Examples of Previously Completed Program Reviews

Each of the following examples represent the different "styles" of the reviewers. All of these program were reviewed under the MoHEALTHWINs Grant, so there is a strong link to Health Sciences careers, but I have tried to give you different "fields". Some reviewers changed the Rubric questions into their statements or comments, rather than using the "Comments or recommendations:" text boxes, (see the second example below). Please don't do that, rather add your comments/recommendations in the Text areas below each section. Most of these examples are very positive because the institutions did a great job. They were chosen because of the thoroughness and/or professional efforts of the reviewers. The last two reviews provide you examples of programs/areas that were deemed as ineffective. Names of Colleges and Persons have been removed from all examples. However, it is very appropriate to name the institution or persons in your reviews. It just was not appropriate to leave names in these examples. Also, there are several grammatical errors that were left as they were and not corrected.

This is a very good SME Review of a Program of Study and the associated Internship.

BIS	Program/Student Learning Outcomes and Program Map	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
BIS	Program CIP code/s appropriate to program title and outcomes Program: EET: 226 (011402) – Biomedical Instrumentation Systems		X		
BIS	Effective program structure (prerequisites, course sequence, delivery methods, classroom/laboratory blend, stackable credential-structure provide a clear, logical "map" to completion for adult students)		x (note 1)		
BIS	Outcomes aligned to occupational focus (industry skills and standards)		X		
BIS	Outcomes clearly stated	x			
BIS	Outcomes introduced/reinforced effectively	x			
BIS	Evidence of capstone assessment (licensure, industry certification, capstone project or TSA)		x (note 2)		
BIS	**Comments or recommendations:**				
BIS	1. A rating of "Very Good" was given for "effective program structure" since many employers prefer that prospective Biomedical Equipment Technician (BMET) interns or employment candidates to have a certain amount of hands on knowledge (IE: laboratory experience). This program relies upon the student attending EET 175 Biomedical Technology Internship for laboratory (hands on) experience.				
BIS	2. Content of this course supports the student with the knowledge to gain a certification as a Certified Biomedical Equipment Technician (CBET) through the organization known as the Association for the Advancement of Medical Instrumentation (AAMI). AAMI is referenced in the in course material, but the topic of CBET is not specifically covered.				
BIS	**Course Objectives**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
BIS	Appropriate to course level	x			

		Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
BIS	Clearly stated from student perspective	x			
BIS	Measurable	x			
BIS	Address/support one or more outcome	x			
BIS	**Comments or recommendations:**				
BIS	Course objectives are clearly stated throughout the entire program. Students should have a very clear understating of the requirements to successfully complete this course.				
BIS	**Module or Unit Objectives**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
BIS	Clearly linked to course objectives	x			
BIS	Address one or more course objective	x			
BIS	Clearly stated from student perspective	x			
BIS	Measurable	x			
BIS	**Comments or recommendations:**				
BIS	Module or unit objectives are clearly stated throughout the entire program. Students should have a very clear understating of the requirements to successfully complete assigned module objective.				
BIS	**Instructional Materials and Lab Resources**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
BIS	Support stated course and module or unit learning objectives	x			
BIS	Meet/reflect current industry practices and standards			x note 1	
BIS	Provide options for multiple learning styles		x		
BIS	Resources/materials are cited properly	x			
BIS	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success		x note 2		
BIS	**Comments and recommendations:**				
BIS	1. Biomedical Equipment Maintenance programs are currently in need of Biomedical Equipment Technicians (BMET) with Information Systems Technology (IT) skillsets. Specifically, a background in IT network technologies. This course presents the student with an overview of medical systems as it relates to patient monitoring, but does not fully address network technologies as they are applied in today's hospital environment.				
BIS	2. Online content does not support the hands on learning often required to support the adult student in their learning experience.				
BIS	**Learning Activities**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
BIS	Promote achievement of stated module or unit objectives	x			
BIS	Materials/resources (to include equipment, tools and software) are presented in a way that students understand purpose and use in healthcare and other industry settings		x note 1		
BIS	Provide opportunities for interaction and active learning		x		
BIS	Provide options for multiple learning styles		x		
BIS	Linked to current industry practices and standards		x note 2		
BIS	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success		x		
BIS	**Comments and recommendations:**				
BIS	1. Rating of "Very Good" based on lack of hands on laboratory and lack of discussion pertaining to Computerized Maintenance Management Systems under the topic of Safety.				

BIS	2. Recommendation/Consideration: To revise the Safety section to include additional information on regulations in a healthcare environment as they pertain to medical equipment support. (Regulations specific to The Joint Commission's Environment of Care standards , Centers for Medicare and Medicaid and AAMI standards for dialysis should be added)				
BIS	**Assessment Tools/Criteria for Evaluation**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
BIS	Measure stated learning objectives and link to industry standards		x		
BIS	Align with course activities and resources	x			
BIS	Include specific and descriptive criteria for evaluation of student work/participation	x			
BIS	Sequenced throughout instructional period to enable students to build on feedback		x		
BIS	Varied and appropriate to content	x			
BIS	Provide opportunities for students to measure their own learning progress	x			
BIS	**Comments and recommendations:**				
BIS	Course objectives are clearly stated throughout the entire program. Students should have a very clear understating of their leaning progress to successfully complete this course.				
BIS	**Innovative or enhanced strategies**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
BIS	Evidence industry input/standards in program design and curricular components		x note 1		
BIS	Evidence of program enhancements to support adult learner		x note 1		
BIS	If program has run long enough, is there evidence that enhancements to it have improved pass rates?	NA note 2			
BIS	**Comments or recommendations:**				
BIS	1. Rating of "Very Good" is based on the lack of hands on laboratory training that often aids the adult learner.				
BIS	2. Not assessed in this review.				
BETI	**Program/Student Learning Outcomes and Program Map**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
BETI	Program CIP code/s appropriate to program title and outcomes Program: EET: 175 – Biomedical Equipment Technology Internship		x		
BETI	Effective program structure (prerequisites, course sequence, delivery methods, classroom/laboratory blend, stackable credential-structure provide a clear, logical "map" to completion for adult students)	x note 1			
BETI	Outcomes aligned to occupational focus (industry skills and standards)	x			
BETI	Outcomes clearly stated	x			
BETI	Outcomes introduced/reinforced effectively	x			
BETI	Evidence of capstone assessment (licensure, industry certification, capstone project or TSA)	x note 2			
BETI	**Comments or recommendations:**				

BETI	1. A rating of "Exceptional" was given for "effective program structure" since many employers prefer that prospective Biomedical Equipment Technician (BMET) employment candidates to have attended a Biomedical Technology Internship for hands on experience.				
BETI	2. Content of this course supports the student with the knowledge to gain a certification as a Certified Biomedical Equipment Technician (CBET) through the organization known as the Association for the Advancement of Medical Instrumentation (AAMI).				

BETI	**Course Objectives**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
BETI	Appropriate to course level	x			
BETI	Clearly stated from student perspective	x			
BETI	Measurable	x note 1			
BETI	Address/support one or more outcome	x			
BETI	**Comments or recommendations:**				
BETI	Course objectives are clearly stated throughout the entire program. Students should have a very clear understating of the requirements to successfully complete this course.				
BETI	1. Internship course has measurable outcomes through the use of a daily journal. This is a "Best Practice" to have this included in the program. It allows not only the instructor to review the student's progress, but also provides a document the student can share with a prospective employer. (Very important for adult learners undergoing study for career change)				

BETI	**Module or Unit Objectives**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
BETI	Clearly linked to course objectives	x			
BETI	Address one or more course objective	x			
BETI	Clearly stated from student perspective	x			
BETI	Measurable	x			
BETI	**Comments or recommendations:**				
BETI	Module or unit objectives are clearly stated throughout the entire program. Students should have a very clear understating of the requirements to successfully complete assigned module objective.				

BETI	**Instructional Materials and Lab Resources**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
BETI	Support stated course and module or unit learning objectives	NA			
BETI	Meet/reflect current industry practices and standards	x note 1			
BETI	Provide options for multiple learning styles	NA			
BETI	Resources/materials are cited properly	NA			
BETI	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success	x note 2			
BETI	**Comments and recommendations:**				
BETI	1. This is a "Best Practice" to have this as part of the program. It allows not only the instructor to review the student's progress, but also provides a document the student can share with a prospective employer.				
BETI	2. Very important for adult learners undergoing a career change.				

BETI	**Learning Activities**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
BETI	Promote achievement of stated module or unit objectives	x			

BETI					
BETI	Materials/resources (to include equipment, tools and software) are presented in a way that students understand purpose and use in healthcare and other industry settings	NA			
BETI	Provide opportunities for interaction and active learning	x note 1			
BETI	Provide options for multiple learning styles	NA			
BETI	Linked to current industry practices and standards	x note 1			
BETI	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success	x note 2			
BETI	**Comments and recommendations:**				
BETI	1. This is a "Best Practice" to have this as part of the program. It allows not only the instructor to review the student's progress, but also provides a document the student can share with a prospective employer.				
BETI	2. Very important for adult learners undergoing a career change.				
BETI	**Assessment Tools/Criteria for Evaluation**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
BETI	Measure stated learning objectives and link to industry standards	x			
BETI	Align with course activities and resources	x			
BETI	Include specific and descriptive criteria for evaluation of student work/participation	x			
BETI	Sequenced throughout instructional period to enable students to build on feedback	x			
BETI	Varied and appropriate to content	x			
BETI	Provide opportunities for students to measure their own learning progress	x			
BETI	**Comments and recommendations:**				
BETI	Course objectives are clearly stated throughout the entire program. Students should have a very clear understating of their leaning progress to successfully complete this course.				
BETI	**Innovative or enhanced strategies**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
BETI	Evidence industry input/standards in program design and curricular components	x note 1			
BETI	Evidence of program enhancements to support adult learner	x			
BETI	If program has run long enough, is there evidence that enhancements to it have improved pass rates?	NA note 2			
BETI	**Comments or recommendations:**				
BETI	1. The Internship Program is an integral part of the larger Biomedical training program being offered by [College name removed]. It is accompanied by EET 226 Biomedical Instrumentation Systems, EET 225 Radiology Imaging, to include the offerings of both EET 110 Medical Terminology and EET 105 Applied Human Anatomy and Physiology. All these courses combined provide the student with the knowledge that employers are looking for in today's Health Care environment as it applies to Medical Equipment Support programs.				
BETI	2. Not assessed in this review.				

MAIN	**Program/Student Learning Outcomes and Program Map**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
MAIN	Program CIP code/s appropriate to program title and outcomes. Program: Building Maintenance			X	
MAIN	Effective program structure (prerequisites, course sequence, delivery methods, classroom/laboratory blend, stackable credential-structure provide a clear, logical "map" to completion for adult students)		X		
MAIN	Outcomes aligned to occupational focus (industry skills and standards)		X		
MAIN	Outcomes clearly stated		X		
MAIN	Outcomes introduced/reinforced effectively		X		
MAIN	Evidence of capstone assessment (licensure, industry certification, capstone project or TSA)		X		
MAIN	**Comments or recommendations:**				
MAIN	Healthcare Facility Maintenance would be a more appropriate title for this program and represent the joining of Building Maintenance and with Environmental Services skills, requested by local healthcare facilities. It would better reflect the intended employment and emphasize the program as more than *general* building maintenance, but rather the more specialized and infectious control environment of a healthcare facility.				
MAIN	Overall this is a very good program that could be adopted by any community college with a good building maintenance program and a strong partnership with local hospitals.				
MAIN	**Course Objectives**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
MAIN	Appropriate to course level		X		
MAIN	Clearly stated from student perspective		X		
MAIN	Measurable		X		
MAIN	Address/support one or more outcome		X		
MAIN	**Comments or recommendations:**				
MAIN	The Building Maintenance portion of this program is well documented and the infectious control and environmental services skills, requested by local industry, have been integrated.				
MAIN	**Module or Unit Objectives**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
MAIN	Clearly linked to course objectives		X		
MAIN	Address one or more course objective		X		
MAIN	Clearly stated from student perspective		X		
MAIN	Measurable		X		
MAIN	**Comments or recommendations:**				
MAIN	This is a solid program with Objectives, Activities and Outcomes illustrated effectively, logically sequenced and readily apparent to all students.				
MAIN	**Instructional Materials and Lab Resources**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
MAIN	Support stated course and module or unit learning objectives		X		

MAIN					
MAIN	Meet/reflect current industry practices and standards	X			
MAIN	Provide options for multiple learning styles		X		
MAIN	Resources/materials are cited properly		X		
MAIN	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success		X		
MAIN	**Comments and recommendations:**				
MAIN	Multiple learning styles are addressed and adult learners are fully supported.				
MAIN	The utilization of the Allied Health Simulation Center (laboratories for nursing and medical programs) is a best practice, supporting relevant learning, enriching the students with different perspectives of infectious control and job responsibilities. It is exceptional management to further utilize existing resources in support of a new program.				

MAIN	**Learning Activities**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
MAIN	Promote achievement of stated module or unit objectives		X		
MAIN	Materials/resources (to include equipment, tools and software) are presented in a way that students understand purpose and use in healthcare and other industry settings		X		
MAIN	Provide opportunities for interaction and active learning		X		
MAIN	Provide options for multiple learning styles		X		
MAIN	Linked to current industry practices and standards		X		
MAIN	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success		X		
MAIN	**Comments and recommendations:**				
MAIN	Learning activities commensurate with course and module objectives are fully documented. The use of actual employer training documents, site visits, internet and multi-media resources, and hands-on activities provide a broad spectrum of learning opportunities addressing multiple styles and adult learners.				

MAIN	**Assessment Tools/Criteria for Evaluation**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
MAIN	Measure stated learning objectives and link to industry standards		X		
MAIN	Align with course activities and resources		X		
MAIN	Include specific and descriptive criteria for evaluation of student work/participation			X	
MAIN	Sequenced throughout instructional period to enable students to build on feedback		X		
MAIN	Varied and appropriate to content		X		
MAIN	Provide opportunities for students to measure their own learning progress		X		
MAIN	**Comments and recommendations:**				
MAIN	Due to the use of hospital trainers (employees, not equipment) at the local hospitals, specific and descriptive criteria should be used to assess student achievement on objectives 18, 20, 24, 25, 26 to ensure consistency between hospital trainers and healthcare facilities.				

MAIN	**Innovative or enhanced strategies**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
MAIN	Evidence industry input/standards in program design and curricular components	X			
MAIN	Evidence of program enhancements to support adult learner		X		

MAIN	If program has run long enough, is there evidence that enhancements to it have improved pass rates?	X			
MAIN	**Comments or recommendations:**				
MAIN	This is a very good program. It is well designed and well documented.				
MAIN	The cooperative relationship between the institution and the local healthcare facilities, in defining, designing and the delivery of this curriculum is a Best Practice. The results will be highly employable students and enthusiastic, confident employers, which is precisely the purpose of the grant and the mission of Missouri Community Colleges.				

An example of an e very exceptional program, with well written comments. It is apparent the reviewer communicated with the college and gathered additional facts, allowing for a thorough and professional review of the curriculum. The reviewer utilized "underlining" to separate comments related to an additional course.

HITT	**Program/Student Learning Outcomes and Program Map**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
HITT	Program CIP code/s appropriate to program title and outcomes. Program: Healthcare IT Technician (HIT Tech)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
HITT	Effective program structure (prerequisites, course sequence, delivery methods, classroom/laboratory blend, stackable credential-structure provide a clear, logical "map" to completion for adult students)	X			
HITT	Outcomes aligned to occupational focus (industry skills and standards)	X			
HITT	Outcomes clearly stated	X			
HITT	Outcomes introduced/reinforced effectively	X			
HITT	Evidence of capstone assessment (licensure, industry certification, capstone project or TSA)		X		
HITT	**Comments or recommendations:**				
HITT	This program consists of one additional course beyond all of the ones found in the IT Help Desk/ End User Support Specialist program. Therefore, I have included all of the comments from that review, and new comments pertaining to the HIT course will be under those and underlined.				

HITT	The Help Desk/End User Support Specialist Program at [College name removed], in my opinion, receives an overall rating of Exceptional, and should be a leading model to study when other institutions look to build or improve related offerings. The clear and thorough documentation should be noted and commended. One thing that immediately separated this program from similar ones is the broad range of exposure and training that the students will receive. While one program might focus solely on getting someone to an A+ level of competency, this program includes additional courses such as Networking, Linux, Help Desk/Customer Service, Business applications, and other professional skills. I also think the inclusion of the Information Security/Assurance course is of utmost importance and truly helps create the well-rounded IT professional. Not only are they included, but they also map directly towards industry standard stackable credentials.
HITT	I think the courses are sequenced well, however, I would review the pre-requisites to make sure they are consistent. For example, the Help Desk Course required basic computer literacy whereas the Cisco course only required reading proficiency. I like the course ordering, but I would make sure people are prepared to enter the higher-level courses. This is especially important in cases where courses are shorter than what is generally thought of as a traditional semester.
HITT	Again, this is a solid model and I think a student that successfully completes the courses, and is able to learn and grow from all of the resources provided, they would definitely have a competitive edge when applying for entry-level positions. For an incumbent worker, or someone else with prior experience, the credentials that can be earned while studying this program could very well lead to a promotion or a pay increase.
HITT	Adding a HIT course on top the solid foundation really prepares students well for an IT position in a healthcare setting.

HITT	**Course Objectives**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
HITT	Appropriate to course level	X			
HITT	Clearly stated from student perspective	X			
HITT	Measurable	X			
HITT	Address/support one or more outcome	X			
HITT	**Comments or recommendations:**				
HITT	Course objectives for all courses are clearly stated. They are measurable and it is very clear to the student that the course objectives map towards industry credentials. While the objectives are appropriate for the course levels, assuming the student is adequately prepared, I think that some challenging objectives as given add rigor to the courses and ultimately credibility to the program.				
HITT	Mapping towards the CompTIA Healthcare IT Technician Certification adds rigor and validity to the curriculum. It is also great credential that prepares you for further studies in HIT. I would recommend taking this course at the end of the program since having A+ level or equivalent knowledge is recommended for those seeking certification.				

HITT	**Module or Unit Objectives**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
HITT	Clearly linked to course objectives	X			
HITT	Address one or more course objective	X			

HITT	Clearly stated from student perspective	X			
HITT	Measurable	X			
HITT	**Comments or recommendations:**				
HITT	Unit objectives are very clear for each course. Each course syllabus also provided a detailed course schedule which helps students stay organized and prepared. Module objectives do an excellent job of reinforcing the course objectives.				
HITT	The information above accurately reflects the HIT course also.				
HITT	**Instructional Materials and Lab Resources**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
HITT	Support stated course and module or unit learning objectives	X			
HITT	Meet/reflect current industry practices and standards	X			
HITT	Provide options for multiple learning styles	X			
HITT	Resources/materials are cited properly	X			
HITT	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success	X			
HITT	**Comments and recommendations:**				
HITT	Textbooks chosen are written directly for students preparing for certifications. Also, the required textbooks reflect the current industry certification exams. Courses include a variety of learning materials beyond the textbooks including online tools, videos, and hands-on learning. This would be beneficial to those with different learning styles or for those who needed instant remediation on a particular topic. Using online resources such as Cisco NetSpace for curriculum delivery rather than requiring physical textbooks is one good example of innovation in this program. Those types of delivery methods also help keep costs down for students.				
HITT	In addition to the resources provided in other courses, the syllabus for this course specifically mentions the Interactive Learning Center and Academic Data Center where students can go for extra help. This intrusive support could be incredibly beneficial to those trying to focus on studies and finish strong.				
HITT	**Learning Activities**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
HITT	Promote achievement of stated module or unit objectives	X			
HITT	Materials/resources (to include equipment, tools and software) are presented in a way that students understand purpose and use in healthcare and other industry settings	X			
HITT	Provide opportunities for interaction and active learning	X			
HITT	Provide options for multiple learning styles	X			
HITT	Linked to current industry practices and standards	X			
HITT	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success	X			
HITT	**Comments and recommendations:**				
HITT	Activities are relevant and clearly are designed to reinforce course objectives. As stated above, course activities include a mix of reading, writing, critical thinking, use of online tools, as well as practical skills application. The use of Cisco Packet Tracer is one way this program offers real world experience to an environment possible with limited resources. Other courses in the program offer a variety of hands on learning activities. One thing I find notable is the emphasis many activities put on critical thinking and/or research, both of which are necessary skills of a successful IT professional.				

HITT	This course offers a nice mix of traditional reading, outside resources, multimedia, and hands-on activities. This course builds on prior IT skills and help focus them for a Healthcare setting.				
HITT	**Assessment Tools/Criteria for Evaluation**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
HITT	Measure stated learning objectives and link to industry standards	X			
HITT	Align with course activities and resources	X			
HITT	Include specific and descriptive criteria for evaluation of student work/participation	X			
HITT	Sequenced throughout instructional period to enable students to build on feedback	X			
HITT	Varied and appropriate to content	X			
HITT	Provide opportunities for students to measure their own learning progress	X			
HITT	**Comments and recommendations:**				
HITT	This program includes a good mix of formative and summative assessments delivered in a variety of formats. One thing I think the Computer Applications in Business course does well is require an industry certification practice test as part of the final grade. This helps show students how the skills they are learning actually do prepare them for certification as well as helps them gauge their readiness to sit for an actual exam. Using this strategy in other course might be a strong move to help keep students engaged and to encourage certification attainment. Additionally, more skills-based final assessments might help strengthen some of the courses. That said, the exams in these courses appear to be rigorous and to thoroughly cover all of the course objectives.				
HITT	One thing in particular I like about this course is the inclusion of practice tests for the real CompTIA HIT Technician exam. This helps keep students focused on working towards the credential, as well as helping them stay focused on the items relevant to industry.				
HITT	**Innovative or enhanced strategies**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
HITT	Evidence industry input/standards in program design and curricular components	X			
HITT	Evidence of program enhancements to support adult learner	X			
HITT	If program has run long enough, is there evidence that enhancements to it have improved pass rates?	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
HITT	**Comments or recommendations:**				
HITT	One of the main strengths of this program is that it is built around relevant, industry standard, stackable credentials. Students are exposed to a variety of learning methods which helps connect with an audience with different learning styles. Things such as videos, plenty of experiential learning opportunities, use of online tools, and effective textbooks all help increase engagement in the coursework. Another major innovative approach of this program is that is was designed in a way to address the real types of education and skills required to attain employment in an IT position. Including information security, networking, and Linux, in addition to the traditional desktop support and customer service course adds significant value to the program and will ultimately lead to stronger and better-prepared professionals.				

HITT	The statement above accurate reflects the HIT course as well as this entire program. This is a strong program that would adequately prepare a student for an entry-level position and have them poised to successfully continue their learning.

In the example the reviewer used the "comments or recommendations" area very well to document the review. This method is acceptable. In the next example of a similar program, notice the reviewer used a number reference in the rating boxes to reference each comment. Either way is acceptable if you are clear, concise and consistent with your comments.

C.N.A	Program/Student Learning Outcomes and Program Map	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
C.N.A	Program CIP code/s appropriate to program title and outcomes. Program: C.N.A.	N/A			
C.N.A	Effective program structure (prerequisites, course sequence, delivery methods, classroom/laboratory blend, stackable credential-structure provide a clear, logical "map" to completion for adult students)	X			
C.N.A	Outcomes aligned to occupational focus (industry skills and standards)	X			
C.N.A	Outcomes clearly stated	X			
C.N.A	Outcomes introduced/reinforced effectively	X			
C.N.A	Evidence of capstone assessment (licensure, industry certification, capstone project or TSA)	X			
C.N.A	Comments or recommendations:				
C.N.A	Curriculum Map very thorough and addressed how each lesson met the course outcomes--complete. Covered all topics presented in the course and certification. The course outcomes aligned with the skills and standards required for a nursing assistant and the stackable credential of obtaining certification in the healthcare field. Confirmed that the course also provides certification in CPR and in Professional Training.				
C.N.A	Course Objectives	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
C.N.A	Appropriate to course level	X			
C.N.A	Clearly stated from student perspective	X			
C.N.A	Measurable	X			
C.N.A	Address/support one or more outcome	X			
C.N.A	Comments or recommendations:				
C.N.A	Course objectives are concise, clearly stated and measurable. Per the Curriculum map one can observe the threads that exist between the lessons, and the learning outcomes.				
C.N.A	Module or Unit Objectives	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
C.N.A	Clearly linked to course objectives	X			

C.N.A	Address one or more course objective	X			
C.N.A	Clearly stated from student perspective	X			
C.N.A	Measurable	X			
C.N.A	**Comments or recommendations:**				
C.N.A	The objectives are clearly stated and measurable as demonstrated on the Curriculum map. There is visible link between the unit objectives and the 8 course objectives. Under Unit Objectives-Unit 5 I noticed that Lesson 10 just needs 'Skin Care' added to the title and Lesson 11 is missing its title, 'Preventing and Caring For Pressure Ulcers'. In the syllabus under the section 'Student Learning Outcomes, might want to consider adding the statement 'as evidenced by a passing score (at least 80%) on written or oral tests and competent demonstration of clinical skills' to Outcome number 1 to match the sheet 'Certified Nurse Assistant Course Outcomes'- that would then tie in certification and the clinical component.				
C.N.A	**Instructional Materials and Lab Resources**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
C.N.A	Support stated course and module or unit learning objectives	X			
C.N.A	Meet/reflect current industry practices and standards	X			
C.N.A	Provide options for multiple learning styles	X			
C.N.A	Resources/materials are cited properly	X			
C.N.A	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success	X			
C.N.A	**Comments and recommendations:**				
C.N.A	Uses the required text from the State that is from 2001. Uses videos and DVD's. Most within 5 years old. I noticed that there is a series used from HcPro (2005) and one on Alzheimer's care that you might consider finding something more current. I realize that some of the older series has information that isn't presented in the newer versions which may be why they are being utilized.				
C.N.A	I noticed that there was no reference to using other resource books for nurse assistants. They can offer additional information, pictures and give ideas for new questions and present new learning activities. Might consider adding those to the list. Uses worksheets, exams, a variety of manikins and equipment/supplies that the student would come across in the workplace. Confirmed that the course utilizes the required State pink skills sheets for clinical.				
C.N.A	**Learning Activities**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
C.N.A	Promote achievement of stated module or unit objectives	X			
C.N.A	Materials/resources (to include equipment, tools and software) are presented in a way that students understand purpose and use in healthcare and other industry settings	X			
C.N.A	Provide opportunities for interaction and active learning	X			
C.N.A	Provide options for multiple learning styles	X			
C.N.A	Linked to current industry practices and standards	X			
C.N.A	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success	X			
C.N.A	**Comments and recommendations:**				

C.N.A	Includes online projects per the syllabus. Utilizes a large variety of learning activities for the student. Observed that the one example of a learning activity included both multiple choice and true/false questions. The Overview Table depicts the activities for the unit level objectives. The learning activities allows for student/ instructor input and feedback. Confirmed that area nursing homes are utilized as required by the State for the 100 hours of on-the-job training.				

C.N.A	**Assessment Tools/Criteria for Evaluation**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
C.N.A	Measure stated learning objectives and link to industry standards	X			
C.N.A	Align with course activities and resources	X			
C.N.A	Include specific and descriptive criteria for evaluation of student work/participation	X			
C.N.A	Sequenced throughout instructional period to enable students to build on feedback	X			
C.N.A	Varied and appropriate to content	X			
C.N.A	Provide opportunities for students to measure their own learning progress	X			
C.N.A	**Comments and recommendations:**				
C.N.A	The Overview Table does an excellent job of showing how the instructor is going to assess learning. It pulls together the activities and resources that will be utilized to meet the unit objectives and lead to the course outcomes. An example of one of the required clinical skills sheets was included. Might consider adding the Mo. Dept. of Health and Senior Services Certified Competency Score Sheet (Appendix A/B) in this section. It includes the competencies that the student must perform and the student's personal competencies. Verified that all required State paper work is utilized.				

C.N.A	**Innovative or enhanced strategies**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
C.N.A	Evidence industry input/standards in program design and curricular components	X			
C.N.A	Evidence of program enhancements to support adult learner	X			
C.N.A	If program has run long enough, is there evidence that enhancements to it have improved pass rates?	Not available.			
C.N.A	**Comments or recommendations:**				

C.N.A	As stated in the syllabus the course will be presented in a hybrid or partially online format. There is an attendance policy in place. During the course if a student experiences difficulties demonstrated by scoring less than 80% on a unit multiple choice examination or skills check off, a counseling contract is completed to ensure that the student understands and knows what must be done to successfully complete the course. The instructor will assist the student in implementation of the remediation plan. If a student fails to perform all previously learned nursing skills satisfactorily in clinical a remediation plan may be initiated. There is a course evaluation policy in place that complies with the required state guidelines. Prior to the course the student's ability to read and write in order to ensure success is demonstrated through the use of Work Keys. The program includes co-requisites- CPR and Professionalism Training which enhance employability of the student. The course demonstrates the integration of technical and academic competencies on both the curriculum map and the overview table of course components. Academic assistance is available through Academic Resource Commons (ARC). Technical assistance is also available to those who may need it. The Office of Disabilities Accommodations provides accommodations or academic adjustments for a documented disability. The course permits the student the flexibility to work within their schedule- days, evenings or weekends and is not set within an allotted time frame permitting the student to get the required 75 hours of classroom and 100 hours of on-the-job training at the student's pace. The course has just be initiated therefore pass rates are unable to evaluated at this time.
C.N.A	[College name removed] did a fantastic job in presenting their program. Very thorough and well thought out Curriculum Map and Overview Table of Course Components.

Another example of a C.N.A. Program. Notice how the reviewer utilized a number system to reference their comments.

C.N.A	Program/Student Learning Outcomes and Program Map	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
C.N.A	Program CIP code/s appropriate to program title and outcomes. Program: Certified Nurse Assistant	1			
C.N.A	Effective program structure (prerequisites, course sequence, delivery methods, classroom/laboratory blend, stackable credential-structure provide a clear, logical "map" to completion for adult students)	2			
C.N.A	Outcomes aligned to occupational focus (industry skills and standards)	3			
C.N.A	Outcomes clearly stated	4			
C.N.A	Outcomes introduced/reinforced effectively	5			
C.N.A	Evidence of capstone assessment (licensure, industry certification, capstone project or TSA)	6			
C.N.A	**Comments or recommendations:**				

C.N.A				
C.N.A	1: Program CIP codes are appropriate to program title and outcome with code IRA (introduced, reinforced, assessed)			
C.N.A	2: Program structure is effective and provides students with stackable credentials.			
C.N.A	3: Outcomes are aligned with current industry standards			
C.N.A	4: The documentation provided clearly states that the course work is to prepare students for the state exam			
C.N.A	5: Outcomes match course learning objectives with identical measurements for assessment and are reinforced through didactic, lab and clinical participation			
C.N.A	6: The program requires students to take the written state exam culminating 120 lab and lecture hours and 100 clinical hours. The student then receives certification			
C.N.A	**Course Objectives**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
---	---	---	---	---	---
C.N.A	Appropriate to course level		1		
C.N.A	Clearly stated from student perspective		2		
C.N.A	Measurable			3	
C.N.A	Address/support one or more outcome		4		
C.N.A	**Comments or recommendations:**				
C.N.A	1: Course objectives are appropriate for course level.				
C.N.A	2: Objectives are concrete, easily understood and consistent among documents.				
C.N.A	3: Six total course objectives are not stated in a measureable format. Unit objectives are concise. Expectations could be more specific in regard to measures. The provided documentation lists the topics to be covered, not measureable objectives.				
C.N.A	4: Objectives support course outcomes				
C.N.A	**Module or Unit Objectives**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
C.N.A	Clearly linked to course objectives	1			
C.N.A	Address one or more course objective	2			
C.N.A	Clearly stated from student perspective	3			
C.N.A	Measurable			4	
C.N.A	**Comments or recommendations:**				
C.N.A	1: Module-Unit objectives are clearly linked to course objectives				
C.N.A	2: Alignment is present in regard to the general description of the course				
C.N.A	3: The documentation provided lists the topics to be covered, and are stated from a student perspective				
C.N.A	4. Module-Unit objective are not stated with a clearly defined manner of measurement.				
C.N.A	**Instructional Materials and Lab Resources**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
C.N.A	Support stated course and module or unit learning objectives	1			
C.N.A	Meet/reflect current industry practices and standards		2		
C.N.A	Provide options for multiple learning styles	3			
C.N.A	Resources/materials are cited properly	4			
C.N.A	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success	5			

C.N.A	Comments and recommendations:				
C.N.A	1: Support for stated course learning objectives and outcomes is evident through a comprehensive list: Required text, Other Instructional Materials, Equipment and Supplies				
C.N.A	2: Current industry practices and standards could more adequately be addressed through a state approved, more current text				
C.N.A	3: No evidence by key-Add Auditory/Visual/Kinesthetic and match to objective. Class participation is evident. Relevancy toward objectives could be added: ie: Food Service/Obj. 1-5. This suggestion may enhance student understanding and foster connections from activities and lessons to relevant course objectives for more in-depth student learning and comprehension to support innovation, as well as add evidence of adult learner success.				
C.N.A	4: Resources and materials are cited properly and are very well detailed				
C.N.A	5: Small suggestion: Add rationale for instructional materials and indicate whether materials are required or optional.				
C.N.A	**Learning Activities**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
C.N.A	Promote achievement of stated module or unit objectives			1	
C.N.A	Materials/resources (to include equipment, tools and software) are presented in a way that students understand purpose and use in healthcare and other industry settings	2			
C.N.A	Provide opportunities for interaction and active learning		3		
C.N.A	Provide options for multiple learning styles			4	
C.N.A	Linked to current industry practices and standards		5		
C.N.A	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success		6		
C.N.A	**Comments and recommendations:**				
C.N.A	1: Module or unit objective indicators could be documented on learning activities. While there are 3 learning activities that are paper and pencil informal summative assessments, this is perhaps due to the majority of learning activities assessed through labs and clinical observations. A possible suggestion may be to provide more in-depth, situational assessments, such as scenario-based analysis level activities geared toward future job related experiences				
C.N.A	2: Documentation for materials/resources is listed under Materials section. Nomenclature not specifically listed in Learning Activities documents				
C.N.A	3: Active learning and interaction occur during lab work and clinical participation				
C.N.A	4: Multiple learning styles are not clearly listed				
C.N.A	5: Learning activities are linked to current industry practices and standards				
C.N.A	6: Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success: See number 1, above				
C.N.A	**Assessment Tools/Criteria for Evaluation**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
C.N.A	Measure stated learning objectives and link to industry standards			1	
C.N.A	Align with course activities and resources		2		
C.N.A	Include specific and descriptive criteria for evaluation of student work/participation			3	

		Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
C.N.A	Sequenced throughout instructional period to enable students to build on feedback	4			
C.N.A	Varied and appropriate to content	5			
C.N.A	Provide opportunities for students to measure their own learning progress			6	
C.N.A	**Comments and recommendations:**				
C.N.A	1: Competency Score Sheet demonstrates alignment with 2001 manual				
C.N.A	2: Assessment questions are 'open-ended' response and require higher-level thinking.				
C.N.A	3: Student participation is not specific or descriptive for evaluation purposes as evidenced in this documentation				
C.N.A	4: Assessments follow a scaffold of learning activities which enable students to build upon feedback.				
C.N.A	5: Situational/multiple choice/open-ended responses are utilized				
C.N.A	6: Self-assessment and rubrics are not evident in the documentation provided				
C.N.A	**Innovative or enhanced strategies**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
C.N.A	Evidence industry input/standards in program design and curricular components	1			
C.N.A	Evidence of program enhancements to support adult learner		2		
C.N.A	If program has run long enough, is there evidence that enhancements to it have improved pass rates?			Data unavailable in documentation	
C.N.A	Comments or recommendations:				
C.N.A	1. Yes, evidence of industry input/standards in program design and curricular components				
C.N.A	2. Evidence of program enhancements to support the adult learner are seen in the Objectives, Activities and Assessment Table. The courses enable the adult learners with diverse scheduling demands to utilize components of online course work, such as Blackboard, to enhance availability to the overall course design and goal to start launch the students in their attainment of industry certifications.				
C.N.A	3. Evidence or data for this indicator was not available or found within the posted documentation				

An example of a very good program and the review documentation.

CenSer	Program/Student Learning Outcomes and Program Map	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
CenSer	Program CIP code/s appropriate to program title and outcomes. Central Services Sterile Processing Certificate	X			
CenSer	Effective program structure (prerequisites, course sequence, delivery methods, classroom/laboratory blend, stackable credential-structure provide a clear, logical "map" to completion for adult students)	X			

		Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
CenSer	Outcomes aligned to occupational focus (industry skills and standards)		X		
CenSer	**Outcomes clearly stated**		X		
CenSer	Outcomes introduced/reinforced effectively		X		
CenSer	Evidence of capstone assessment (licensure, industry certification, capstone project or TSA)		X		
CenSer	**Comments or recommendations:**				
CenSer	This is a concise program of 16 credit hours of relevant course titles appropriate to the Sterile Processing in the Environmental Services of the Healthcare industry.				
CenSer	Of the 8 courses in this certificate, 4 (a total of six credit hours) are shared with the Industrial Maintenance Certificate. Because of that this certificate in an excellent pathway into the Industrial Maintenance Certificate. Completion of both certificates is excellent preparation for Healthcare Facility Maintenance.				
CenSer	Outcomes are clearly stated and aligned to the occupational focus of the Certificate.				
CenSer	**Course Objectives**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
CenSer	Appropriate to course level		X		
CenSer	Clearly stated from student perspective		X		
CenSer	Measurable		X		
CenSer	Address/support one or more outcome		X		
CenSer	**Comments or recommendations:**				
CenSer	Course objectives are clearly stated, measureable and support program outcomes.				
CenSer	**Module or Unit Objectives**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
CenSer	Clearly linked to course objectives		X		
CenSer	Address one or more course objective		X		
CenSer	Clearly stated from student perspective		X		
CenSer	Measurable		X		
CenSer	**Comments or recommendations:**				

CenSer	Unit and Module Objectives are clearly stated, understandable and align in support of the courses, which are aligned to support the program goals. This is a well-structured program.				
CenSer	**Instructional Materials and Lab Resources**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
CenSer	Support stated course and module or unit learning objectives		X		
CenSer	Meet/reflect current industry practices and standards		X		
CenSer	Provide options for multiple learning styles		X		
CenSer	Resources/materials are cited properly		X		
CenSer	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success		X		
CenSer	**Comments and recommendations:**				
CenSer	The Instructional Materials and Lab resources submitted are good effective examples.				
CenSer	Current industry practices and regulatory standards are addressed.				
CenSer	Hands on activities are the best support of adult learning styles and the most effective method of teaching technologies.				
CenSer	**Learning Activities**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
CenSer	Promote achievement of stated module or unit objectives		X		
CenSer	Materials/resources (to include equipment, tools and software) are presented in a way that students understand purpose and use in healthcare and other industry settings		X		
CenSer	**Provide opportunities for interaction and active learning**		**X**		
CenSer	Provide options for multiple learning styles		X		
CenSer	Linked to current industry practices and standards		X		
CenSer	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success		X		
CenSer	**Comments and recommendations:**				
CenSer	Learning Activities are well documented and appropriate. In one course, "Central Service and Sterilization Certification Prep" there are 8 course objectives listed. Each of these objectives begins with the word "Demonstrate", which is very appropriate for adult learners.				
CenSer	**Assessment Tools/Criteria for Evaluation**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**

CenSer	Measure stated learning objectives and link to industry standards		X		
CenSer	Align with course activities and resources		X		
CenSer	Include specific and descriptive criteria for evaluation of student work/participation		X		
CenSer	**Sequenced throughout instructional period to enable students to build on feedback**		X		
CenSer	Varied and appropriate to content		X		
CenSer	Provide opportunities for students to measure their own learning progress		X		
CenSer	**Comments and recommendations:**				
CenSer	Lab Objectives for Sterile Processing (SP) are well documented and linked to several pages of "Skill Assessment" tables, which the instructor must sign their signature as complete and accurate. The students can also use this to gauge their own progress.				
CenSer	**Innovative or enhanced strategies**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
CenSer	Evidence industry input/standards in program design and curricular components		X		
CenSer	Evidence of program enhancements to support adult learner		X		
CenSer	If program has run long enough, is there evidence that enhancements to it have improved pass rates?		X		
CenSer	**Comments or recommendations:**				
CenSer	Although this is only a 16 credit hours program it is very directed and concise in preparing the students for employment. Great Program! In addition to Sterile Processing, the certificate also includes course work in workplace communications, employment strategies, digital literacy and college success. This is a very good program that should provide the completers with excellent opportunities for employment or continued education.				

This review of this program identified many ineffective areas. It is unclear how much communication took place between the reviewer and the Program Owner. If you encounter a poorly documented or ineffective areas, please communicate with the institution to see if there is something missing or improvements that are not stated. You are obligated to honestly document your review *and* give the program a chance to correct problems. Posting of new documentation to Skills Commons to address any issues is required of the institution before you dismiss an issue.

CSA	Program/Student Learning Outcomes and Program Map	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
CSA	Program CIP code/s appropriate to program title and outcomes Program: Computer Systems Administration				1
CSA	Effective program structure (prerequisites, course sequence, delivery methods, classroom/laboratory blend, stackable credential-structure provide a clear, logical "map" to completion for adult students)				2
CSA	Outcomes aligned to occupational focus (industry skills and standards)			3	
CSA	Outcomes clearly stated				4
CSA	Outcomes introduced/reinforced effectively				5
CSA	Evidence of capstone assessment (licensure, industry certification, capstone project or TSA)			6	
CSA	**Comments or recommendations:**				
CSA	1. A CIP code was not provided because the college has not assigned one as this is a non-credit course.				
CSA	2. This is a single course, CompTIA's prerequisite for the certification exam is A+ certification, and no equivalent requirement exists in the course.				
CSA	3. The course supposes to prepare the students for the HealthIT and HIT Pro exams.				
CSA	4. Outcomes are confusing or stated in vague manner.				
CSA	5. Introduction or reinforcement outcomes cannot be verified.				
CSA	6. Option to take HealthIT and HIT Pro certification exams at the end of the course work.				
CSA	**Course Objectives**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
CSA	Appropriate to course level			1	
CSA	Clearly stated from student perspective			2	
CSA	Measurable			3	
CSA	Address/support one or more outcome			4	
CSA	**Comments or recommendations:**				
CSA	1. Some of the course objectives do not reflect appropriate course level.				
CSA	2. Some of the objectives are clearly stated and some of them are vague.				
CSA	3. Measurement of objectives will be difficult, if not impossible.				
CSA	4. Difficult to see how objectives support course outcomes				
CSA	The course is designed with HealthIT and HIT Pro certifications in mind. The objectives should reflect the certification objectives. CompTIA publishes the certification objectives on their website; the major objective should form the course objectives and the module objectives can come from the detailed list.				
CSA	**Module or Unit Objectives**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
CSA	Clearly linked to course objectives				1

CSA	Address one or more course objective				2
CSA	Clearly stated from student perspective				3
CSA	Measurable				4
CSA	**Comments or recommendations:**				
CSA	Module objectives are not documented in a consistent manner. Documentation lists topics that will be covered in the course and objectives are different in different documents.				
CSA	1. Module objectives are reworded course objectives and there is no detailed information provided as to what is covered by the statements.				
CSA	2. Listing of unit objectives have no relationship to course objectives				
CSA	3. No, it is not stated clearly.				
CSA	4. List of topics does not indicate how the objective would be measured.				

		Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
CSA	**Instructional Materials and Lab Resources**				
CSA	Support stated course and module or unit learning objectives			1	
CSA	Meet/reflect current industry practices and standards		2		
CSA	Provide options for multiple learning styles			3	
CSA	Resources/materials are cited properly		4		
CSA	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success				5
CSA	**Comments and recommendations:**				
CSA	The book used for the course is written to prepare for the HealtIT and HIT Pro exams. Website listed as an instructional resource "hitpro.com" is only an advertisement for an Australian Internet Specialist Service Provider.				
CSA	1. The text book supports the preparation for the certifications exams.				
CSA	2. The book provides current and relevant industry information, the website is useless.				
CSA	3. No, it is only a text book and does not provide any additional way for learning.				
CSA	4. The book is sited correctly only the ISBN number missing.				
CSA	The provided documentation to MOHealtWin does not reflect any innovation.				

		Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
CSA	**Learning Activities**				
CSA	Promote achievement of stated module or unit objectives				1
CSA	Materials/resources (to include equipment, tools and software) are presented in a way that students understand purpose and use in healthcare and other industry settings				2
CSA	Provide opportunities for interaction and active learning				3
CSA	Provide options for multiple learning styles				4
CSA	Linked to current industry practices and standards				5
CSA	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success				6
CSA	**Comments and recommendations:**				

CSA		Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
CSA	The documentation does not provide enough information to make any informed opinion.				
CSA	1. N/A				
CSA	2. N/A				
CSA	3. N/A				
CSA	4. N/A				
CSA	5. N/A				
CSA	6. N/A				
CSA	**Assessment Tools/Criteria for Evaluation**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
CSA	Measure stated learning objectives and link to industry standards				1
CSA	Align with course activities and resources				2
CSA	Include specific and descriptive criteria for evaluation of student work/participation				3
CSA	Sequenced throughout instructional period to enable students to build on feedback				4
CSA	Varied and appropriate to content				5
CSA	Provide opportunities for students to measure their own learning progress				6
CSA	**Comments and recommendations:**				
CSA	The documentation does not provide enough information to make any informed opinion. The reference to a single multiple choice exam in a course and on-line practice tests through a website that does not exist cannot be used as basis of evaluation.				
CSA	1. N/A				
CSA	2. N/A				
CSA	3. N/A				
CSA	4. N/A				
CSA	5. N/A				
CSA	6. N/A				
CSA	**Innovative or enhanced strategies**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
CSA	Evidence industry input/standards in program design and curricular components				1
CSA	Evidence of program enhancements to support adult learner				2
CSA	If program has run long enough, is there evidence that enhancements to it have improved pass rates?				3
CSA	**Comments or recommendations:**				
CSA	The documentation does not provide enough information to make any informed opinion.				
CSA	1. The only evidence I can find is the use of the book for exam preparation.				
CSA	2. N/A				
CSA	3. N/A				

In this review, the SME looked for positive aspects of the certificate and tried to keep all comments and findings as positive as possible.

MAIN	Program/Student Learning Outcomes and Program Map	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
MAIN	Program CIP code/s appropriate to program title and outcomes Program: Intro to Maintenance		X		
MAIN	Effective program structure (prerequisites, course sequence, delivery methods, classroom/laboratory blend, stackable credential-structure provide a clear, logical "map" to completion for adult students)			X	
MAIN	Outcomes aligned to occupational focus (industry skills and standards)			X	
MAIN	Outcomes clearly stated		X		
MAIN	Outcomes introduced/reinforced effectively		X		
MAIN	Evidence of capstone assessment (licensure, industry certification, capstone project or TSA)		X		
MAIN	Comments or recommendations:				
MAIN	The concept of an entry level, basic skills program is a great idea. Although it is non-credit, the basic skills taught in this program should allow completers the opportunity for an entry level position or increased training opportunities. It could serve a very useful purpose of ascertaining the basic skills, attendance and commitment of students, prior to entering a more challenging program of study or basic employment. The program could also serve as an exploratory career experience since the curriculum exposes the student to basic carpentry, basic electrical and job shadowing.				
MAIN	The syllabus states 32-150 minute sessions, which would equal 2 sessions per week for 16 weeks, but the 15th week is devoted to 16 hours of job shadowing which exceeds the 300 minutes of lecture/lab on the schedule and changes the overall requirements for the students.				
MAIN	The outcomes as not related to an occupational focus but are clearly defined as leading to more intensive training and skill programs.				
MAIN	A capstone course or project would not be appropriate at this level.				
MAIN	Course Objectives	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
MAIN	Appropriate to course level		X		
MAIN	Clearly stated from student perspective				X
MAIN	Measurable		X		
MAIN	Address/support one or more outcome			X	
MAIN	Comments or recommendations:				
MAIN	The syllabus course description indicates CPR, OSHA and IMT certification. There is no other indication of what IMT certification is, when or how it is earned. Course Objectives are relevant to the program objectives.				
MAIN	The outcome stated is an entry level program leading to other grant-funded programs of study, but does not address employment.				

MAIN	These objectives should be measureable.				
MAIN	**Module or Unit Objectives**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
MAIN	Clearly linked to course objectives		X		
MAIN	Address one or more course objective		X		
MAIN	Clearly stated from student perspective		X		
MAIN	Measurable		X		
MAIN	**Comments or recommendations:**				
MAIN	With the exceptions noted the lesson objectives are stated and support the overall program.				
MAIN	They are understandable and should be measureable.				
MAIN	**Instructional Materials and Lab Resources**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
MAIN	Support stated course and module or unit learning objectives		X		
MAIN	Meet/reflect current industry practices and standards		X		
MAIN	Provide options for multiple learning styles			X	
MAIN	Resources/materials are cited properly			X	
MAIN	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success			X	
MAIN	**Comments and recommendations:**				
MAIN	The stated lab topics are relevant and clear but there is no documentation of specific tasks, equipment, tools, outcomes and assessment.				
MAIN	Utilization of textbook resources, software renditions or professionally draw diagrams would be a good improvement over hand-drawn diagram samples provided and instill greater confidence in the program for adult learners.				
MAIN	**Learning Activities**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
MAIN	Promote achievement of stated module or unit objectives		X		
MAIN	Materials/resources (to include equipment, tools and software) are presented in a way that students understand purpose and use in healthcare and other industry settings			X	
MAIN	Provide opportunities for interaction and active learning		X		
MAIN	Provide options for multiple learning styles		X		
MAIN	Linked to current industry practices and standards				X
MAIN	Evidence of innovation to support adult learner success		X		
MAIN	**Comments and recommendations:**				
MAIN	The outcomes are stated to prepare a person for greater education. There is minimal coverage of the understanding of employment in a healthcare facility.				

MAIN	The inclusion of the EPA Certification seems to be completely inappropriate. The 608 certification, under the Clean Air Act, certifies an individual as authorized to purchase/handle ozone-depleting chemicals and their replacements. It does not require technical skills to handle refrigerants, those are assumed. It was designed to certify qualified technicians about the consequences of the law (section 608 of the Clean Air Act). There is no logical reason to include this in an elementary program lacking the technical skills to properly manage refrigerants, operate recovery equipment, and understand the charging or troubleshooting of HVAC system. Typically there is a 2-year AAS Program leading to the EPA certification or years of industry apprenticeships /experience in a specific field such as residential, automotive or commercial HVAC.
MAIN	The 10 hour OSHA voluntary compliance course in Construction or General Industry is often misrepresented, as it is in this program as a "certification". It is a record of completion, not a certification. The instructors are not "certified" but rather "authorized" to issue the "completion cards", not certifications. This is a common misrepresentation by industry and education. Since this is a DOL Grant and OSHA is part of DOL, we should correct this statewide. Using the term certified in advertising these classes is strictly prohibited by OSHA. Per the OSHA website:
MAIN	"**Certified.** The OSHA Outreach Training Program is not a certification program and must not be advertised as such. Outreach trainers, students, and curriculum are not certified. The Outreach trainer is authorized and students receive student course completion cards. Advertisements must not use any form of the word "certify" including the word "certification", or imply that the Outreach Training Program class will result in the individual being certified."

MAIN	**Assessment Tools/Criteria for Evaluation**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
MAIN	Measure stated learning objectives and link to industry standards			X	
MAIN	Align with course activities and resources			X	
MAIN	Include specific and descriptive criteria for evaluation of student work/participation				X
MAIN	Sequenced throughout instructional period to enable students to build on feedback		X		
MAIN	Varied and appropriate to content		X		
MAIN	Provide opportunities for students to measure their own learning progress		X		
MAIN	**Assessment Tools/Criteria for Evaluation**	Exceptional	Very Good	Good	Ineffective
MAIN	Measure stated learning objectives and link to industry standards			X	
MAIN	Align with course activities and resources			X	
MAIN	Include specific and descriptive criteria for evaluation of student work/participation				X
MAIN	Sequenced throughout instructional period to enable students to build on feedback		X		
MAIN	Varied and appropriate to content		X		
MAIN	Provide opportunities for students to measure their own learning progress		X		
MAIN	**Comments and recommendations:**				

MAIN	Course/competency sequencing should facilitate sequenced assessment.				
MAIN	Hands-on lab experiences as indicated would be appropriate for this program and provide students an opportunity for self-assessment.				
MAIN	No specific or descriptive criterion for evaluation of student work is provided.				
MAIN	**Innovative or enhanced strategies**	**Exceptional**	**Very Good**	**Good**	**Ineffective**
MAIN	Evidence industry input/standards in program design and curricular components			X	
MAIN	Evidence of program enhancements to support adult learner		X		
MAIN	If program has run long enough, is there evidence that enhancements to it have improved pass rates?		X		
MAIN	**Comments or recommendations:**				
MAIN	Assuming the institution would manage and improve this program as it does for credit programs, there is good reason to believe it is enhanced for adult learners, meets the requirements of industry and the requirements of industry were considered in the curricular design. However, no evidence of industry involvement was provided or could be implied by the documents reviewed.				