the standards that we set for us. I mean there's a few areas where we are peddling to make sure that we meet our goals, but it doesn't have anything to do with our performance. It's more data-related things, not being able to access the data that we need for our reporting. We have the numbers, but it's just making sure we can verify we have the numbers.*

When asked what could have been done differently, Nunez TAACCCT personnel stressed the importance of clear and consistent communication. "I don't think the issues we encountered were any one person's fault, but maybe we had the wrong people in the wrong roles because no one was talking to each other," explained an interview participant, "We needed more collaboration, but we treated our programs like they were all separate. But they weren't, and that's the problem. They were all a part of the same project, the same grant." Staff also recommended that future projects ensure that all personnel are aware of and understand the requirements for working on a grant, indicating that several of their colleagues appeared to not fully appreciate the logistics and procedures necessary for effective implementation.

Summary

Overall, project staff expressed mixed opinions regarding the implementation and effectiveness of the Nunez TAACCCT project. While many interview participants shared that they believe the Nunez TAACCCT project has met and continues to meet the needs of the local community and workforce, some members of the Nunez TAACCCT team expressed doubts and concerns as far as the extent to which the grant has been effective. Interviewed program personnel

reported that specific components of the Nunez TAACCCT project (e.g., experiential learning opportunities, student support services, and workforce and employer partner involvement and engagement) have each been fully implemented, but reported that they are largely uncertain concerning how many of these components will be sustainable following the eventual expiration of grant funds. In order for these programs to continue, project staff emphasized that industry partners must continue to engage with and support Nunez, and indicated that they feel confident that these partners will do so. While project staff indicated that they were currently unaware of any specific plans or strategies for transferability, they did communicate their belief that the Nunez TAACCCT project is highly transferable and could be successfully replicated across similar institutions. For the most part, project staff shared the belief that the Nunez TAACCCT project has achieved noteworthy success in spite of the challenges that arose during project implementation, and many members of the Nunez team expressed gratitude for the Nunez TAACCCT grant.

APPENDIX E: PARTNER SURVEY

Section I. General Information

The Nunez Community College TAACCCT project provides postsecondary education and training programs for individuals who are interested in obtaining two-year associate degrees, diplomas, or certificates in three disciplines, including (1) business administration; (2) entrepreneurship/small business management; and (3) HRT administration.

In this section, we would like to learn a little bit about your working relationship with the project.

1) With which industry do you most associate? (Choose the category that best describes you.)

○ Banking
○ Civic
○ Entrepreneur
○ Film
○ Finance
○ Food
○ Government
○ Non-Profit
○ Small Business

2) When did you become involved in the Nunez Community College TAACCCT project?

○ Before the project was funded (Before September 2012)
○ Since grant Year 1 (October 2012 to present)
○ Since grant Year 2 (October 2013 to present)
○ Since grant Year 3 (October 2014 to present)
○ Since grant Year 4 (October 2015 to present)

Section II. Program Involvement

In this section, we would like to learn more about your involvement with the grant activities. Please rate each item based on your knowledge and experiences with Nunez Community College's TAACCCT project.

3) As of today, to what extent have you personally been involved in the following project activities?

Project Activities	Rating of level of involvement from 1 (not involved at all) to 5 (highly involved)				
	1	2	3	4	5
Participant recruitment					
Recruit incumbent workers	①	②	③	④	⑤
Recruit TAA-eligible participants	①	②	③	④	⑤
Recruit veterans or spouses of veterans	①	②	③	④	⑤
Recruit underemployed participants	①	②	③	④	⑤

Project Activities	Rating of level of involvement from 1 (not involved at all) to 5 (highly involved)				
	1	2	3	4	5
Recruit long-term unemployed participants	①	②	③	④	⑤
Recruit other program participants	①	②	③	④	⑤
Curriculum design and development					
Assist in curriculum design and redesign to ensure the training provided is aligned with industry needs	①	②	③	④	⑤
Identify credentials that meet industry needs	①	②	③	④	⑤
Identify important knowledge and skill sets that meet industry needs	①	②	③	④	⑤
Technology and equipment support					
Provide facilities and equipment for training activities	①	②	③	④	⑤
Partnership support					
Assist in creating new partnerships to support project success	①	②	③	④	⑤
Student support and placement services					
Provide contextualized learning opportunities (e.g., paid or unpaid internships, or company/organization visits)	①	②	③	④	⑤
Identify services needed to support participant success	①	②	③	④	⑤
Provide graduate placement services (e.g., mock interviews and assistance in developing résumés)	①	②	③	④	⑤
Provide information related to job openings in your industry to Nunez Community College and its students	①	②	③	④	⑤
Offer job opportunities for Nunez Community College TAACCCT program graduates	①	②	③	④	⑤

4) Overall, how satisfied are you with your current level of involvement in the Nunez Community College TAACCCT project?

○ Strongly dissatisfied

○ Dissatisfied

○ Neutral

○ Satisfied

○ Very satisfied

5) Overall, how satisfied are you with Nunez Community College TAACCCT project staff's efforts to engage you in the program?

○ Strongly dissatisfied

○ Dissatisfied

○ Neutral

○ Satisfied

○ Very satisfied

6) In what areas would you like to become more involved? (Select all that apply)

○ Participant recruitment
○ Curriculum design and development
○ Technology and equipment support
○ Partnership support
○ Student support and placement services
○ None of the above (i.e., I am satisfied with my current level of involvement.)

7) Based on your experiences with the project, rate the quality of program implementation on each of the key project components. Please mark N/A if a certain TAACCCT project component has not yet been implemented or if you do not have experience with that particular aspect of the project.

Project Component	Rating of quality of project implementation from 1 (poor quality) to 5 (high quality)					
	1	2	3	4	5	N/A
Participant recruitment	①	②	③	④	⑤	⓪
Curriculum design and development	①	②	③	④	⑤	⓪
Technology and equipment support	①	②	③	④	⑤	⓪
Partnership support	①	②	③	④	⑤	⓪
Student support and placement services	①	②	③	④	⑤	⓪

Section III. Project Impact on the Industry and Local Community

In this section, we would like to learn more about your perceptions of the impact of Nunez Community College's TAACCCT project on participants, your industry, and the local community.

8) To what extent do you agree with the following statements?

Statement	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
a. Nunez TAACCCT programs offer certificate, diploma, and degree programs that meet industry needs.	①	②	③	④	⑤
b. Nunez TAACCCT programs prepare workers with the knowledge and skills needed to be successful in their field.	①	②	③	④	⑤
c. The Nunez TAACCCT project offers programs that support local workforce development.	①	②	③	④	⑤
d. Nunez TAACCCT programs prepare highly skilled workers who meet industry needs.	①	②	③	④	⑤
e. Nunez TAACCCT programs prepare highly skilled workers who meet my organization's needs.	①	②	③	④	⑤
f. The partnership between my organization and Nunez TAACCCT programs will continue and expand beyond the life of the grant period.	①	②	③	④	⑤
g. I will consider collaborating with Nunez Community College on other projects in the future.	①	②	③	④	⑤

9) How likely are you to recommend the Nunez Community College TAACCCT programs to companies, organizations, and community partners with which you collaborate?

- ◯ Not likely
- ◯ Somewhat likely
- ◯ Neutral
- ◯ Likely
- ◯ Very likely

10) How did you learn about the Nunez Community College TAACCCT project and become involved? (Select all that apply)

- ◯ I have an existing partnership with Nunez that started before the TAACCCT project began.
- ◯ I learned about the project from my coworkers or current employee(s).
- ◯ I learned about the project from a trade union/association.
- ◯ I learned about the project from a job fair/conference.
- ◯ I learned about the project from local/state workforce agencies.
- ◯ I learned about the project via print media (e.g., newspapers and magazines) or e-mail.
- ◯ I learned about the project via social media (e.g., Facebook, Twitter, or LinkedIn).
- ◯ The college reached out to my organization.
- ◯ The college reached out to me personally.
- ◯ Other (Please specify: _____)

Thank you for your participation in this survey!

APPENDIX E-1: SUMMER 2016 PARTNER SURVEY SUMMARY

Summer 2016 Partner Survey Summary

In June 2016, McREL evaluators administered a survey to Nunez Community College TAACCCT project partners, asking project partners to share their perspectives of and experiences with the Nunez Community College TAACCCT grant. A total of 10 partners responded to the survey, but only 8 of these survey participants responded to all items. Information provided by partners is summarized in the following tables.

General Information		
With which industry do you most associate? (Choose the category that best describes you.)		
--	--	Banking
1	10.0%	Civic
--	--	Entrepreneur
--	--	Film
--	--	Finance
--	--	Food
5	50.0%	Government
2	20.0%	Non-Profit
2	20.0%	Small Business
When did you become involved in the Nunez Community College TAACCCT project?		
1	10.0%	Before the project was funded (Before September 2012)
4	40.0%	Since grant Year 1 (October 2012 to present)
1	10.0%	Since grant Year 2 (October 2013 to present)
4	40.0%	Since grant Year 3 (October 2014 to present)
--	--	Since grant Year 4 (October 2015 to present)
How did you learn about the Nunez Community College TAACCCT project and become involved? (Select all that apply)		
5	31.3%	I have an existing partnership with Nunez that started before the TAACCCT project began.
1	6.3%	I learned about the project from my coworkers or current employee(s).
--	--	I learned about the project from a trade union/association.
--	--	I learned about the project from a job fair/conference.
1	6.3%	I learned about the project from local/state workforce agencies.
1	6.3%	I learned about the project via print media (e.g., newspapers and magazines) or e-mail.
--	--	I learned about the project via social media (e.g., Facebook, Twitter, or LinkedIn).
4	25.0%	The college reached out to my organization.
4	25.0%	The college reached out to me personally.
--	--	Other (Please specify)

As of today, to what extent have you personally been involved in the following project activities?

Project activities	n	Rating of level of involvement from 1 (not involved at all) to 5 (highly involved)				
		1	2	3	4	5
Participant recruitment						
Recruit incumbent workers	8	75.0%	12.5%	12.5%	--	--
Recruit TAA-eligible participants	8	75.0%	12.5%	12.5%	--	--
Recruit Veterans or spouses of Veterans	8	75.0%	12.5%	12.5%	--	--
Recruit underemployed participants	8	62.5%	12.5%	25.0%	--	--
Recruit long-term unemployed	8	75.0%	12.5%	12.5%	--	--
Recruit other program participants	8	50.0%	12.5%	25.0%	12.5%	--
Curriculum design and development						
Assist in curriculum design and redesign to ensure the training provided is aligned with industry needs	8	25.0%	--	50.0%	25.0%	--
Identify industry credentials that meet industry needs	8	25.0%	12.5%	25.0%	25.0%	12.5%
Identify important knowledge and skill sets that meet industry needs	8	12.5%	25.0%	12.5%	37.5%	12.5%
Technology and equipment support						
Provide facilities and equipment for training activities	8	87.5%	--	12.5%	--	--
Partnerships support						
Assist in creating new partnerships to support project success	8	12.5%	25.0%	25.0%	25.0%	12.5%
Student support and placement services						
Provide contextualized learning opportunities (e.g., paid or un-paid internships, company visits)	8	75.0%	12.5%	--	12.5%	--
Identify services needed to support participant success	8	12.5%	37.5%	25.0%	25.0%	--
Provide graduate placement services (e.g., mock interviews, assistance developing résumés)	8	50.0%	25.0%	25.0%	--	--
Provide information related to job openings in manufacturing fields to Nunez Community College and its students	8	37.5%	37.5%	25.0%	--	--
Offer job opportunities for Nunez Community College TAACCCT program graduates	8	75.0%	25.0%	--	--	--

Overall, how satisfied are you with your current level of involvement in the project? (n = 9)
-- Strongly dissatisfied
11.1% Dissatisfied
33.3% Neutral
33.3% Satisfied
22.2% Very satisfied
Overall, how satisfied are you with Nunez Community College TAACCCT project staff's effort to engage you the project? (n = 8)
-- Strongly dissatisfied
-- Dissatisfied
12.5% Neutral
50.0% Satisfied
37.5% Very satisfied
In what areas would you like to become more involved? (Select all that apply) (n = 11)
-- Participant recruitment
18.2% Curriculum design and development
9.1% Technology and equipment support
36.4% Partnership support
9.1% Student support and placement services
27.3% None of the above (e.g., I am satisfied with my current level of involvement)

What is your perceived quality of the following project components?

(Please mark N/A if you do not have experience with that particular aspect of the project.)

Project components	n	Rating of level of quality from 1 (poor) to 5 (high)					
		1	2	3	4	5	N/A
Participant recruitment	8	--	12.5%	25.0%	25.0%	--	37.5%
Curriculum design and development	8	--	--	--	50.0%	12.5%	37.5%
Technology and equipment support	8	--	12.5%	12.5%	25.0%	12.5%	37.5%
Partnership support	9	11.1%	11.1%	11.1%	44.4%	--	22.2%
Student support and placement services	8	--	12.5%	25.0%	12.5%	12.5%	37.5%

Project Impact on the Manufacturing Industry and Local Community

To what extent do you agree with the following statements?	n	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Nunez Community College TAACCCT programs offer certificate, diploma, and degree programs that meet industry needs.	8	--	--	12.5%	50.0%	37.5%
Nunez Community College TAACCCT programs prepare workers with the knowledge and skills needed to be successful in the manufacturing industry.	8	--	--	12.5%	62.5%	25.0%
The Nunez Community College TAACCCT project offers programs that support local workforce development.	8	--	--	12.5%	62.5%	25.0%
Nunez Community College TAACCCT programs prepare highly skilled workers who meet local industry needs.	8	--	--	12.5%	62.5%	25.0%
Nunez Community College TAACCCT programs prepare highly skilled workers who meet my organization's needs.	8	--	--	25.0%	50.0%	25.0%
The partnership between my company and Nunez Community College TAACCCT programs will continue and expand beyond the life of the grant period.	8	--	--	12.5%	37.5%	50.0%
I will consider collaborating with Nunez Community College on other projects in the future.	8	--	--	12.5%	37.5%	50.0%

How likely are you to recommend the Nunez Community College TAACCCT programs to companies, organizations, and community partners with which you collaborate? (n = 9)

--	Not likely
--	Somewhat likely
11.1%	Neutral
33.3%	Likely
55.6%	Very likely

Partner Survey Item Means

(Calculated as applicable for items with Likert-type response scales)

Below, mean scores and standard deviation are reported for participants' responses to Likert-type items included in the Nunez Community College TAACCCT Partner Survey. Respondents provided expressed their perspectives and experiences regarding specific project components across a five-point scale, wherein lower scores (e.g., 1 and 2) represented low involvement, low perceptions of quality, low levels of satisfaction, and/or low levels of agreement with survey statements, and higher scores (e.g., 4 and 5) represented frequent involvement, high perceptions of quality, high levels of satisfaction, and/or high levels of agreement with survey statements.

As of today, to what extent have you personally been engaged in the following project activities?	n	Mean	SD
Participant recruitment			
Recruit incumbent workers	8	1.38	0.74
Recruit TAA-eligible participants	8	1.38	0.74
Recruit Veterans or spouses of Veterans	8	1.38	0.74
Recruit underemployed participants	8	1.63	0.92
Recruit long-term unemployed	8	1.38	0.74
Recruit other program participants	8	2.00	1.20
Curriculum design and development			
Assist in curriculum design and redesign to ensure the training provided is aligned with industry needs	8	2.75	1.17
Identify industry credentials that meet industry needs	8	2.88	1.46
Identify important knowledge and skill sets that meet industry needs	8	3.13	1.36
Technology and equipment support			
Provide facilities and equipment for training activities	8	1.25	0.71
Partnerships support			
Assist in creating new partnerships to support project success	8	3.00	1.31
Student support and placement services			
Provide contextualized learning opportunities (e.g., paid or un-paid internships, company visits)	8	1.50	1.07
Identify services needed to support participant success	8	2.63	1.06
Provide graduate placement services (e.g., mock interviews, assistance developing résumés)	8	1.75	0.89
Provide information related to job openings in manufacturing fields to Nunez Community College and its students	8	1.88	0.84
Offer job opportunities for Nunez Community College TAACCCT program graduates	8	1.25	0.46

What is your perceived quality of the following project components? *(excluding those indicating "N/A")*	n	Mean	SD
Participant recruitment	8	2.00	1.78
Curriculum design and development	8	2.63	2.20
Technology and equipment support	8	2.25	2.05
Partnership support	9	2.44	1.74
Student support and placement services	8	2.13	1.96
Overall, how satisfied are you with . . .	**n**	**Mean**	**SD**
your current level of involvement in the project?	9	3.67	1.00
Nunez TAACCCT project staff's efforts to engage you in the project?	8	4.25	0.71
To what extent do you agree with the following statement?	**n**	**Mean**	**SD**
Nunez TAACCCT programs offer certificate, diploma, and degree programs that meet industry needs.	8	4.25	0.71
Nunez TAACCCT programs prepare workers with the knowledge and skills needed to be successful in the manufacturing industry.	8	4.13	0.64
The Nunez TAACCCT project offers programs that support local workforce development.	8	4.13	0.64
Nunez TAACCCT programs prepare highly skilled workers who meet local industry needs.	8	4.13	0.64
Nunez TAACCCT programs prepare highly skilled workers who meet my organization's needs.	8	4.00	0.90
The partnership between my company and Nunez TAACCCT programs will continue and expand beyond the life of the grant period.	8	4.38	0.74
I will consider collaborating with Nunez Community College on other projects in the future.	8	4.38	0.74

APPENDIX F: STUDENT EDUCATION RECORDS

Education Outcome Data

Seventy-one of 72 students provided information regarding Race, while 56 provided information regarding ethnicity. Of these students, most identified as being Black (47%), White (35%), or Hispanic (10%) in Race and as Black, Non-Hispanic (42%) or White, Non-Hispanic (24%) in Ethnicity. Four additional categories of Race and five additional categories of Ethnicity were also identified, but these responses are not represented in the table below due to fewer than ten participants being represented in each (see Table 1). The majority of students served by the Nunez TAACCCT grant were female (75%), while only 25% were male. Fifty-nine students are eligible to receive Pell Grant funding (82%). Less than 10 students were eligible for Disability or Veteran Benefits.

Table 1. Race and Ethnicity Data

Item	*n*	Response	Frequency	%
Race	71	Black	34	47.2
		White	25	34.7
		Hispanic	7	9.7
Ethnicity	56	Black, Non-Hispanic	30	41.7
		White, Non-Hispanic	17	23.6

*Race and ethnicity with a frequency <10 are not reported.
** Sum of percentages may not equal 100% due to missing data of insufficient frequencies.

Students identified twelve different concentrations, though the majority of students concentrated in Entrepreneurship or Business Administration. With 18 students (25%), Entrepreneurship is the highest represented concentration (see Table 2).

Table 2. Student Concentration Data

Item	n	Major	Frequency*	%**
Concentration	72	Louisiana Transfer Degree	--	--
		Business Administration	--	--
		Business Administration	15	20.8
		Hotel, Restaurant, and Tourism	--	--
		Medical Office Management	--	--
		Accounting	--	--
		Entrepreneurship	18	25.0
		Associate of General Studies	--	--
		Elementary Education	--	--
		Business Technology	--	--
		Medical Coding and Billing	--	--
		Culinary Arts	--	--
		Paramedic	--	--

*Assessments with a frequency <10 are not reported.
** Sum of percentages will not equal 100% due to missing data of insufficient frequencies.

The American College Testing (ACT) WorkKeys assessments were utilized to measure students' ability, skills, and interests to select participants into the grant program. Most students participated in these assessments (68%) (see Table 3).

Table 3. ACT WorkKeys Participation Data

Item	n	Total	Frequency	%
Participation in ACT WorkKeys assessments	72	Students who participated in ACT WorkKeys assessments	49	68.1
		Students who did not participate in ACT WorkKeys assessments	23	31.9

A total of 13 students reported they are in the process of earning an associate degree, all of whom indicated that they are earning an Associate of Applied Science, and 24 students reported they are in the process of working toward a Certificate of Applied Science (see Table 4).

Table 4. Degree and Certificate Attainment Data

Item	n	Frequency	%
Total number of students earning associates (aggregate across all enrollees)	72	13	18.1
Total number of students earning certificates (aggregate across all enrollees)		24	33.3

Note: A student could logically be going for a certificate and an associates degree. It is possible to get multiple certificates and an associates degree.

A number of students enrolled in programs falling under the Hotel, Restaurant, and Tourism (HRT) administration component of the Nunez TAACCCT grant also worked toward obtaining professional certifications. Specifically, seven students (10%) earned a Training for Intervention Procedures (TIPS) certificate, three students (4%) earned a ServSafe certificate, and nine students (13%) earned a Certified Guest Service Professional (CGSP) certificate (see Table 5).

Table 5. HRT Certification Attainment Data

Item	n	Frequency	%
Total number of students earning TIPS Alchohol certificates (aggregate across all enrollees)	72	7	9.7
Total number of students earning ServSafe certificates (aggregate across all enrollees)		3	4.2
Total number of students earning CGSP certificates (aggregate across all enrollees)		9	12.5

Students' average cumulative GPA is a C average (1.9) or higher. Overall, student's cumulative average GPA is 2.5. In 2016, students earned the highest average cumulative GPA with 2.7 (see Table 6).

Table 6. Student Cumulative GPA Data

Item	n	Year	Average GPA
Student grade point averages (GPA)	5	2014	1.9
	18	2015	2.3
	45	2016	2.7

*Sixty-eight students reported the year in which their enrollment in Nunez TAACCCT programs ended.

The statistics for students completing credit hours shows the increment in which students were completing courses. By Fall 2014, most students were enrolled and completing credit hours. The percentages of those completing credit hours are based on the total number of participating students rather than the total enrolled from semester to semester. For a further breakdown of this

information, refer to the following tables showing the number of students who completed all attempted credit hours and total credit hours earned (see Table 7).

Table 7. Credit Hour Completion Data

Item	*n**	Semester	Frequency	%**
Total number of students completing credit hours	71	Fall 2013	31	43.1
		Spring 2014	39	51.2
		Fall 2014	60	83.3
		Spring 2015	58	80.6
		Fall 2015	53	73.6
		Spring 2016	45	62.5

*Not all students were enrolled every year from 2013 to 2016.
 **Percentages represent those who <u>completed</u> credit hours by year (i.e., Total). To equal 100%, percentages would need to be compared to the equation (*n – freq)* to determine those who <u>did not complete</u> credit hours each semester rather than comparing percentages from semester to semester.

The table below further explains the trends of students completing credit hours. Though students were to complete credits, not all students completed all of the credits in which they were initially enrolled. Of the students who were enrolled in Nunez TAACCCT-affiliated programs across all semesters, only seven of them (10%) completed all attempted credit hours. After evaluating how many students were able to complete all attempted credit hours, the number of hours completed were compared to the number of hours earned. Schools may require a specific letter grade in courses for them to be considered earned toward the degree and may not count toward graduation merely because the student was able to complete a course. The credits completed and earned are not comparative across semesters due to the variations in enrollment (see Table 8).

Table 8. Credit Hour Completion Data Continued

Item	n	Completed/Earned	Credits	% Attempted Earned*	% Completed Earned**
Total number of credit hours (aggregate across all enrollees)	71	Attempted	6,375	72.1	88.2
		Completed	5,208		
		Earned	4,594.5		

 *Percentage earned is equal to the number of credit hours earned from the hours attempted.
 **Percentage earned is equal to the number of credit hours earned from the hours completed.